

**MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI,
BENCH AT AURANGABAD**

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 607 OF 2024

**DISTRICT : NANDED, BEED, CHH.
SAMBHAJINAGAR, AHMADNAGAR,
AKOLA, BULDHANA, MUMBAI,
AMRAVATI**

1. Gajanan s/o Prabhu Ambore,
Age: 33 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: Nandigram Society,
Gurunank Nagar, Dist. Nanded.
2. Sampada d/o Anantrao Shahpurwad,
Age: 25 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: At Janapuri, Post: Wadehari,
Tal: Loha, Dist. Nanded.
3. Poonam d/o Shahurao Kasbe,
Age: 27 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: At Post: Lahuri,
Tal: Kaij, Dist. Beed.
4. Supriya d/o Lalu Sonkamble,
Age: 27 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: Parishram Niwas,
Siddarthnagar, Tal: Degloor,
Dist. Nanded.
5. Amar s/o Dattatraya Kumawat,
Age: 24 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: At post: Kharaj Chikalgaon,
Tal: Vaijapur, Dist. Chh. Sambhajinagar,
6. Mayurkumar s/o Popat Jadhav,
Age: 31 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o : "Shivjunj", Plot no.7, Adarshnagar,
Nagar-Kalyan Road, Dist. Ahmadnagar.
7. Govardhan s/o Uddhav Hinge,
Age: 26 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: At post: Munguswadi,
Tal: Pathardi, Dist. Ahmadnagar.

8. Pallavi d/o Dnyandev Kadam,
Age :31 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: At: Ambi Khalsa
Post: Ghargaon, Tal: Sangamner,
Dist. Ahmadnagar.
9. Shakuntala d/o Babasaheb Kale,
Age: 30 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: At post: Mauli Chowk,
Yellamb Ghat, Tal: Beed
Dist. Beed.
10. Deepak s/o Shankar Kale,
Age: 26 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: At post: Chinchkhed,
Tal: Ambad, Dist. Jalna.
11. Sachin s/o Sanjay Ghawate,
Age: 26 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: At post: JunaVambari Road,
Dattanagar, Sonai,
Tal: Newasa, Dist. Ahmadnagar.
12. Roshanee d/o Arun Dhepe,
Age: 28 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: At post: Dhepe Niwas,
House No. 52, At post: Akot
Tal: Akot, Dist. Akola.
13. Mamta d/o Bhaskar Shinde,
Age : 27 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: Room No.283/3,
Jijamata Nagar, Nav Jivan Seva Mandal,
Parel Tank Road, Kala Chowki, Near Abhyasika,
Dist. Mumbai
14. Sandhya d/o Sudam Taktode,
Age : 29 years, Occu.: Nil,
Tal: Khamgaon, Dist. Buldhana
15. Devendra s/o Shivaji Bhagat,
Age: 25 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: At post: Mahalung,
Tal: Malshiras, Dist. Solapur

16. Amita d/o Arun Jawanjal,
Age:26 years, Occu.: Nil,
R/o: Near Jawanjal Daily Needs Shop,
Bhimtekadi Road, Dist. Amravati.

...

APPLICANTS**V E R S U S**

The Maharashtra Public Service Commission,
Through its Secretary,
5th, 7th, 8th Floor, Cooperage Telephone Nigam,
Maharishi Karve Marg,
Cooperage, Mumbai - 400021.

...

RESPONDENT

APPEARANCE : Ms. Preeti Wankhade, Counsel for the
Applicants.

: Shri M.B. Bharaswadkar, Chief Presenting
Officer for respondent authorities.

CORAM : **Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman**
and
Hon'ble Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : **26.06.2024**

O R D E R

(PER : Hon'ble Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A))

1. Heard Ms. Preeti Wankhade, learned counsel for the
applicants and Shri M.B. Bharaswadkar, learned Chief
Presenting Officer for respondent authorities.

