ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.754 2017

Shri (Dr) P.K. Wadikar

.....Applicant

V/s.

State of Maharashtra & Ors.

.....Respondents

Shri A.V. Bandiwadekar, the learned Advocate for the Applicants Ms S. Suryawanshi, the learned P.O. for the Respondents

CORAM :

Shri R.B. Malik, Member (J)

DATE

28th August, 2017

ORDER

- 1. Heard Shri A.V. Bandiwadekar. the learned Advocate for the Applicant and Ms S. Suryawanshi, the learned P.O. for the Respondents.
- 2. This O.A. is placed before me for consideration of interim relief.
- 3. I have perused the record and proceedings and relevant file in original which I have returned it back to the learned P.O. for being handed back to Shri S.T. Jadhav, Asstt. Section Officer from the office of Resp. No.1 who also instructed the learned P.O.
- 4. The Applicant is a Medical Officer. On completion of tenure by the order dated 31.05.2017 from Daund he was transferred to Alibag, district Raigad. The Applicant made a request for modification thereof so that he could join his spouse at Regional Hospital, Yerwada. I must make it very clear that at least as of now I may not give any specific direction with regard to the specific posting of the Applicant. As of

with regard to such request made by the Applicant on 16.06.2017. The Civil Service. Board was convened to consider the said request of the Applicant and may be of others as well. I have perused the minutes of the meeting. The same is signed by the Member and the Director Health Services, Mumbai the Member and Commissioner of Health Services, Mumbai and the Hon'ble Minister. Now, as far as the Chairman is concerned it is very clear that on 16.6.2016 he was not present. The same incumbent who was the Member and the Commissioner and signed the said minutes as such on 16.6.2017 put his signature in the column of the Chairman and Secretary on 14.7.2017.

In my opinion, the whole matter is so axiomatic that nothing 5. needs to be mentioned further. One fall out is that as on 16.6.2017, the incumbent of the office of the Member and Secretary was still not appointed as the Chairman and the second fall out is that the said meeting was held without the Chairman. The learned Advocate invites reference to Original Application No. 48/2012 (Shri Sharad Borase V/s The Commissioner of Police, Mumbai), dtd.27.3.2012 and more particularly to para 6 thereof which in effect holds that if the meeting took place without the Chairman that could be not legal at all and such an act cannot be ratified post facto. Regard being had to these facts and circur stances, I am of the opinion that there is a fair degree of justification to conclude that the meeting of the Civil Services Board that decided the issue of post transfer request was not something that could pes; muster with the process of judicial scrutiny. This is something cannot be lost sight of. I am informed at the bar that even if the original transfer order was issued on 31.5.2017, the applicant was actually relieved post O.A. on 09.08.2017. In my opinion, therefore, in as muc i as this tribunal is sufficiently empowered even to make mandatery orders at interlocutory stage, an appropriate order of reposting can be made. It is, therefore, directed that the Applicant be



reposted a Daund within a period of one week from today and shall be allowed to function there till further orders.

- 6. Issue notice returnable on 25.09.2017.
- 7. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal need not be issued.
- 8. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of O.A. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission nearing.
- 9. This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988 and the juestions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.
- 10. The service may be done by hand delivery / speed post / courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within four weeks. Applicant is directed to file Affidav t of compliance and notice.
- 11. S.O to 25.09.2017. Learned P.O. do waive service. Hamdast.

(R.B. Malik)

Vice - Chairman 28.08.2017

(vsm)

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

I N

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

M.A. No.412 of 2016 In O.A. No.1011 of 2016

Shri C.S. Bhore

... Applicant

V/s.

The State of Mah. & ors. ... Respondents

Heard Shri A.A. Kulkarni, the learned Advocate for the Applicant and Shri A.J. Chougule, the learned P.O. for the Respondents.

Although he Misc. Application has become Part-Heard but I find that the facts pertaining to W.P. No.9505/2014 (Shri C. S. Bhore V/s the Assistant Director of Higher Education & Ors) which was decided by the Division Bench of the Hon'ble Bombay High Court on 19.09.2016 has not been referred to the M.A. at all. The Applicant is directed to make an appropriate amendment annexed thereto a copy of the above judgment of the Hon'ble Bombay High Court and compliance within two weeks.

S.O. to 18.09.2017.

