ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.13/2024 (Ganesh Tejrao Saaste Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 22.04.2024 <u>ORAL ORDER</u> :

Shri S.S.Tandale, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri V.R.Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. S.O. to 06-05-2024. Interim relief granted earlier to continue till then.

MEMBER (A)
YUK ORAL ORDER 22.04.2024

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.193/2024 (Supriya Popatrao Ghule Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 22.04.2024 <u>ORAL ORDER</u> :

Shri Ajay Deshpande, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri V.R.Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. S.O. to 06-05-2024. Interim relief granted earlier to continue till then.

MEMBER (A)
YUK ORAL ORDER 22.04.2024

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.755/2022

(Sopan R. Suryawanshi Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Shri V.B.Wagh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri V.R.Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. S.O. to 06-05-2024. Interim relief granted earlier to continue till then.

MEMBER (A)
YUK ORAL ORDER 22.04.2024

M.A.NO.163/2024 IN O.A.NO.213/2024 (Niles J. Chavan & Anr. Vs. Prashant G. Badgujar & Ors. & State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

<u>CORAM</u>: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Heard Shri V.B.Wagh, learned Counsel for the applicants in M.A., Shri S.G.Kulkarni, learned Counsel holding for Shri Ajay Deshpande, learned Counsel for applicants in O.A. and Shri V.G.Pingle, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities.

2. Present application is filed seeking intervention in O.A.No.213/2024. Learned Counsel appearing for the applicants pointed out that both the applicants are included in the merit list/ provisional merit list and they are possessing the same qualification as prescribed in the advertisement and in the circumstances their chances of getting appointment are better. Learned Counsel submits that since this Tribunal has passed an order directing the respondents to keep one post vacant at Nagpur and Latur the present applicants in M.A. are likely to be affected by the said order

and in such circumstances they are intending to intervene in the O.A.

- 3. Learned P.O. submitted for passing appropriate order.
- 4. Learned Counsel for the applicant in O.A. seeks time to file reply to the M.A. It does not appear to us that any formal reply is necessary when from the documents it appears that the applicants in M.A. may be the affected parties. We, therefore, see no reason for rejecting the application. Hence, the following order:

ORDER

- [i] M.A. for intervention is allowed and disposed of.
- [ii] Amendment be carried out forthwith and applicants in M.A. be impleaded as party respondent nos.5 and 6 in the O.A.
- 5. Added respondent nos.5 and 6 may file their response to the O.A. on or before 06-05-2024.
- 6. S.O. to 06-05-2024.

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.351/2022 (Taher Ali Mohd. Ali Shah Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 22.04.2024 ORAL ORDER :

Shri M.R.Kulkarni, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri V.R.Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

- 2. Learned P.O. files affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent nos.2, 3 & 4. Learned Counsel for the applicant consents for taking the affidavit in reply on record. Accordingly, it is taken on record. Copy thereof be supplied to the other side.
- 3. List the matter for hearing on 04-07-2024. In the meanwhile, it will be open for the applicant to file rejoinder.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

YUK ORAL ORDER 22.04.2024

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.403/2022 (Pandit S. Tiparse Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Heard Shri Dhananjay Mane, learned Counsel for the applicant and Smt. Resha Deshmukh, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities.

2. Arguments are concluded. Reserved for order.

MEMBER (A)
YUK ORAL ORDER 22.04.2024

ORIGINAL APPLICATION ST. NO. 811 OF 2024 (Manikumari A. Battula Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

<u>CORAM</u>: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Shri V.B. Dhage, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri Mahesh B. Bharaswadkar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for respondent authorities, are present.

2. At the request of learned counsel for the applicant, S.O. to 25.04.2024.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION ST.NO. 962 OF 2024

(Niteen K. Devsarkar Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman

AND

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Shri V.B. Dhage, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri Mahesh B. Bharaswadkar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for respondent authorities, are present.

2. At the request of learned counsel for the applicant, S.O. to 25.04.2024.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION ST.NO. 1000 OF 2024

(Varsharani Sudhakar Chavhan Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman

AND

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Shri S.S. Chakurkar, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri V.G. Pingle, learned Presenting Officer for respondent authorities, are present.

2. The present matter be removed from board.

MEMBER (A) VICE CHAIRMAN

M.A.ST.NO. 998/2024 IN O.A.ST.NO. 999/2024 (Tushar Vijay Deore & Ors. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman
AND

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Heard Shri K.P. Rodge, learned counsel for the applicants and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for respondent authorities.

- 2. This is an application preferred by the applicants seeking leave to sue jointly.
- 3. Though some applicants are not residing within the territorial jurisdiction of this Tribunal, having regard to the nature of the dispute raised, we permit the applicants to sue the application jointly, subject to payment of court fee stamps, if not paid.
- 4. Accompanying O.A. be registered and numbered, after removal of office objections, if any. The present M.A. stands disposed of accordingly without any order as to costs.

MEMBER (A)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION ST.NO. 999 OF 2024

(Tushar Vijay Deore & Ors. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

<u>CORAM</u>: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 22.04.2024 ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri K.P. Rodge, learned counsel for the applicants and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for respondent authorities.

