O.A. 78/2021 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri S.A. Walde, Id. Counsel holding for Shri S.R. Dambhare, Id. Counsel for the applicants and Shri A.M. Khadatkar, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

At the request of ld. Counsel for the applicants, **S.O. two weeks.**

(Justice M.G. Giratkar)
Vice-Chairman

(Shree Bhagwan) Vice- Chairman

O.A. 1007/2018 with C.A. 36/2021 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice-Chairman and Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar, Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri S.C.Deshmukh, the Id. counsel for the applicant, Shri S.A.Sainis, the Id. P.O. for respondent nos. 1 to 3, Shri P.S. Wathore, learned counsel for respondent nos. 5, 6, 8 to 12, 14 to 17 and Shri G.K. Bhusari, the Id. counsel for the respondent nos. 19 to 21, 23, 24, 25, 28, 29, 31, 32, 35, 36, 41, 51, 52, 54, 55, 57, 58, 66 to 69, 71 to 73, 75 to 84, 86 to 88, 90, 91, 94, 96 to 100, 104,108to110, 113, 115 to 118, 123, 125, 128, 129, 132, 133, 135 to 137, 139, 140, 143 to 145, 147 to 152, 154, 155. None for private respondents.

2. At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O. two** weeks.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar)
Vice-Chairman

(Shree Bhagwan)
Vice- Chairman

O.As. 521,522,523 & 524 of 2014 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri R.S. Khobragade, Id. counsel for the applicants and Shri A.M. Khadatkar, Id. P.O. for R-1 to 5 (in O.As.521 to 523 of 2014) and for R-1 to 4 (in O.A.524 of 2014). None for other respondents.

At the request of learned P.O., **S.O. two** weeks for filing reply on amended portion as a last chance.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar)
<u>Vice-Chairman</u>

(Shree Bhagwan) Vice- Chairman

O.A. 767/2019 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

None for the applicant. Shri A.M. Khadatkar, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan) <u>Vice-Chairman</u> <u>Vice- Chairman</u>

O.A. 969/2020 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri P.S. Gawai, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri H.K. Pande, Id. P.O. for R-1. Await service of R-2 to 4.

- 2. At the request of ld. counsel for the applicant, issue fresh notice to the respondent nos.2 to 4 returnable <u>after four weeks</u>. Hamdast allowed.
- 3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.
- 4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of O.A. Respondent is put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.
- 5. This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules,1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

- 6. The service may be done by Hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within one week. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.
- 7. In case notice is not collected within three days and if service report on affidavit is not filed three days before returnable date. Original Application shall stand dismissed without reference to Tribunal and papers be consigned to record.

S.O. after four weeks.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar)
<u>Vice-Chairman</u>

(Shree Bhagwan)
Vice- Chairman

C.P.79/2022 in O.A. 640/2020 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri R.M. Fating, Id. Counsel for the applicants and Shri H.K. Pande, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

- 2. The learned counsel for the applicant has filed copy of letter dated 8/9/2015. It is taken on record and marked Exh-X for identification.
- 3. The learned P.O. submits that he will file reply during the course of day.

S.O. two weeks.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar)
<u>Vice-Chairman</u>

(Shree Bhagwan)
Vice- Chairman

O.A. 35/2021 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

None for the applicant. Shri H.K. Pande, ld. P.O. for R-1 to 3. None for R-4.

At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O. four** weeks for filing reply.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan) <u>Vice-Chairman</u> <u>Vice- Chairman</u>

O.A. 548/2022 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri Motlag, Id. counsel holding for Shri R.V. Shiralkar, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri A.M. Khadatkar, Id. P.O. for respondents.

At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan)
Vice-Chairman
Vice- Chairman

O.A. 696/2022 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

None for the applicant. Shri H.K. Pande, ld. P.O. for respondents.

At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan)
Vice-Chairman
Vice- Chairman

O.A. 724/2022 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

None for the applicant. Shri A.M. Khadatkar, Id. P.O. for respondents.