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) フめばけ Vice-Chairman 28.08.2017

DATE: 28 8 7

CONTROL RAJIV AGARWAL

(Vice - Chairment)

RANCE:

Sh. A. A. A. K. (Member)

Advisorie for the Applicant

Shri Smt. A. A. T. Chologicale

L.P.O. P.O. for the Respondents

Add Forms Son + 018 9 17.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

<u>M.A. 366 of 2017</u> <u>In</u> O.A. No.293 of 2017

Shri S.M. Sawant

... Applicant

V/s.

The State of Mah. & ors. ... Respondents

Heard Shri A.V. Bandiwadekar, the learned Advocate for the Applicant and Smt Archana B.K., the learned P.O. for the Respondents.

Issue notice returnable on 11.09.2017.

Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal need not be issued.

Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of O.A. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988 and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

The service may be done by hand delivery / speed post / courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of—eompliance in the Registry within four weeks. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.

S.O. to 11.09.2017. Learned P.O. do waive service.

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) 28 | 8 | 1+ Vice-Chairman 28.08.2017

DATE: 28/8/7

CORAM:

How the Shri. RAJIV AGARWAI

(Vice Chairman)

Rive the Sori R. B. MALIK (Member)

APPEARANCE:

Shri/Shre: All Bound (Console

Adviceste for the Applicant

n.A. loc order.

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

O.A. No.600 of 2017

Shri S.G. Dhanawade

... Applicant

V/s.

The State of Mah. & ors. ... Respondents

Heard Shri K.R. Jagdale, the learned Advocate for the Applicant and Ms N.G. Gohad, the learned P.O. for the Respondents.

The learned P.O. is being instructed by Shri Kesarinath V. Godbole, ACF-Roha who is present on behalf of the Respondent No.3 has filed some kind of a common Affidavit-in-Reply on behalf of Respondent Nos.1, 2 & 3. In para 5,6 and 7 of the Affidavit, it has been mentioned that the proposal of deemed date has been submitted to the Government on 18.10.2016 which is a long time now. Keeping the O.A. pending, I direct the Respondent No.1 to state the Affidavit-in-Reply, what is the progress in the matter and it will be better in fact if the proper decision is taken before the next date.

S.O. to 21.09.2017. Hamdast.

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) Vice-Chairman 28.08.2017

DATE: 28817

CORAM:

Hon' Me Shri. RAJIV AGARWAL

Wice Chairman

APPEARANCE: Vice chairman

Appearance: Vice chairman

Advocate for the Applicant

Shri /Smr.: Ns. N. G. Cohoo

C.P.OTP.O. for the Respondents

Adh To S. O. to 21917.

H Quand ast

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

O.A. No.545 of 2017

Dr. S.V. Medhekar

... Applicant

V/s.

The State of Mah. & ors. ... Respondents

Heard the Applicant in person. Ms N.G. Gohad, the learned P.O. holding for Shri N.K. Rajpurohit, the learned C.P.O. for the Respondent No.1 and Shri M.M. Kura, Respondent No.2 in person.

Affidavit-in-Reply of Respondent No.2 is taken on record.

The Applicant informs that he does not want to file Rejoinder.

The Original Application is admitted and appointed for final hearing on 20.09.2017.

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) Color Vice-Chairman 28.08.2017

(vsm)

DATE: 28 8 7

CORAN:
Hon the Shri. RATTV AGARWAL

(Wee Chairman)

APPEAL ANCE:

Shri. RATTV AGARWAL

(Wee Chairman)

APPEAL ANCE:

Shri. Shri. R. B. MALIK (Member)

Adrice in the Applicant

Shri. Sam. M. G. Gohae

CHOTPO for the Respondence to Rozaldi

Nolding to a prison

Nolding to a prison

Peply wied by R. No2

O. R. as aduuted:

5. 0. +0 20 9117.

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

486 O.A. No.468 of 2017

Smt. A. S. Gitay

... Applicant

V/s.

The State of Mah. & ors. ... Respondents

Heard Shri G. A. Bandiwadekar, the learned Advocate for the Applicant and Shri A.J. Chougule, the learned P.O. for the Respondents.

The Affidavit-in-Rejoinder is taken on record. The Original Application is admitted and appointed for final hearing on 19.09.2017.

Sur-Rejoinder, if any, must be filed on that day and not thereafter.

S.O. to 19.09.2017.

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) Vice-Chairman 28.08.2017

DATE: 28/8/17

AM:

Ne Shri. RAHV AGARWAL

(Vice Charlingan)

(ARANCE:

ARANCE:

ARANCE:

A D Condicorodeko

Shri Sam. A T Choca of cela

Pero 1 P.O. for the Respondence

Pero 1 Date Cont

Adj. To Appli Count

O A cos admanted

S O + O 19/9/17

(wem)

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

O.A. No.667 of 2017

Shri J.B. Girase

... Applicant

V/s.

The State of Mah. & ors. ... Res

... Respondents

Heard Shri A.V. Bandiwadekar, the learned Advocate for the Applicant and Shri A.J. Chogule, the learned P.O. for the Respondents.

The learned P.O. is being instructed by B.S. Shinde, Desk Officer, P.W.D. Mantralaya, Mumbai.

This is a matter pertaining to Applicant's date of birth. I have perused my earlier orders. The representation of the Applicant has been recently rejected. A case of the amendment is, therefore, made out. In the context of the present fact, the regular M.A. is dispensed with. The learned Advocate for the Applicant says that the amendment can be carried out within the course of the day. A consolidated copy of the OA after amendment be filed and a copy be P.O. to learned to the Reply/additional Reply. S.O. to 13.09.2017. Hamdast.

Liberty to mention.

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) ZSTE | \ † Vice-Chairman 28.08.2017

DATE: 28/8/17

CORAN:

Now 'Vie Shri. RATIV AGARWAL

(Vice - Chairman)

The 'ble Shri. R. B. MALIK (Member)

APPRARANCE:

(Vice - Chairman)

APPRARANCE:

(Vice - Chairman)

Advocate for the Applicant

Shri Smr. A. V. Boundies adoles

C.POTPO. for the Respondents

Advocate for the Respondents

Advocate for the Respondents

(G.C.P.) J 2260(B) (50,000-2-2015)

[Spl.- MAT-F-2 E.

IN THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

O.A. No.784 of 2017

Shri S.D. Surve

... Applicant

V/s.

The State of Mah. & ors. ... Respondents

Heard Shri C.T. Chandratre, the learned Advocate for the Applicant and Smt. Kranti Gaikwad, the learned P.O. for the Respondents.

I have perused the copy of the complaint which according to the learned P.O. was produced before the Police Establishment Board Meeting. The matter of the fact going by the complaints themselves including the report of Shri Mangesh Chavan, Sub-Divisional Officer, SDPO, dated 24.08.2017, the said complaint has been found to be false but even then making it clear that if on the next date the Affidavit-in-Reply is not filed, I may proceed to pass an appropriate interim order.

The Original Application stands adjourned to 06.09.2017.

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) 28 (8 (1) 7-Vice-Chairman 28.08.2017

(vsm)

(G.C.P.) J 2260(B) (50,000-2-2015)

Spl.- MAT-F-2 E.

IN THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL **MUMBAI**

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

O.A. No.41 of 2017

Shri S.N. Patvardhan

... Applicant

V/s.

The State of Mah. & ors.

... Respondents

Heard Shri Gugale holding for Ms N.A. Jadhav, the learned Advocate for the Applicant and Ms S. Suryawanshi, the learned P.O. for the Respondents.

Affidavit-in-Rejoinder is taken on record. The Original Application is admitted and appointed for final hearing on 22.09.2017.

ble Shri. RAJIV AGARWAL

__(Vice - Chairman)

Bon'ble Shri R. B. MALIK (Member)

Advocate for the Applicant

Shit /Sme. Ms. S. Suza

OA is admitt

5.0.+022/9/19

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) Vice - Chairman 28.08.2017

(vsm)

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

O.A. No.798 of 2017

Shri A.R. Jadhav

... Applicant

V/s.

The State of Mah. & ors. ... Respondents

Heard Shri M.B. Kadam, the learned Advocate for the Applicant and Shri A.J. Chougule, the learned P.O. for the Respondents.

Issue notice returnable on 31.08.2017.

Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal need not be issued.

Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of O.A. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988 and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

The service may be done by hand delivery / speed post / courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within four weeks. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.

S.O. to 31.08.2017. Learned P.O. do waive service.

Liberty reserved for the Applicant to seek interim relief.

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) Vice-Chairman 28.08.2017

 Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

O.A. No.803 of 2017 (D.B.)

Shri Y.A. Bhandalkar

... Applicant

V/s.

The State of Mah. & ors. ... Respondents

Heard Shri A.V. Bandiwadekar, the learned Advocate for the Applicant and Smt. Archana B.K., the learned P.O. for the Respondents.

Issue notice returnable on 25.09.2017.

Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal need not be issued.

Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of O.A. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988 and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

The service may be done by hand delivery / speed post / courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within four weeks. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.

S.O. to 25.09.2017. Learned P.O. do waive service.

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) 281817 Vice-Chairman 28.08.2017

Office Notes, Office Memorands of Garam, Appearance, Fribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

O.A. No.804 of 2017 (D.B.)

Ms. A. A. Dighe

... Applicant

V/s.

The State of Mah. & ors. ... Respondents

Heard Shri A.V. Bandiwadekar, the learned Advocate for the Applicant and Smt. Archana B.K., the learned P.O. for the Respondents.

Issue notice returnable on 25.09.2017.

Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal need not be issued.

Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of O.A. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988 and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

The service may be done by hand delivery / speed post / courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within four weeks. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.

S.O. to 25.09.2017. Learned P.O. do waive service.

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) Vice-Chairman 28.08.2017

DATE: 28/8/17

CORAM:

Han'the Shri RATTV ACARWA

Appearance:

Shri Shri R. B. Malik thrember

Advoorte for the Applicant

Shri Shri Shri R. Charles and B. K.

C. P. T. D. Gor the Respondents

Att S. O. + O. 25/9/7.

Tribunal's orders

O.A. No.807 of 2017 with O.A. 808, 809, 810 & 811 of 2017 (D.B.)

Shri N.M. Tile & Ors. V/s.

... Applicants

The State of Mah. & ors.

... Respondents

Heard Shri A. V. Bandiwadekar, the learned Advocate for the Applicants and Ms. Gohad, the learned P.O. Respondents.

Issue notice returnable on 25.09.2017.

Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal need not be issued.

Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of O.A. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988 and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

The service may be done by hand delivery / speed post / courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within four weeks. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.

S.O. to 25.09.2017. Learned P.O. do waive service.

Liberty to seek interim relief is reserved.

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) 28/8/11 Vice - Chairman 28.08.2017

DATE: 2881 CORAM:

Hon'ble Shri RAHV AGARWAL

(Vice - Chairman) Roo ble Shri R. B. MALIK (Member)

APPEARANCE:

Advocate for the Applicant

Shri/Smt - M. N. G. G.O

C.P.O r.P.O. for the Respondents

Ad to 5.0. +0 25/9/17

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

M.A. 371 of 2017 In O.A. No.807 of 2017 (D.B.)

Shri N.M. Tile & Ors.

... Applicants

V/s.

... Respondents The State of Mah. & ors.

Bandiwadekar, Shri A.V. learned Advocate for the Applicants and Ms N.G. Gohad, the learned P.O. for the Respondents.

This MA has been filed to sue jointly. As all the Applicants are seeking similar relief, the MA to sue jointly is allowed, subject to payment of Court Fees, if not already paid.

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) 28811ナ Vice - Chairman 28.08.2017

(vsm)

CORAM:

n 'Me Shri, RAJIV AGARWA (Vice - Chairman)

Plan the Shri R. B. MALIK (Member

APTEARANCE:

Advocate for the Applicant

Shri/Smt. t. INB . N . G C.PO / P.O. for the Respondents

Ad To M.A. cas allows

Tribunal's orders

O.A. No.789 of 2017 (D.B.)

Shri S.K. Pawar

... Applicant

V/s.

... Respondents The State of Mah. & ors.

Shri A.V. Bandiwadekar, the Heard learned Advocate for the Applicant and Shri N.K. learned C.P.O. for Rajpurohit, Respondents.

Issue notice returnable on 25.09.2017.

Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at this stage and separate notice for final disposal need not be issued.

Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation / notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of O.A. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

This intimation / notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988 and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

The service may be done by hand delivery / speed post / courier and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within four weeks. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.

Learned P.O. do S.O. to 25.09.2017. waive service.

Right to seek interim relief is reserved.

Sd/-

(R.B. Malik) 28 6/1 T Vice-Chairman 28.08.2017

DATE: 28 CORAM: n'ide Shri. RAJIV AGARWAL - (Vice - Chairman)

From 'ble Shri R. B. MALIK (Member) (VICE_chargues)

APPEARANCE:

SMIN A.V. BOOL

Advocate for the Applicant

Shri Smt. 1116. Roy DCO C.P.O. P.O. for the Respondents