## Sile Pares X MARASHTRA ADMINISTIZATIVE TIETET NAT

ion No.

### FARAD CONTINU

ce Memoranda of Coram, Tribunal's cuders oced Registrar's cream

#### O.A.1578/2023

J.S. Bansode Vs. The State of Mah. & Ors. ... Applicant

... Respondents

- Heard Applicant in person and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned CPO for Respondents.
- S.O. to 4th January, 2024...

Sd1-

(Medha Gadgil) Member-A 18.12.2023

Sd1-

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson 18.12.2023

#### Tribunal's orders

#### O.A. No.1500 of 2023

S.G. Deokar

..Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

..Respondents

Heard Smt. Punam Majahan, learned Advocate for the Applicant and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.

- 2. This pertains to cancellation of requirement of Non-Creamy Layer Certificate and the benefit to be given to the present applicant. Ld. Advocate for the applicant prays that one post of Assistant Commissioner, Animal Husbandry be kept vacant. Applicant has secured 116 marks and the topper in Women category has secured 127. Ld. Advocate for the applicant relies on the order dated 30.11.2023 passed by the Nagpur Bench of this Tribunal in OA No.1258/2023. Similarly situated candidate was given interim relief by giving directions to the respondents to keep vacant one post of Assistant Commissioner, Animal Husbandry in open female category.
- 3. Ld. CPO submits that benefit of cancellation was from the date of result of the examination on 22.9.2022 and advertisement in the present case was issued in February 2022. So provisions of GR are not applicable to the present case.
- 4. In view of the said order dated 30.11.2023 and as the applicant is similarly situated, we pass the following order.
- 5. The respondents are directed to keep one post vacant of Assistant Commissioner, Animal Husbandry in the Open (Female) reserved category till next date.
- 6. S.O. to 4.1.2024.

Sd/-(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) 18.12.2023 Sd/-(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson 18.12.2023

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

I N

Original Application No.

of 20

## FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET No.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders	Tribunal's orders	
	M.A. No.189/2022 in O.A. No.	o.613 of 2019
	S.S. Chavan Vs.	Applicant
	The State of Maharashtra & Ors.	Respondents
	Heard Smt. Punam Mahajan. the Applicant and Ms. S.P. Mand Presenting Officer for the Respondents	hekar, learned Chie

- Ld. Advocate for the applicant submits that on 14.7.2016 DPC for the year 2015, 2016 was held and applicant was found fit for promotion. On 7.1.2017 promotion order to the post of Assistant Police Inspector was issued and his name was at Sr. No.186. On 16.11.2017 charge sheet in criminal case was filed, though offence was registered in 2015. Ld. Advocate for the applicant relied on judgment of Hon'ble Supreme Court in (1991) 4 SCC 109 Union of India & Ors. Vs. K.V. Jankiraman & Ors. and submits that when DE was conducted on 14.7.2016 there was no criminal case pending against him and he should have been relieved to join on promotional post. Advocate for the applicant produces list of 3 officers along with chart to whom promotion was given by the department pending respective trials.
- S.O. to 10.1.2024. Part heard. 3.

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) 18.12.2023

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson 18.12.2023

#### Tribunal's orders

Date: 18.12.2023

#### O.A.No.1190/2022

N.A. Bankar & Ors. ....Applicants Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors. ....Respondents.

- 1. Heard Mr. M.D. Lonkar, learned Counsel for the Applicants and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Mr. S.S. Dere, learned Counsel for Respondents No.23 and 27 is absent.
- 3. At the request of learned Counsel adjourned to 29.01.2024.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

#### Tribunal's orders

Date: 18.12.2023

#### O.A.No.979/2023

S.M. Kubal & Ors.

....Applicants

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors. ....Respondents.