At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan) <u>Vice-Chairman</u> <u>Vice- Chairman</u>

O.A. 1255/2022 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

S. Saware, Id. counsel for Godhawe, Shri B. Kulkarni, Id. counsel for applicant nos.1 to 3,6,10,12,14 & 15 and Shri H.K. Pande, Id. P.O. for respondents.

At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O. four** weeks for filing reply.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar)
Vice-Chairman

(Shree Bhagwan) Vice- Chairman

O.A. 01/2023 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Ku. Pathak, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri H.K. Pande, Id. P.O. for R-1&2. None for R-3.

At the request of ld. P.O., **S.O. one week** for filing reply.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan) Vice-Chairman Vice- Chairman

C.A. 28/2023 in O.A. 16/2023 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri N.R. Saboo, Id. counsel for the applicants and Shri H.K. Pande, Id. P.O. for respondents.

At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O. two** weeks for filing reply as a last chance.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan)
Vice-Chairman Vice- Chairman

O.A. 117/2023 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

K.N. Jain, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri H.K. Pande, Id. P.O. for respondents.

At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O. 17/04/2023** for filing reply.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan)
Vice-Chairman
Vice- Chairman

O.A. 138/2023 with C.A. 125/2023 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

C.A.No. 126/2023 -

Heard Shri S.P. Palshikar, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A. Deo, Id. CPO for the State.

- 2. Notice on civil application be issued returnable in **three weeks**.
- The learned C.P.O. waives notice for State. Hamdast granted.
- 4. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.
- 5. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the O.A.
- 6. This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules,1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

7. The service may be done by Hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with an affidavit of compliance in the Registry as far as possible once week before the date fixed by this Tribunal. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.

S.O. three weeks.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) Vice-Chairman (Shree Bhagwan)
Vice- Chairman

O.A. 109/2018 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri S.A. Sahu, Id. counsel for the applicants and Shri S.A. Deo, Id. C.P.O. for the respondents.

At the request of Id. C.P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan) Vice-Chairman Vice- Chairman

O.A. 1025/2019 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri S.M. Khan, Id. counsel for the applicants and Shri S.A. Deo, Id. C.P.O. for the respondents.

At the request of Id. C.P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan) <u>Vice-Chairman</u> <u>Vice- Chairman</u>

O.A. 201/2021 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

None for applicant. Shri A.M. Ghogre, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan)
Vice-Chairman
Vice- Chairman

O.A. 632/2022 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri Bharat Kulkarni, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri A.M. Ghogre, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. The matter pertains to time bound promotion. Therefore, matter be kept before Single Bench.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Vice-Chairman

(Shree Bhagwan) Vice- Chairman

O.A. 1103/2022 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri G.K. Bhusari, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri A.M. Ghogre, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

At the request of ld. P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply as a last chance.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan) Vice-Chairman Vice- Chairman

O.A. 1232/2022 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri Amey Motlag, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A. Deo, Id. CPO for the respondents.

- 2. The learned CPO has raised preliminary objection on the ground that the applicant is already retired in the year 2019. He is challenging the promotion of respondent no.5. The applicant has no locus standi to challenge the promotion of respondent no.5.
- 3. The applicant is directed to satisfy this Tribunal as to how the present O.A. is maintainable.

S.O. two weeks.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar)
Vice-Chairman

(Shree Bhagwan)
Vice- Chairman

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

C.A. 143/2023 in Rev.A.St.671/2023 in O.A.1012/2022 -

Heard Shri V. Talkute, Id. counsel for the applicants and Shri A.M. Ghogre, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

- 2. As per submission of learned counsel for the applicants, all the applicants were not party in the O.A.1012/2022. He has submitted that all the applicants are direct recruited candidates by the MPSC, whereas, the applicants in O.A.1012/2022 with connected matters were not directly recruited. Therefore, seniorities of the applicants were rightly fixed. The learned counsel for applicants has submitted that this fact was not pointed out to this Tribunal.
- 3. The Judgment dated 31/01/2023 was passed by this Tribunal after considering the rules about the seniority. Those rules also quoted in the Judgment in para-11. In para-11 of the said Judgment, the Govt. G.R. is also quoted.
- 4. The learned counsel for applicants has submitted that the applicants have moved the application for review.

- 5. Issue notice on Civil Application as well as Review App. St. returnable on **12/04/2023**.
- 6. Shri A.M. Ghogre the learned P.O. waives notice for the State. Hamdast granted.
- 7. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.
- 8. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the O.A.
- 9. This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules,1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.
- 10. The service may be done by Hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with an affidavit of compliance in the Registry as far as possible once week before the date fixed by this Tribunal. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.

S.O. 12/04/2023.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar)
<u>Vice-Chairman</u>

(Shree Bhagwan) Vice- Chairman

C.P. 40/2021 in O.A. 122/2021 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri Amey Motlag, learned counsel holding for Shri R.V. Shiralkar, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri A.M. Ghogre, learned P.O. for the respondents.

- 2. The order of this Tribunal was challenged before the Hon'ble Bombay High Court, Bench at Nagpur in Writ Petition No.3656/2021. The Hon'ble Bombay High Court has decided the Writ Petition No.3656/2021 on 12/01/2023. The Hon'ble Bombay High Court has quashed and set aside the order of this Tribunal in MCAs. The operative order is reproduced as below —
- "(a) (1) order dated 15th September, 2021 in M.C.A. No.19/2021 in OA No. 122/2011;
- (ii) order dated 20th May, 2021 in M.C.A. No. 07/2021;
- (iii) order dated 16th June, 2021 in M.C.A. No.09/2021;
- (iv)order dated 19th July, 2021 in M.C.A. No.09/2021 are quashed and set aside

- (V) Respondents are directed to release and pay all retiral benefits to the petitioner, forthwith.
- (b) Rule is made absolute in the aforesaid terms. No order as to costs."
- 3. Now the matter is already decided by the Hon'ble Bombay High Court, Bench at Nagpur, therefore, Contempt Petition is not tenable. Hence, the Contempt Petition is disposed of. No order as to costs.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan) <u>Vice-Chairman</u> <u>Vice- Chairman</u>

O.A. 318/2022 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri S.P. Palshikar, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri M.I. Khan, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

- 2. The learned counsel for the applicant has pointed out the Judgment of M.A.T., Nagpur Bench in O.A.638/2017 delivered on 30/01/2023. It is marked Exh-X for identification.
- 3. The learned P.O. submitted that the reply is already filed on record.
- 4. The matter is admitted and kept for final hearing. The Id. P.O. waives notice for respondents.

S.O. 12/04/2023.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar)
Vice-Chairman

(Shree Bhagwan) Vice- Chairman

O.A. 299/2023 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri Bharat Kulkarni, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A. Kulkarni, Id. P.O. for the State.

- 2. Issue notice to the respondents returnable <u>after four weeks</u>. Learned P.O. waives notice for State. Hamdast allowed.
- 3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.
- 4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of O.A. Respondent is put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.
- 5. This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules,1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.
- 6. The service may be done by Hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced

along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within one week. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.

7. In case notice is not collected within three days and if service report on affidavit is not filed three days before returnable date. Original Application shall stand dismissed without reference to Tribunal and papers be consigned to record.

S.O. after four weeks.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar)
Vice-Chairman

(Shree Bhagwan)
Vice- Chairman

O.A. 63/2015 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri Y.N. Tamiliani, Id. counsel holding for Shri G.I. Dipwani, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri M.I. Khan, learned P.O. for the respondents.

- 2. On the last date on 14/02/2023 Shr Telyni, Id. counsel holding for Shri Dipwani, Id. counsel for the applicant appeared and sought time. On the earlier date on 6/2/2023 none appeared for the applicant.
- 3. Today also Shri Y.N. Tamiliani, Id. counsel seeks time. The matter is of the year 2015.
- 4. Looking to the ground, the matter is fixed on 6/4/2023. It is made clear that on the next date no adjournment will be granted.