2. In T.A. Nos. 3 & 4 both of 2023 this Tribunal has restrained the respondents from outsourcing the particular works, which are being done by in-house employees, so long the projects are continuing. Before passing of the order by this Tribunal the protection from the Hon'ble High Court was existing in the said matter. In view of the same, the following order is passed: -

ORDER

- (i) Issue notice to the respondents, returnable on 10.06.2024. Till then the respondents shall not give effect to the order dated 04.04.2024.
- (ii) Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.
- (iii) Applicants are authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.
- (iv) This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure)

:: - 2 - :: O.A. ST.NO. 999 OF 2024

Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

- (v) The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicants are directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.
- (vi) S.O. to 10.06.2024.
- (vii) Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

MEMBER (A) VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 63 OF 2024

(Balbir Singh Jagannath Prasad Tyagi Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman

AND

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Shri Kiran G. Salunke, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri Mahesh B. Bharaswadkar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for respondent authorities, are present.

- 2. Though in the present matter order has been passed on 15.02.2024 directing the respondents to make available original record in respect of the enquiry conducted against the applicant, the same has not yet been produced. Learned Chief Presenting Officer seeks time to place the said papers on record till 30.04.2024. Time granted as prayed for.
- 3. S.O. to 30.04.2024.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 424 OF 2024

(Pooja Bansi Dutonde Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman

AND

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Heard Shri Raviraj Wakle, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for respondent authorities.

- 2. Issue notice to respondents, returnable on 21.06.2024.
- 3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.
- 4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.
- 5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.
- 6. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicant is directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.
- 7. S.O. to 21.06.2024.
- 8. Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

MEMBER (A) VICE CHAIRMAN

T.A.NO. 14/2024 (W.P.NO. 1832/2024)
(Gajanan Dattarao Naik Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman
AND
Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Heard Shri Sanjeev Deshpande, learned counsel holding for Shri S.T. Solanke, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri Mahesh B. Bharaswadkar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for respondent authorities.

- 2. Learned counsel for the applicant submits that the applicant could not get the complete addresses of the private respondents. He has, therefore, sought direction against the respondents to provide the addresses of the private respondents. The applicant may through the office of Chief Presenting Officer get the addresses by making request in that regard. If such request is made, learned C.P.O. to ensure that such addresses are provided to the applicant.
- 3. After getting the address as above, issue notice to respondents, returnable on 09.05.2024.
- 3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.

:: - 2 - :: T.A. 14/24 (W.P. 1832/24)

- 4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.
- 5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.
- 6. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicant is directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.
- 7. S.O. to 09.05.2024.
- 8. Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 1000 OF 2023

(Ramakant Jayvantrao Sonkamble Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

<u>CORAM</u>: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Shri K.P. Rodge, learned counsel holding for Shri P.G. Rodge, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri Mahesh B. Bharaswadkar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for respondent authorities, are present.

2. At the request of learned Chief Presenting Officer, S.O. to 02.05.2024.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 359 OF 2024

(Shubham Ganesh Patil Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman

AND

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Shri S.B. Solanke, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri Mahesh B. Bharaswadkar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for respondent authorities, are present.

- 2. Though the matter is shown in the await service category, learned counsel for the applicant submits that all the respondents are served and today he will be filing service affidavit in the registry. Learned C.P.O. to ascertain the fact and file affidavit in reply, if all the respondents are served, on the next date.
- 3. S.O. to 18.06.2024. Interim relief granted earlier to continue till then.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 308 OF 2021

(Nita Bhimrao Magare Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman

Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Shri S.S. Jadhavar, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri V.G. Pingle, learned Presenting Officer for respondent authorities, are present.

2. S.O. to 03.05.2024.

MEMBER (A) VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 28/2022 WITH 01/2022 WITH 02/2022

(Girish Ashok Bibave & Ors. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM : Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Shri S.S. Jadhavar, learned counsel for the applicant in O.A. No. 28/2022, Shri K.G. Salunke, learned counsel for the applicants in O.A. Nos. 01 & 02 both of 2022 and Shri V.G. Pingle, learned Presenting Officer for respondent authorities in all these matters, are present.

2. S.O. to 03.05.2024. Interim relief granted earlier in O.A. Nos. 01 & 02 both of 2022 to continue till then.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

M.A.ST.NO. 554/2024 IN O.A.NO. 778/2023 (Amit S. More Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

WITH

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 778 OF 2023 (Vitthal G. Shinde & Ors. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

CORAM: Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman
AND
Shri Vinay Kargaonkar, Member (A)

DATE : 22.04.2024

ORAL ORDER:

Shri Sanket S. Kulkarni, learned counsel for the applicant in M.A. St. No. 554/2024 (absent). Shri A.S. Deshmukh, learned counsel for the applicant sin O.A. No. 778/2023, S/Shri Mahesh B. Bharaswadkar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for respondent authorities, J.B. Choudhary, A.S. Khedkar, S.S. Kurundkar & D.T. Devane, learned counsel for the respective respondents, are present.

S/Shri Ganesh P. Darandale, Parag V. Barde, S.N. Pagare & M.K. Bhosale, learned counsel for the respective respondents, **are absent.**

2. Shri A.S. Khedkar, learned counsel points out that an application is preferred before the Hon'ble Chairperson for clubbing the identical matters, which are filed at Nagpur, Aurangabad and also at

:: - 2 - :: M.A.ST.NO. 554/2024 IN O.A.NO. 778/2023

Principal Bench at Mumbai. Learned counsel submits that the matter is placed for further consideration on tomorrow's board before the Hon'ble Chairperson. In the circumstances, S.O. to 25.04.2024.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN