

**M.C.A.No.09/2022 in O.A.No.583/2019 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri A.P.Sadavarte holding for Shri B.Kulkarni, the Id. Counsel for the applicant and Shri A.M.Khadatkar, the Id. P.O. for the respondents. None for the respondent nos. 3 to 5.

2. At the request of Id. counsel for the applicant, **S.O. 20.04.2022.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**O.A.No.324/2021 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

**C.A.No.129/2022:-**

Heard Smt. K.N.Saboo, the Id. Counsel for the applicant and Shri H.K.Pande, the Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **C.A.No.129/2022 for early hearing is allowed.**

3. **S.O. 2<sup>nd</sup> week of June, 2022.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**O.A.No.938/2018 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Dr. S.Dodke, the applicant in person.  
Shri A.P.Potnis, the Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. Applicant has filed pursis dated 07.04.2022  
for withdrawal of O.A.. Hence, **matter is disposed of  
as withdrawal.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**O.A.No.345/2022 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)  
Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri H.Dangre, the Id. Counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Deo, the Id. C.P.O. for the respondents.

2. This O.A. is filed to challenge show cause notice issued by the respondent nos. 1 & 2. The ground mentioned in the show cause notice is in respect of the ground raised in the Review Application. The matter is subjudice before this Tribunal. The Review Application is already dismissed by the Tribunal. Hence, **O.A. is fixed on 14.06.2022 till then show cause notice issued by the respondent nos. 1 & 2 is stayed.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**Rev.No.05/2022inO.A.No.245/2021 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Shri S.A.Deo, the Id. C.P.O. holding for Shri R.R.Shetty, Special counsel for the applicants (original respondent nos. 1 & 2) and Shri H.Dangre, the Id. counsel for the respondent (original applicant).

2. The Id. C.P.O. prayed to adjourn the matter in view of the letter issued by respondent nos. 1 & 2 dated 12.04.2022. On the last date specific understanding was given to the Id. C.P.O. to communicate the order to the respondent nos. 1 & 2 to choose the forum as to whether they want to continue the Writ Petition before Hon'ble High Court or this Review Application, but today also special counsel remains absent. Several letters sent by the Secretary of Governor which shows that grounds mentioned in the letter are nothing but to prolong the matter. In some of the letter it was written 'Governor is on Tour' in another letter it is mentioned that 'Special Counsel is busy'. Governor himself is not party. The respondent no. 1 is the Secretary of the Governor house therefore, presence of the same is not required. Special counsel once appointed it is his duty to remain present. Advocate Shri H.Dangre appearing for applicant has strongly objected to adjourn the matter. Hence, the request of Id. C.P.O. is rejected and we proceed further to decide the matter.

3. On the last date specific order was passed by this Tribunal with direction to the respondent nos. 1 & 2 to decide as to whether they want to continue with this Review Application or Writ Petition challenging the order dated 09.02.2022. The respondent nos. 1 & 2 have already challenged the order under Review before the Hon'ble High Court. Once the order is challenged before the Hon'ble High Court, there was no propriety for challenging this Review Application before this Tribunal.

4. The Review Application is filed on 29.03.2022. The order under challenge in Review was passed on 09.02.2022. As per the provisions of Section 124 of limitation Act the limitation for challenging Review Application is 30 days. The present Review Application is filed without any application for condonation of delay. Hence, the Review Application itself is not tenable.

5. The respondent nos. 1 & 2 have already challenged the order dated 09.02.2022 before the Hon'ble High Court. The Writ Petition is pending in that circumstances it was not expected from the respondent nos. 1 & 2 to file Review Application before this Tribunal. The matter will be decided by the Hon'ble High Court in the Writ Petition about the legality of the order dated 09.02.2022 on that ground the Review Application is not tenable.

6. On merit also Review Application is not tenable because in the Review Application it is mentioned that applicant has committed forgery by making entry in the inward register. The condonation of delay application was decided not only on the ground of the said letter of the applicant which was alleged to be forgery in the inward register. The delay was condoned on the following grounds:-

A. The applicant filed O.A.; challenging the 'promotion' of the respondent no. 3 but after filing the reply by respondent nos. 1 & 2, applicant came to know that it was not the promotion but it was 'appointment' and, therefore, he has challenged the appointment of respondent no. 3. The date of knowledge is material for condoning the delay. The applicant came to know about the appointment of respondent no. 3 after filing the reply by respondent nos. 1 & 2 in the original application. Hence, the delay was condoned.

B. The applicant also claiming deemed date of promotion. There is no limitation provided for claiming deemed date of promotion because it is a continuous cause of action on that ground also delay was condoned.

C. The applicant has also challenged the further promotion of respondent no. 3 in the year 2020 because of the pandemic Covid-19 Hon'ble Supreme Court has condoned the delay period of 15.03.2020 to 28.02.2022. Hence, there was no delay.

D. There is no apparent error or mistake in the order dated 09.02.2022. Hence, Review Application is rejected.

7. After passing the order dated 09.02.2022, Advocate for respondent nos. 1 & 2 is not ready to argue the matter finally. The respondent nos. 1 & 2 have sent four

letters to the Vice Chairman/Registrar of this Tribunal on flimsy ground to adjourn the matter. It was not expected from respondent nos. 1 & 2 because matter is subjudice before the Tribunal and it appears that respondent nos. 1 & 2 have sent many letters on day to day basis. In one of the letter it is mentioned that Special Counsel is busy, it cannot be a ground to adjourn the matter. The respondent nos. 1 & 2 is at liberty to engage any other counsel. Moreover Government Counsel i.e. Id. C.P.O. is available. It seems that respondent nos. 1 & 2 wants to prolong the matter. However, no merit in the Review Application. **Hence, Review Application No. 05/2022 deserves to be dismissed with heavy cost but considering the request of Id. C.P.O., Review Application is dismissed without cost.**

8. Respondents have engaged Special Counsel Shri R.R.Shetty, he is coming from Mumbai, looking to the inconvenience of the Id. special counsel, we can hear the matter on day-to-day basis and decide the same within a short period. Respondents have not complied the order dated 07.03.2022 on C.A. No. 88/2022. Hence, respondents are directed to produce all the documents as directed by the Tribunal on the next date without fail. If the respondents fail to file the documents, adverse inference will be drawn by the Tribunal.

9. All the connected O.As. i.e. O.A. Nos. 245/2021 and 345/2022 will be heard positively after Summer Vacation i.e. 14.06.2022, 15.06.2022 and onwards on day-to-day basis. No further adjournment will be granted by this Tribunal on any ground. Id. C.P.O. is requested to communicate this order to the respondent nos. 1 & 2.

10. **Steno copy is granted.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**O.A.No.245/2021 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri H.Dangre, the Id. Counsel for the applicant, Shri S.A.Deo, Id. C.P.O. holding for Shri R.R.Shetty, Id. counsel for the respondent nos. 1 & 2 and Shri R.Sharma, Id. counsel for the respondent no. 3.

2. **S.O. 14.06.2022.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**



**O.A.No.300/2022 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri M.R.Puranik, the Id. Counsel for the applicant and Shri A.P.Potnis, Id. C.P.O. for the respondents.

2. At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O. three weeks to file reply.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**O.A.No.08/2021 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**  
**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri A.P.Sadavarte, the Id. Counsel for the applicant and Shri A.P.Potnis, Id. C.P.O. for the respondents.

2. The Id. P.O. has filed reply on behalf of the respondent nos. 2 & 3. It is taken on record. Copy is served to the other side.

3. Hence, O.A. is **admitted** and kept for final hearing.

4. The Id. P.O. waives notices for the respondents.

5. **S.O. in due course.**

6. *Meanwhile, the Id. counsel for the applicant is at liberty to file Rejoinder, if any.*

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**C.P.No.48/2020inO.A.No.15/2019 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri R.M.Ahirrao, the Id. Counsel for the applicant and Shri A.P.Potnis, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. The Id. P.O. submits that reply is ready and he will file it within one week, **S.O. 20.04.2022.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**O.A.No.216/2022 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri R.V.Shiralkar, the Id. Counsel for the applicant and Shri A.P.Potnis, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. As per order dated 30.03.2022, Id. counsel for the applicant has filed chargesheet dated 30.09.2014. It is taken on record. Copy is served to the other side.

3. At the request of Id. P.O., **S.O. three weeks.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**O.A.No.370/2022 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman & Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**  
**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri A.D.Mhgaonkar, the Id. Counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Deo, Id. C.P.O. for the State.

2. Issue notice to Respondents, returnable on four weeks. Learned C.P.O. waives notice for R-1. Hamdast allowed.

3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.

4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of O.A. Respondent is put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

5. This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules,1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

6. The service may be done by Hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within one week. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.

7. In case notice is not collected within **three days** and if service report on affidavit is not filed **three days** before returnable date. Original Application shall stand dismissed without reference to Tribunal and papers be consigned to record.

8. **S.O. four weeks.**

9. **As submitted by Id. C.P.O., aspect of limitation is kept open.**

Member(J)  
Date:-13/04/2022.  
aps.

Vice Chairman

**C.P.No.37/2021inO.A.No.959/2019 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri R.M.Fating holding for Shri S.P.Palshikar, the Id. Counsel for the applicant, Shri H.K.Pande, Id. P.O. for the respondents and Smt. U.A.Patil, the Id. counsel for the respondent no. 3.

2. The Id. counsel for the respondent no. 3 submits that matter was listed on 05.04.2022 and it was kept for three weeks.

3. **S.O. 2<sup>nd</sup> week of June, 2022.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**





**C.P.No.50/2021 in O.A.No.778/2019 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)  
Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri C.F.Bhagwani, the Id. Counsel for the applicant and Shri A.M.Khadatkar, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. In order dated 04.03.2022 in para no. 2 in response to the application filed by respondents, six months time has been extended in respect of order. As submitted by Id. P.O., when matter was heard on 30.03.2022 further three months extension time was granted to comply the order. It should be treated to respondents as a last chance, they must comply the order within this limited time.

3. **S.O. last week of June, 2022.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**O.A.No.159/2013 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

None for the applicant. Shri A.M.Khadatkar,  
Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. four weeks.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**O.A.No.308/2014 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

None for the applicant. Shri A.P.Potnis, Id.  
P.O. for the respondents.

2. **S.O. after summer vacation.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**O.A.No.318/2015 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri D.S.Sawarkar, the Id. Counsel for the applicant, Shri A.M.Khadatkar, the Id. P.O. for the respondents and Shri K.S.Motwani, Id. counsel for the respondent no. 4.

2. As per the request of Id. counsel for the applicant, **S.O. 08.06.2022.**

3. **Put up this matter along with O.A. No. 777/2015.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**O.A.No.777/2015 (D.B.)**

**Coram : Shri Shree Bhagwan, Vice Chairman &  
Shri Justice M.G.Giratkar, Member (J)  
Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri K.S.Motwani, the Id. Counsel for the applicant, Shri A.M.Khadatkar, the Id. P.O. for the respondents and Shri D.S.Sawarkar, Id. counsel for the respondent no. 4.

2. As per the request of Id. counsel for the applicant, **S.O. 08.06.2022.**

3. **Put up this matter along with O.A. No. 318/2015.**

**Member(J)**  
**Date:-13/04/2022.**  
aps.

**Vice Chairman**

**O.A.594/2019 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri P.S.Sahare, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Sainis, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **After vacation for filing reply.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.323/2020 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

**C.A.No.166/2020**

Heard Shri S.N.Malthur, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

4. **After vacation for Condonation of delay.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.418/2020 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri P.K.Mishra, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri H.K.Pande, Id. P.O. for the respondent 1 & 4. Adv. Shri T.M.Zaheer for R – 2 & 3.