S.O. 6/4/2023.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar)
<u>Vice-Chairman</u>

(Shree Bhagwan) Vice- Chairman

O.A. 394/2015 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri P.S. Wathore, Id. Counsel for the applicants and Shri H.K. Pande, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

S.O. three weeks.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan)
Vice-Chairman
Vice- Chairman

O.A. 72/2017 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri S.P. Palshikar, Id. Counsel for the applicants and Shri M.I. Khan, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O.** 12/04/2023.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan) Vice-Chairman Vice- Chairman

O.A. 555/18 with CAs. 245/19,305/19 and 392/21 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri Jibhkate, Id. counsel for the applicant, Shri A.M. Khadatkar, Id. P.O. for R-1 to 3 and Shri Bade, Id. counsel holding for Shri Kapgate, Id. counsel for R-4&5.

At the request of Shri Bade, Id. counsel holding for Shri Kapgate, Id. counsel for R-4&5, S.O. 17/04/2023.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar)
<u>Vice-Chairman</u>

(Shree Bhagwan)
Vice- Chairman

O.A. 927/2021 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri A.P. Sadavarte, Id. Counsel holding for Shri D.M. Kakani, Id. Counsel for the applicant and Shri A.M. Khadatkar, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

At the request of ld. Counsel for the applicant, **S.O. after three weeks.**

(Justice M.G. Giratkar)
Vice-Chairman

(Shree Bhagwan) Vice- Chairman

O.A. 640/22 with C.A. 14/2023 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Shri Bade, Id. Counsel holding for Shri Kapagate, Id. Counsel for the applicant and Shri A.M. Khadatkar, Id. P.O. for the respondent /state. None for R-9.

At the request of Id. Counsel for the applicant, S.O. 18/04/2023.

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) Vice-Chairman (Shree Bhagwan)
Vice- Chairman

O.A. 800/2022 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

None for the applicant. Shri S.A. Sainis, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O. 18/04/2023.**

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) (Shree Bhagwan)
Vice-Chairman
Vice- Chairman

dnk.

O.A. 271/2020 with C.A. 374/2021 (D.B.)

Coram: Hon'ble Shri Shree Bhagwan,

Vice-Chairman and

Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,

Vice-Chairman.

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri N.R. Saboo, Id. counsel for the applicants, Shri A.M. Khadatkar, Id. P.O. for R-1 to 5 and none for other respondents.

- 2. The learned counsel for the applicants has pointed out the prayer clause in the O.A. As per the prayer clause, the applicants are challenging the Govt. G.R. dated 21/11/1995 and G.R. dated 29/10/2020.
- 3. The learned counsel for the applicants has pointed out the Judgment delivered by this Tribunal in O.A.No.388 to 398 of 2020 decided on 20/10/2020. The learned counsel for applicants has also pointed out the Judgment of M.A.T., Nagpur Bench in O.A.761/2020 with connected O.A., delivered on 7/4/2022 which is filed along with pursis dated 4/7/2022.
- 4. In both the O.As., it is held that the Circle Officers cannot be transferred on the post of Awwal Karkun and Awwal Karkun cannot be transferred on the post of Circle Officer.

- 5. The learned counsel for the applicants has submitted that both the G.Rs. are liable to be quashed and set aside.
- 6. Shri S.Y. Deopujari, learned counsel for R-6 to 9 (Intervener) is not present today.

Hence, S.O. 28/03/2023 (PH).

(Justice M.G. Giratkar) <u>Vice-Chairman</u> (Shree Bhagwan) Vice- Chairman

dnk.

...

C.Λ.No.93/2023inO.Λ.No.538/2021 (D.B.)

Coram: Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman& Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (])

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Smt.M.Chandurkar, ld. Counsel for the applicant and Shri A.M.Khadatkar, ld. P.O. for the respondents. None for the R-6 to 15.

- 2. At the request of ld. P.O., **S.O. 21.04.2023.**
- 3. Put up this matter along with O.A. No. 1134/2021.

Member(J)
Date:- 24/03/2023.
aps.

Vice Chairman

O.A.No.1134/2021 (D.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman& Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Smt.M.Chandurkar, ld. Counsel for the applicant and Shri A.M.Khadatkar, ld. P.O. for the respondents. None for the R-6 to 15.