2. All the applicants in this Original Application applied
for the post of Police Sub-Inspector in Maharashtra Secondary

Services, Non-Gazetted, Group-B post. All the applicants qualified in the written test and they were called for Physical Standard Test. All the applicants were disqualified in height measurement and therefore, they preferred appeal against the said disqualification. They filed appeal for re-measurement of their heights. In appeal, the Committee consisting of Medical Superintendent, Dy. Director of Sports and Joint Commissioner of Police have re-measured the height and fall the applicants were again dis-qualified in the height measurement. The result of this dis-qualification in appeal was communicated to all the applicants.

3. Learned counsel for the applicants submits that some of the applicants had participated in the same selection process conducted in the year 2020 & 2021 and they were qualified in height measurement, through the same procedure and technology of digital measurement. The applicants whose height was found requisite in the earlier selection process are also disqualified in height measurement in this year's selection process. The results of measurement and re-measurement in the present selection process of the year 2022 and earlier selection process is given in following chart:-

Sr. No .	Ap p. No.	Previous Recru. Process/Hospital	Height in Earlier Recru. Process	Date and present Measurement	Date and measurement in Appeal
1.	A-1	Mah. Sec. Services-2020	165.3 cm	24/05/24 164.8 cm	01/06/24 164.7 cm
2.	A-2	Mah. Sec. Services-2020	157.4 cm	04/06/24 156.1 cm	06/06/24 156 cm
3	A-3	Mah. Sec. Services-2020	157.8 cm	04/06/24 156.7 cm	06/06/24 156.8 cm
4	A-4	Mah. Sec. Services-2021	157.8cm	04/06/24 156.7 cm	06/06/24 156.8 cm
5	A-5	P.C. Rec. Mumbai, 2021	165 cm	31/05/24 164.6 cm	01/06/24 163.5 cm
6	A-6	--	--	31/05/24 164.8 cm	01/06/24 164.8 cm
7	A-7	--	--	31/05/24 164.7 cm	01/06/24 164.8 cm
8	A-8	J.J. Hospital	160 cms		06/06/24 156.3 cm
9	A-9	--	--	04/06/24 156.4 cm	06/06/24 156.3 cm
10	A-10	--	--	28/05/24 164.6 cm	01/06/24 164.6 cm
11	A-11	--	--	29/05/24 164.9 cm	01/06/24 164.9 cm
12	A-12	Mah. Sec. Services-2020	157.7 cm		06/06/24 156.7 cm
13	A-13	LTM Hospital	157 cms		06/06/24 156.1 cm
14	A-14	Mah. Sec. Services-2020	157.2 cm	03/06/24 156.2 cm	06/06/24 156.3 cm
15	A-15	--	--	1/6/24 164.4 cm	1/6/24 164.2 cm
16	A-16	--	--	3/6/24 156.8 cm	6/6/24 156.3 cm

Therefore, the applicants have prayed for re-measurement of their heights.

4. From the submissions made by the applicants, it has come to our attention that there may have been discrepancies or procedural issues during the initial measurements and re-measurements that could have affected the outcome.

5. Re-measuring the height of these candidates is crucial to ensure fairness and transparency in the selection process. It is our responsibility to provide every candidate with a fair opportunity to demonstrate their suitability for the position, and accurate height measurement is an essential criterion in this regard.

6. Therefore, we deem it appropriate to give one more chance to all the applicants for re-measurement of their height. This will uphold the integrity of the recruitment process and provide a fair chance to all eligible candidates. Hence the following order:-

ORDER

- (i) MPSC shall constitute a Committee for re-measurement of height of all the applicants and call all the applicants for re-measurement of height. Committee shall consist of One

Medical Officer, Dy Director Sports and Joint Commissioner of Police/IG of Police. Properly calibrated and certified instrument shall be used for re-measurement.

- (ii) This shall be done within one week from the date of this order.
- (iii) The applicants who qualify in the height re-measurement shall be allowed to participate in the further selection process.
- (iv) The Original Application is allowed in the aforesaid terms, however, without any order as to costs.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHARIMAN

PLACE : Aurangabad.

DATE : 26.06.2024

KPB S.B. O.A. No. 604 of 2024 PRB Selection Process