2. Learned P.O. submits that reply of respondent no.1. Time is granted.

3. **S.O. to 14.06.2022.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.108/2021 (S.B.)**



**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri A.P.Sadavarte, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Sainis, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. Learned P.O. Shri S.A.Sainis filed reply of respondent no.3. It is sufficient for other respondents.

3. Hence, the matter is **admitted** for final hearing.

4. **After vacation.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

O.A.198/2021 (S.B.)

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri A.D.Girdekar, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Deo, Id. C.P.O. for the respondents.

2. **After vacation for filing reply.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.505/2021 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

None for the applicant and Shri S.A.Sainis, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. Learned P.O filed reply of respondent no.4. It is sufficient for other respondents.

4. Hence, the matter is **admitted** for final hearing.

**After vacation.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.235/2022 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri S.N.Gaikwad, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri H.K.Pande, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. The applicant has filed pursis dated 11.04.2022. Grievance of the applicant is now redressed. Therefore, she do not want to prosecute the matter. Hence, O.A. is disposed of as withdrawal.

4. **O.A. is disposed of.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.265/2022 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri D.N.Mudgale, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Sainis, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

**After vacation.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.302/2022 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri I.S.Charlewar, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri M.I.Khan, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

3. At the request of learned P.O. **S.O. to 04.05.2022 for filing reply.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.1031/2019 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

**C.A.No.425/2021**

Heard Shri N.R.Saboo, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Deo, Id. C.P.O. for the respondents.

2. The applicant no.9 does not want to prosecute the matter. Hence, the name of applicant no.9 shall be deleted from the title of the O.A.

**After vacation .**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.1034/2019 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

**C.A.No.426/2021**

Heard Shri N.R.Saboo, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. The applicant no.3, he does not want to prosecute the O.A.. Hence, the name shall be deleted C.A. is disposed off.

3. Learned P.O. filed reply of respondent no. 1 to 4 taken on record.

4. Hence, the matter is **admitted** for final hearing.

**After Vacation.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.1035/2019 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**



**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

**C.A.Nos.427/2021 & 428/2021**

Heard Shri N.R.Saboo, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, Id. P.O. for the respondents. Adv. Shri Sachin Zoting for the original applicant Nos.

2. The applicant no.3,4,7,8,10,12,13 & 15 do not want to prosecute the matter. Hence, their name shall be deleted from the title of the O.A..

3. Learned P.O. filed reply of respondent no. 1 to 4 taken on record.

4. Hence, the matter is admitted for final hearing.

**After Vacation.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.1145/2021 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri N.R.Saboo, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Deo, Id. C.P.O. for the respondents.

2. Issue notice to the respondents returnable **four weeks**. Learned P.O. waives notice for State. Hamdast allowed.

3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.

4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of O.A. Respondent is put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

5. This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

6. The service may be done by Hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within one week. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.

7. In case notice is not collected within **three days** and if service report on affidavit is not filed **three days** before returnable date. Original Application shall stand dismissed

without reference to Tribunal and papers be  
consigned to record.

**S.O. four weeks.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.382/2017 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri I.G.Meshram, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri V.A.Kulkarni, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **After vacation for final hearing.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.927/2017 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri P.P.Kotwal, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri H.K.Pande, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **After vacation for final hearing.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

**O.A.268/2018 (S.B.)**

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri K.A.Masorke holding for Shri A.H.Jamal, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri A.P.Potnis, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **After vacation for final hearing.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.

O.A.181/2020 (S.B.)

**Coram: Hon'ble Shri Justice M.G. Giratkar,  
Member (J).**

**Dated : 13/04/2022.**

Heard Shri N.D.Thombre, Id. counsel for the applicant and Shri S.A.Sainis, Id. P.O. for the respondents.

2. **Closed for the order.**

**Member (J).**

RSM.