- 2. At the request of ld. P.O., S.O. 21.04.2023.
- 3. Matter be treated as P.H..
- 4. Put up this matter along with O.A. No. 538/2021.

Member(J) Vice Chairman Date:- 24/03/2023.

aps.

R.A.06/23inC.A.178/20inO.A.St.800/20(S.B.)

${\color{red} \underline{Coram}: Shri \ Shree \ Bhagwan, Vice \ Chairman \ \underline{Dated}: 24/03/2023.}$

Heard Shri N.S.Warulkar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri A.P.Potnis, ld. P.O. for the Respondents.

2. At the request of ld. P.O., **S.O. 20.04.2023.**

Vice Chairman

Date:- 24/03/2023.

aps.

Rev.Appl.03/2021in0.A.No.184/2019(S.B.)

$\frac{Coram}{Shri \ Shree \ Bhagwan, Vice \ Chairman} \\ \underline{Dated}: 24/03/2023.$

 $\label{eq:heard-shri} \mbox{Heard Shri N.S.Warulkar, ld. counsel for the} \\ \mbox{applicant and Shri A.P.Potnis, ld. P.O. for the} \\ \mbox{Respondents.}$

2. At the request of ld. P.O., **S.O.** 20.04.2023.

Vice Chairman

Date:- 24/03/2023. aps.

O.A.No.172/2019 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri S.B.Tiwari, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. two weeks for filing reply.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.349/2019 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri R.M.Fating, holding for Shri S.P.Palshikar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Sainis, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

- 2. Reply of respondent no.3 filed by learned P.O. It is taken on record. Learned P.O. seeks time to file reply of respondents 1 and 2.
- 3. **S.O. three weeks.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.936/2020 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri P.V.Thakre, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Sainis, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. two weeks for filing reply.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.712/2021 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri P.V.Thakre, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri A.P.Potnis, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

- 2. Reply of respondent no.4 filed by learned P.O. as well as rejoinder filed by the applicant are taken on record.
- 3. By consent O.A. is admitted and kept for final hearing.
- 4. **S.O. 28.03.2023.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.42/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri S.A.Marathe, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. four weeks for filing reply.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.277/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri G.G.Bade, ld. counsel for the applicant, Shri S.A.Sainis, ld. P.O. for the respondents 1 to 4 and Shri A.P.Barahate, holding for Shri M.Rathi, ld. counsel for the respondent no.5.

- 2. Reply of respondents 2 to 4 filed by learned P.O. It is taken on record.
- 3. **S.O. three weeks.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.1141/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

None for the applicant. Heard Shri M.I.Khan, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply.

Member (J).

O.A.No.1154/2021 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri S.A.Marathe, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Sainis, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. 11.04.2023 for filing reply.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.2375/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

C.A.No.442/2022 & C.A.No.443/2022

Heard Shri A.P.Sadavarte, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Sainis, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply on C.A..

Member (J).

O.A.No.843/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri G.G.Bade, ld. counsel for the applicant, Shri S.A.Sainis, ld. P.O. for the respondents 1 & 2 and Shri B.Kulkarni, ld. counsel for the respondent no.3.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply.

Member (J).

O.A.No.957/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri B.Kulkarni, ld. counsel for the applicant, Shri H.K.Pande, ld. P.O. for the respondents 1 & 3 and Shri M.L.Vairagade, ld. counsel for the respondents 2 & 4.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply of respondents 1 & 3.

Member (J).

O.A.No.1027/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri R.M.Fating, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri A.P.Potnis, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. two weeks for filing reply.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.1047/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri R.M.Fating, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Sainis, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. 31.03.2023 for filing reply.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.1241/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri I.G.Meshram, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Sainis, ld. P.O. for the respondent no.1 and Shri A.W.Paunikar, ld. counsel for the respondents 2 and 3.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply.

Member (J).

O.A.No.66/2023 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri R.V.Shiralkar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Sainis, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. 28.03.2023 for filing reply.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.135/2023 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri N.R.Saboo, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents. Await service to respondents 2 & 3.

- 2. Learned counsel for the applicant seeks time of two weeks to serve the respondents.
- 3. **S.O. two weeks.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.136/2023 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Mrs. K.N..Saboo, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents. Await service to respondents 2 & 3.

- 2. Learned counsel for the applicant seeks time of two weeks to serve the respondents.
- 3. <u>S.O. two weeks.</u>

Member (J).

O.A.No.153/2023 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri R.V.Shiralkar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply.

Member (J).

O.A.No.204/2023 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri C.A.Babrekar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents. Await service to respondents 2 to 5.

- 2. Learned P.O. seeks time to take instructions.
- 3. **S.O. 28.03.2023.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.529/2021 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri S.N.Gaikwad, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. 10.04.2023.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.531/2021 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri S.N.Gaikwad, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. 10.04.2023.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.281/2023 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

None for the applicant. Heard Shri A.P.Potnis, ld. P.O. for the State.

- 2. Issue notice to the respondents, returnable **after four weeks**. Learned P.O. waives notice for State. Hamdast allowed.
- 3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.
- 4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of O.A. Respondent is put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.
- 5. This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules,1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.
- 6. The service may be done by Hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within one week. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.
- 7. In case notice is not collected within **three days** and if service report on affidavit is not filed

three days before returnable date. Original Application shall stand dismissed without reference to Tribunal and papers be consigned to record.

8. **S.O. after four weeks.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.1041/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri S.I.Ghatte, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri A.M.Khadatkar, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

On oral request of ld. P.O., S.O.
 27.03.2023.

Member (J).

O.A.No.623/2017 with O.A.No.627/2017 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri S.N.Gaikwad, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri A.P.Potnis, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. <u>S.O. 11.04.2023.</u>

Member (J).

O.A.No.279/2019 with O.A.No.280/2019 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri R.V.Shiralkar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri A.P.Potnis, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. <u>S.O. three weeks.</u>

Member (J).

O.A.No.1064/2019 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri N.R.Saboo, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. 11.04.2023**

Member (J).

O.A.No.957/2020 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

None for the applicant. Heard Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. four weeks.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.958/2020 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

None for the applicant. Heard Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. four weeks.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.39/2021 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri G.N.Khanzode, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri M.I.Khan, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. three weeks.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.183/2021 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri N.R.Saboo, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. two weeks.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.390/2021 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri M.R.Pillai, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri A.P.Potnis, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. three weeks.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.446/2021 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri S.P.Palshikar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. 28.03.2023.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.1155/2021 with C.A.No.398/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri C.A.Babrekar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. On oral request of ld. P.O., **S.O. three** weeks for filing reply.

Member (J).

O.A.No.1161/2021 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri S.P.Palshikar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri A.P.Potnis, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. three weeks.**

Member (J).

0.A.No.141/2022 with 0.A.No.145/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri R.V.Shiralkar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. two weeks.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.351/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri A.A.Mankar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. <u>Closed for Orders.</u>

Member (J).

O.A.No.352/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri A.A.Mankar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. <u>Closed for Orders.</u>

Member (J).

O.A.No.353/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri A.A.Mankar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. <u>Closed for Orders.</u>

Member (J).

O.A.No.354/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri A.A.Mankar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. <u>Closed for Orders.</u>

Member (J).

O.A.No.491/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri S.D.Chande, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. two weeks.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.597/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri B.Kulkarni, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. <u>Closed for Orders.</u>

Member (J).

O.A.No.822/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri I.S.Charlewar, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents 1 & 2 and Shri N.M.Kolhe, ld. counsel for the respondent no.3.

2. **S.O. two weeks.**

Member (J).

O.A.No.1116/2022 (S.B.)

<u>Coram</u>: Hon'ble Shri M.A.Lovekar, Member (J)

Dated: 24/03/2023.

Heard Shri M.D.Raut, ld. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, ld. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **Closed for Orders.**

Member (J).