- 1. Heard Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Mr. S.S. Dere, learned Counsel for the Applicant is absent.
- 3. Learned C.P.O. has stated that during the course of the day reply will be filed.
- 4. It be taken on record. Copy be served upon the concern.
- 5. Adjourned to 12.02.2024 for rejoinder, if any.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Original Application No.	of 20	DISTRICT Applicant/s
(Advocate	)	Applicativs
	versus	
The Stat	e of Maharashtra and others	
		Respondent/s
Presenting Officer	)	
Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders		ıl's orders
	18.12.2023	
	O.A 56/	2017
	Ms A.S Chavan Vs.	Applicant
	The State of Maharashtra & (	Ors Respondents
	<ol> <li>Heard Shri B.A advocate for the applicant learned P.O for the Responder</li> </ol>	
	2. Learned counsel sub- present in the Court and s 18.12.2023 seeking permi Original Application.	
	3. The said applicat submitted by the applicant marked as Exh. A.	
	4. In view of the about stands disposed of as withdr	ove, Original Application awn.
	Sd/- (Medha Gadgil) Member (A)	Sd/- (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

#### Tribunal's orders

Date: 18.12.2023

## M.A.No.783/2023 in O.A.No.481/2023 with M.A.No.784/2023 in O.A.No.1391/2023

R.B. Mote & Ors. ....Applicants Vs. ....Respondents. ....Respondents.

- 1. Heard Ms. Neha Kachi holding for Mr. Talekar, learned Counsel for the Applicants and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Learned Counsel Mr. K.R. Jagdale seeks permission to filed M.As praying for intervention in O.A.No.481/2023 & O.A.No.1391/2023.
- 3. Learned Counsel Ms. Kachi accepts the intervention.
- 4. Adjourned to 19.12.2023.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A)

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Original Application No.	of 20	DISTRICT
		Applicant/s
Advocate	)	
	versus	
The Stat	e of Maharashtra and others	
The Stat	e of Manarashtra and others	D . 1 .//
		Respondent/s
Presenting Officer	)	
Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders	Tribun	al's orders
	18.12.2023	
	M.A 771/2023 i	n O.A 60/2022
	D.R Gujar & Ors Vs.	Applicants
	The State of Maharashtra &	Ors Respondents
	1. Heard Shri R.V Sh Deshmukh, learned advoca Mrs K.S Gaikwad, learned P	inde holding for Shri L.S ate for the applicants and P.O for the Respondents.
	<ol> <li>The Original Appl regularization of services present Misc Application is matter.</li> </ol>	of the applicants. The
	3. We make it clear that of the year 2016 and 201 position to take the present	t we are taking old matters 7 and so we will be in a O.A after 3 months.
	4. Misc Application is a	accordingly disposed of.
	5. Place O.A 60/2022 o	on Board on 7.3.2024.
	Sd/- (Medha Gadgil) Member (A)	Sd/- (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Original Application No.	of 20	Di	STRICT
			Applicant/s
(Advocate	)		
	$v\epsilon$	ersus	
The Sta	ate of Mal	narashtra and others	
			Respondent/s
(Presenting Officer	•••••	)	
Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Corar Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders	m,	Tribunal's o	orders
	18.12	2.2023	
		M.A 734/2023 in O.A	1163/2023
	The I Mum	Director General of Police, bai	Applicants (Ori Respondents)
	1.	Vs. Onkar B. Adake & Ors	Respondents (Ori Applicants)
	2. Tł	ne State of Maharashtra & (	Ors Respondents
	holdi	Heard Ms Swati Manche applicants (Ori Respondents ng for Shri S.S Dere, lear cants.	and Shri U.V Bhosle
	2.	Learned C.P.O request fo	r time.
	3.	S.O to 4.1.2024.	
		Sd/- lha Gadgil) nber (A)	Sd/- (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

ΙN

Original Application No.

of 20

## FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET No.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders	Tribunal's orders	
	O.A. No.830 of 201	<u>7</u>
	S.D. Bhandare Vs.	Applicant
	The State of Maharashtra & Ors.	Respondents
	Heard Shri R.G. Panchal, learn Applicant and Smt. K.S. Gaikwad. Officer for the Respondents.	ed Advocate for the learned Presenting
	2. S.O. to 8.1.2024.	
	(Medha Gadgil) (Mridula E	person

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

ΙN

Original Application No.

of 20

### FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET No.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders	Tribunal's ord	lers
	<u>C.A. No.32 of 2023 in O.</u>	A. No.496 of 2020
	A.B. Baviskar & Ors. Vs.	Applicants
	The State of Maharashtra & Ors.	Respondents
	Heard Shri K.R. Jagdale, Applicant and Smt. Archana l Officer for the Respondents.	learned Advocate for t B.K., learned Presenting
	2. As the respondents have compliance will be done within sile we expect that the respondent statement, as per order dated 11.12	x weeks from 11.12.202 s shall adhere to the
	3. In view of this the CA is dis	sposed off.
	Sd/-	541-
	(Medha Gadgil) (Mrio Member (A)	lula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

18.12.2023

18.12.2023

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

ΙN

Original Application No.

of 20

## FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET No.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders		Tribunal's orders
		O.As. No.815 & 513 of 2017
	S.M. Patil	

H.B. Sonawane & Ors.

.. Applicants

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

..Respondents

Heard Shri Rajiv Deokar, learned Advocate for the Applicant in OA No.815/2017, Shri V.V. Berde, Ld. Advocate for Respondent No.4 in OA No.815/2017, Shri R.G. Panchal, learned Advocate for applicants in OA No.513/2017 and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.

- 2. Shri V.V. Berde, Ld. Advocate for respondent no.4 files sur-rejoinder and the same is taken on record.
- 3. S.O. to 8.1.2024.

Sdl-

(Medha Gadgil)

Member (A) 18.12.2023

Sdl-

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson 18.12.2023

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

### FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET No.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

#### M.A. No.732 of 2023 in O.A. No.619 of 2023

Smt. Anita D. Nargunde & 14 Ors.

..Interveners

And

Ravindra D. Paradhi & Ors.

.Applicants

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

..Respondents

Heard Shri B.A. Bandiwadekar, learned Advocate for the Interveners, Smt. Punam Mahajan, learned Advocate for the Applicants and Smt. K.S. Gaikiwad, learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.

- 2. Ld. Advocate for the Interveners has filed this MA for adding interveners as party respondents in above OA.
- 3. Ld. Advocate for the applicants submits that she has no objection for allowing the MA for intervention.
- 4. MA for intervention is allowed. Interveners be added as party respondents in OA No.619/2023. Applicants in OA No.619/2023 are directed to add the interveners as party respondents in OA No.619/2023. Amendment be carried out within three weeks. MA disposed off accordingly.

54/-

50

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) 18.12.2023

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson 18.12.2023

Office Notes, C	Office Memoranda of Coram,
Appearan	ce, Tribunal's orders or
directions	and Registrar's orders

#### O.A. No.1500 of 2023

S.G. Deokar

.. Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

..Respondents

Heard Smt. Punam Majahan, learned Advocate for the Applicant and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.

- 2. This pertains to cancellation of requirement of Non-Creamy Layer Certificate and the benefit to be given to the present applicant. Ld. Advocate for the applicant prays that one post of Assistant Commissioner, Animal Husbandry be kept vacant. Applicant has secured 116 marks and the topper in Women category has secured 127. Ld. Advocate for the applicant relies on the order dated 30.11.2023 passed by the Nagpur Bench of this Tribunal in OA No.1258/2023. Similarly situated candidate was given interim relief by giving directions to the respondents to keep vacant one post of Assistant Commissioner, Animal Husbandry in open female category.
- 3. Ld. CPO submits that benefit of cancellation was from the date of result of the examination on 22.9.2022 and advertisement in the present case was issued in February 2022. So provisions of GR are not applicable to the present case.
- 4. In view of the said order dated 30.11.2023 and as the applicant is similarly situated, we pass the following order.
- 5. The respondents are directed to keep one post vacant of Assistant Commissioner, Animal Husbandry in the Open (Female) reserved category till next date.
- 6. S.O. to 4.1.2024.

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A)

18.12.2023

SdI-

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson 18.12.2023

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

ΙN

Original Application No.

of 20

## FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET No.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders	Tribunal's orders	
	C.A. No.43/2023 in O.A.	No.32/2023
	A.D. Nargude & Ors. Vs.	Applicants
	The State of Maharashtra & Ors.  With	Respondents
	M.A.No.364/2023 in O.A.	No.619/2023
	The State of Maharashtra & Ors.	Applicants
	R.D. Pardhi & Ors.	Respondents
	Heard Shri B.A. Bandiwadeka the Applicants in CA.43/2023 in OA. Gaikwad, learned Presenting Officer f	.32/2023 and Smt. K.S.
	2. Heard Smt. K.S. Gaikwac Officer for Applicants in MA.364/202 and Smt. Punam Mahajan, learned respondents.	23 in OA No.619/2023
	3. S.O. to 8.1.2024. Interim relidate.	ef to continue till next
	(Medha Gadgil) (Mridula Member (A) Cha	a Bhatkar, J.) airperson 12.2023

Original Application No.	of 20	DISTRICT
		Applicant/s
(Advocate	)	
	versus	
The	State of Maharashtra and	others
		Respondent/s
(Presenting Officer	)	
Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Co Appearance, Tribunal's orders o directions and Registrar's order	r	Tribunal's orders
	18.12.2023	
	<u>o</u>	O.A 1191/2023
	U.B Sankpal	Applicant
	Vs. The State of Mahara	shtra & Ors Respondents
	1. Heard Smt F for the applicant at C.P.O for the Respon	Punam Mahajan, learned advocate nd Ms Swati Manchekar, learned ndents.
	2. Reply is alrea	ady filed.
	3. As the plea counsel for the appl	dings are complete, the learned icant presses for interim relief.
	4. Admit. The point of interim relie	matter is kept for hearing on the ef.
	5. S.O to 3.1.20	024.
	Sd/- (Medha Gadgil) Member (A)	Sd/- (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

#### Tribunal's orders

Date: 18.12.2023

#### O.A.No.998/2023

H.N. Thakur

....Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors. ....Respondents.

- 1. Heard Ms. Punam Mahajan, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Ms. Archana B.K., learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. At the request of learned P.O. adjourned to 04.01.2024 for filing reply.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

#### Tribunal's orders

Date: 18.12.2023

#### O.A.No.1007/2023

G.V. Pawar

....Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors. ....Respondents.

- 1. Heard Mr. K. Upasani, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Learned C.P.O. informs that the Applicant has been retained on the post of S.P. Motor Transport at Pune in the office of Respondent No.3. She seeks time to take further instructions.
- 3. Adjourned to 02.01.2024.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

#### Tribunal's orders

Date: 18.12.2023

## O.A.No.1180/2023 with O.A.No.1133/2023 with O.A.No.1134/2023

R.A. Table & Ors. ....Applicants Vs. The State of Maharashtra & Ors. ....Respondents.

- Heard Mr. Anoop Patil, learned Counsel for 1. Applicants O.A.No.1180/2023 in the O.A.No.1133/2023, Mr. Anoop Patil holding for Mr. A.V. Sakolkar, learned Counsel for the Applicant in O.A.No.1134/2023 and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, Officer for Chief Presenting learned Respondents.
- 2. Learned Counsel has submitted that the interviews were held on 30.08.2023 and 01.09.2023. Learned Counsel pointed out advertisement dated 19.03.2022 wherein Clause 8.2 reads as below:
  - C.२. अनुभव :- Possess experience, gained after acquiring above 8.1 qualification, in the manufacture or testing of drugs or enforcement of the provisions of the Act for a minimum period of five years,
- 3. Adjourned to 02.01.2024.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram,
Appearance, Tribunal's orders or
directions and Registrar's orders

Date: 18.12.2023

#### O.A.No.1205/2023

S.A. Jawale

....Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors. ....Respondents.

- 1. Heard Mr. U.V. Bhosle, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Ms. Archana B.K., learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. At the request of learned P.O. adjourned to 15.01.2024 for filing reply.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Office	Notes, C	Office Memoranda	a of Coram,
$\mathbf{A}_{\mathbf{j}}$	ppearan	ce, Tribunal's ord	lers or
di	rections	and Registrar's	orders

Date: 18.12.2023

#### O.A.No.1280/2023

M.M. Khadtare

....Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors. ....Respondents.

- 1. Heard Ms. Rutuja Khatmode holding for Mr. Talekar, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. At the request of learned P.O. adjourned to 29.01.2024 for filing reply.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram,				
Appearance, Tribunal's orders or				
directions and Registrar's orders				

Date: 18.12.2023

#### O.A.No.1307/2023

R.S. Dhumal

....Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors. ....Respondents.

- 1. Heard Mr. M.D. Lonkar, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. At the request of learned P.O. adjourned to 02.01.2024 for filing reply.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

#### Tribunal's orders

Date: 18.12.2023

#### O.A.No.1309/2023

S.S. Raskar Vs.

....Applicant

The State of Maharashtra & Ors. ....Respondents.

- 1. Heard Ms. Punam Mahajan, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Ms. K.S. Gaikwad, learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Learned Counsel has submitted that the Applicant was found fit for promotion to the post of Tahasildar in the select list. Respondent issued promotion order dated 30.08.2023 in respect of nine persons, but the promotion order of the Applicant was not issued even if though 13 posts were vacant. Respondents are directed to produce the record of DPC.
- 3. Adjourned to 10.01.2024.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

#### Tribunal's orders

#### 18.12.2023

#### M.A 778/2023 in O.A 1434/2023

Shri S.N Dombale & Ors

... Applicants

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors

... Respondents

- 1. Heard Shri B.A Bandiwadekar, learned advocate for the applicants, Ms Swati Manchekar, learned C.P.O for Respondents, Shri M.D Lonkar, learned counsel for Respondent No. 7 and Mrs Punam Mahajan, learned counsel for the Respondents no. 14.
- 2. Learned counsel for the applicants submit that the rules which are made applicable to the Assistant Conservator of Forest as per the judgment of the Hon'ble High Court dated 23.4.2021 in W.P 2026/2019, which is confirmed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in Civil Appeal No. 822/2022, is to be made applicable to the present applicants, working as Range Forest Officers.
- 3. Learned counsel Mrs Punam Mahajan for Respondent No. 14 submitted that in view of the judgment of this Tribunal in O.A 195/2016, which is challenged in W.P 3518/2020 is against the present applicants.
- 4. We direct the Respondents to consider the judgment which are cited by both the sides.
- 5. Learned P.O submits that the Department has considered the judgment of the Hon'ble High Court in W.P 2026/2019, which is distinguished on the basis of rules and which are applicable to the promotion of Range Forest Officers.
- 6. Learned counsel for the applicants submit that meeting of the D.P.C is already held for promotion of Range Forest Officers to the post of Assistant Conservator of Forest and if promotion orders are going to be issued, the applicants will suffer irreparable loss.
- 7. In view of the above, since this matter is regarding seniority and as we are taking matters of the years 2016 & 2017, at present we are unable to hear and give preference to the present matter. Matter will be heard on its own course and no need to prepone the date of the matter.
- 8. M.A is accordingly dismissed.
- 9. O.A 1434/2023 to be placed on Board on 25.1.2024.

Sd/-

Sd/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Akn

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

ΙN

Original Application No.

of 20

## FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET No.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders	Tribunal's orders	
	<u>O.A. No.555 of 2020</u>	
	D.N. Lokhare Vs.	Applicant
	The State of Mahara	shtra & OrsRespondents
	Heard Ms. Madhavi Ayappan holding for Shri V. Ugale, learned Advocate for the Applicant and Ms. S. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.  2. S.O. to 3.1.2024. Part heard.	
	(Medha Gadg Member (A 18.12.2023 (sgj)	) Chairperson

#### 19th MATERY

# AHARASHTRA ADMINISTICATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI

al 200

and No

of 20

## FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

ma Momaranda of Corson. Tellimostis andos s oc of lingistrasis conjun.

Maria ar elegante de la galacteria

#### O.A.1577/2023

A.L. Dure
Vs.
The State of Mah. & Ors.

... Applicant

... Respondents

- 1. Heard Shri Talekar, learned Advocate for the Applicant, Shri A.J. Chougule, learned PO for Respondent Nos.1 to 2 and Shri B.A. Bandiwadekar, learned Advocate for Respondent No.3.
- 2. S.O. to 20th December, 2023.

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson 18.12.2023

# MARASHURA ADMINISTRATIVE TRUETINAL. MUMBAT

of 20

ion (No

11 20

## FARAD COMPINIATION SHIRE NO.

ing Memoranda of Comun. Tribunally writing on 3d Registratify (2004).

Distributional of the observe

#### O.A.730/2023

Dr. R.M. Gangurde Vs. The State of Mah. & Ors.

... Applicant

... Respondents

- 1. Heard Shri P. Bodke-Patil, learned Advocate for the Applicant, Smt. K.S. Gaikwad, learned PO for Respondent Nos.1 to 5 and Shri D.B. Sutar, learned Advocate for Respondent No.6.
- 2. The Applicant who is working as Medical Officer, Group-B at Health Sub Centre, Girnare Nandgaonsado TR, Igatpuri, Nashik challenges the order dated 09.06.2023.
- 3. Learned PO files Affidavit-in-Reply. It is taken on record.
- 4. Matter is fixed on 19th December, 2023.

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson 18.12.2023

# WARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRUSTINAT

of 20

1917 N. W.

of 20

## FARAD CONTINUATION SITERIA NO

ine Memoranda of Coesse, Tilbunally ander, or al Registrants, and p

#### R.A.08/2023 in O.A.462/2022

M.R. Khude & Anr. Vs. The State of Mah. & Ors.

... Applicants

... Respondents

- 1. Heard Smt. Punam Mahajan, learned Advocate for the Applicant and Smt. K.S. Gaikwad, learned PO for Respondents.
- 2. S.O. to 8th January, 2024.

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson 18.12.2023

	MUMBAI	
Original Application No.	of 20	DISTRICT
		Applicant/s
(Advocate	)	
	versus	
The Stat	e of Maharashtra and others	
		Respondent/s
(Presenting Officer	)	
Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram,		
Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders	Tribunal' <b>18.12.2023</b>	s orders
	O.A 564/2023 with M.A 678/20	23 in O.A 564/2023
	Shri Shivaji D. Shelke Vs.	Applicant
	The State of Maharashtra & O	rs Respondents
	1. Heard Smt Punam Ma	haian, learned advocate

- 1. Heard Smt Punam Mahajan, learned advocate for the applicant and Ms Swati Manchekar, learned C.P.O for the Respondents.
- 1. The applicant has filed the present Original Application praying that this Tribunal be pleased to quash and set aside the departmental enquiry initiated by charge sheet dated 15.2.2022 and to release all the pensionary benefits along with interest. Misc Application No. 678/2023 is filed praying that the departmental enquiry initiated by charge sheet dated 15.2.2022 be stayed and the Respondents be restrained from proceeding with the enquiry.
- Pursuant to the order of this Tribunal dated 3.11.2023 short affidavit in reply dated 29.11.2023 is filed by Nitin R. Gadre, Additional Chief Secretary, G.A.D, Mantralaya, Mumbai. By this affidavit in reply, the department has informed the steps taken by G.A.D to expedite the cases in respect of departmental enquiry. He has stated that the delay in disposal of the cases is neither in the interest of the Government servant or in that of the Government. Instructions are issued in order to sensitize the concerned authorities for speedy disposal of pending cases, conducting regular reviews and appointment of contractual Inquiry Officers in different revenue divisions. In the present case, the General Administration Department has issued directions vide letter dated 22.11.2023 to Tribal Development and Agriculture Department for prompt supply of all the necessary documents to the Enquiry Officer and disposal of the case without any further delay. It is mentioned that G.A.D also takes periodical review of the pending cases of departmental enquiries. The copies of minutes of the meeting dated 21.8.2023 and 22.11.2023 are annexed as Exh. R-3 collectively. Learned C.P.O further submitted that G.A.D has developed a dedicated 'Online Departmental Enquiry Module' for tracking the pending cases of departmental inquiries.
- 3. Learned counsel for the applicant submitted that the enquiry is based on Shri Karandikar's report. However, in Shri Karandikar's report there is no allegations made against the applicant, on the basis of which enquiry is initiated. Learned counsel submitted

#### Tribunal's orders

that the Court can go into the report of Shri Karandikar to verify the merit of the enquiry and to stay the enquiry. Learned counsel for the applicant relied on the decision of the Hon'ble Supreme Court dated 16.12.2015, in the case of Prem Nath Bali Vs. Registrar, High Court, Delhi, Civil Appeal No. 958/2010, wherein the Hon'ble Supreme Court observed that the departmental inquiry proceedings once initiated against the delinquent employee within a reasonable time by giving priority to such proceedings and as far as possible it should be concluded within six months as an outer limit. Where it is not possible for the employer to conclude due to certain unavoidable causes arising in the proceedings within the time frame then efforts should be made to conclude within reasonably extended period depending upon the cause and the nature of inquiry but not more than a year.

- Learned C.P.O submitted that the Justice Gaikwad Committee was constituted in March, 2017, pursuant to the order passed by the Hon'ble High Court on 15.4.2014 in W.P 153/2012, to look into the illegalities of the Tribal Development Department during the year 2004 to 2009. Learned C.P.O further submitted that the Government appointed Shri Karandikar Committee vide G.R dated 29.9.2017 to study the report submitted by Hon'ble Justice Gaikwad Committee and submit its findings and recommendations to the Government. Learned C.P.O has submitted that considering the report of the Justice Gaikwad Committee and subsequent study, findings and recommendations of Shri Karandikar Committee, serious allegations were made against the present applicant and the applicant at the relevant time was on deputation as Project Officer, Dahanu in Tribal Development Department during the period Hence the Respondents 13.7.2007 to 1.3.2009. decided to initiate departmental enquiry against the applicant. The report discloses 56 charges against the applicant. Learned C.P.O submitted on instructions that the total alleged misappropriation is of Rs. 3,59,54,917/-. In view of the above, the Tribal Development Department submitted proposal for conducting departmental enquiry against applicant on 14.5.2021 and the proposal was submitted to the Minister on 13.8.2021 and approval was given on 4.2.2022 and the departmental enquiry was initiated by charge sheet dated 15.2.2022. Learned C.P.O submitted that Mr Badan, is appointed as the Enquiry Officer to conduct the enquiry Learned C.P.O further submitted that on 30.11.2023 the applicant remained present and he asked for documents and on 15.12.2023 all the documents were given to the applicant and he was asked to remain present today at 3.00 pm.
  - 5. In view of the above, we direct the Enquiry Officer to conduct the enquiry on day-to-day basis and complete the enquiry and submit the report before 31.3.2024. With the above directions, both the Original Application and Misc Application stands disposed of.

Sd/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) Sd/-(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

#### FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram-Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

#### O.A. No.983 of 2017

K.J. Shinde & Ors.

.. Applicants

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

..Respondents

Heard Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.

- 2. Applicants and their advocate both are absent.
- 3. This OA be kept along with OA No.327/2016.
- 4. S.O. to 12.1.2024.

Sd/-(Medha Gadgil)

Member (A) 18.12.2023 Sd/-(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson 18:12.2023

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

ΙN

Original Application No.

of 20

### FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram.

Appearance, Tribunal's orders or
directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

#### O.A. No.902 of 2022 with O.A. No.1002 of 2022

R.R. Godse

S.P. Deshpande

.. Applicants

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

..Respondents

Heard Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.

- 2. Applicants and Advocate both the absent.
- 3. Both these matters are of the year 2022 and hence we cannot take it now.
- 4. S.O. to 26.2.2024.

Sd/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A)

18.12.2023

Sd/-(Mridula Bhatkar, J.)

Chairperson 18.12.2023

#### at MATER E

## IN THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

ΙN

Original Application No.

of 20

#### FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram. Appearance, Tribuna's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

O.As. No.1169/2022, 483/2023, 726/2023, 894/2023, 895/2023, 896/2023 with 612/2023

K.A. Devkate & Ors.

..Applicants

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

..Respondents

Heard Shri B.A. Bandiwadekar holding for Shri S.S. Dere & Shri R.V. Shinde, learned Advocate for the Applicants and Smt. K.S. Gaikwad, learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.

2. At the request of Ld. Advocate for the applicants adjourned to 8.1.2024.

Sd/-(Medha Gadgil) Sd/-

(Medha Gadgil Member (A) 18.12.2023 (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

18.12.2023

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

or 30

## FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram.

Appearance, Tribunal's orders or
directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

#### C.A. No.56 of 2023 in O.A. No.614 of 2014

D.E. Hirde

..Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

..Respondents

Heard Smt. K.S. Gaikwad, learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.

- 2. Ld. PO submits that W.P. (St.) No.28116/2023 has been filed in the Hon'ble High Court.
- 3. S.O. to 26.2.2024.

Sd/-

(Medha Gadgil)

Member (A) 18.12.2023

Sd/-

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

18.12.2023

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

## FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram.

Appearance, Tribunal's orders or
directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

#### C.A. No.80 of 2023 in O.A. No.729 of 2019

Dr. S.V. Patil

..Applicant

 $V_{S}$ .

The State of Manarashtra & Ors.

..Respondents

Heard Shri V.P. Potbhare, learned Advocate for the Applicant and Smt. Archana B.K., learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.

- 2. None is present from the office of MPSC. Ld. PO submits that she has not received any instructions from the MPSC. In view of this issue contempt notice to Secretary, MPSC returnable on 16.1.2024.
- 3. S.O. to 16.1.2024.

Sd/-

(Medha Gadgil)

Member (A)

18.12.2023

Sd/-

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

18.12.2023

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

### FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

#### CA No.84/2023 in OA No.168/2018

A.V. Patil

..Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

..Respondents

Heard Shri A.A. Gharte, learned Advocate for the Applicant and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.

- 2. Issue contempt notice to respondents no.1 & 2 returnable on 9.1.2024.
- 3. S.O. to 9.1.2024.

Sd/(Medha Gadgil)

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) 18.12.2023 Sd/-(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson 18.12.2023

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

### FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Corum. Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

C.A. No.107 of 2023 in O.A. No.233 of 2023

V.H. Shelke

..Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

..Respondents

Heard Shri B.A. Bandiwadekar, learned Advocate for the Applicant and Shri A.J. Chougule, learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.

- 2. Ld. Advocate for the applicant submits that the matter is pending in the Hon ble High Court.
- 3. S.O. to 12.2.2024.

Sd/-(Medha Gadgil)

Member (A) 18.12.2023 Sd/-(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson 18.12.2023

Original Application No.	of 20	DISTRICT
		Applicant/s
(Advocate	)	
	versus	
The Stat	e of Maharashtra	and others
		Respondent/s
(Presenting Officer		)
Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders		Tribunal's orders
	18.12.2023	
	M.A 6	07/2022 in O.A 465/2020
,	G.Y Deshpande V The State of Mal	
		sent for the applicant. Heard Ms Swati ned C.P.O for the Respondents.
2. Matter ac		ljourned to 10.1.2024.
	Sd/- (Medha Gadgil) Member (A)	Sd/- (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

of 20	Di	STRICT Applicant/s			
)		Application			
versus					
te of Maharasht	ra and others				
		Respondent/s			
••••••	)				
Tribunal's orders		orders			
18.12.2023					
M.A 704/20	23 in M.A 340/202	3 in O.A 1072/2022			
Satish G.Ram		Applicant			
The State of I		Respondents			
<ol> <li>Learned C.P.O submits that copy of M.A and O.A is not served on the Respondents.</li> <li>Learned counsel is directed to serve copy of the Misc Application and Original Application to the Respondents before the next date.</li> <li>If at all the copies of both the M.A and O.A is not served on the Respondents, the Applications will be dismissed.</li> </ol>					
			5. S.O to	7.1.2024.	
			Sd/- (Medha Gadg Member (A)	gil) (	Sd/- <b>Mridula Bhatkar, J</b> . <u>)</u> <b>Chairperson</b>
t	versus  te of Maharasht  18.12.2023  M.A 704/20  Satish G.Ram The State of Manche  1. None Swati Manche  2. Learn O.A is not ser  3. Learn Misc Applica Respondents  4. If at a not served or be dismissed  5. S.O to  Sd/- (Medha Gada Member (A)	wersus  te of Maharashtra and others  Tribunal's of  18.12.2023  M.A 704/2023 in M.A 340/202  Satish G.Ramugade Vs. The State of Maharashtra & Ors  1. None present for the a Swati Manchekar, learned C.P.O  2. Learned C.P.O submits to O.A is not served on the Respond  3. Learned counsel is directed Misc Application and Original Respondents before the next date  4. If at all the copies of both not served on the Respondents, be dismissed.  5. S.O to 17.1.2024.  Sd/- (Medha Gadgil) Member (A)			

Original Application No.	of 20	District Applicant/s
(Advocate	)	
	versus	
The State	of Maharashtra and o	others
		Respondent/s
(Presenting Officer	)	
Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders	Tribunal's orders	
	18.12.2023	
	M.A 701/2	023 in O.A 870/2021
	A.R Ishware & Ors Vs.	Applicants
	The State of Maharas	htra & Ors Respondents
		.V Waghmare, learned advocate I Ms Swati Manchekar, learned lents.
	prayer to reconstruct	tion filed with regard to first the service record on the basis of by the applicants on affidavit is
	3. Learned couns all the Respondents a	sel for the applicants submit that re served.
	directed to report to to the record of the arespondents to representation/propo 20.3.2023 by the Education of the 13.10.2016 sent by Services (Malaria), M. Respondent No. 5, be	Respondent no 8 to the Joint Filaria) and also proposal for services of the applicants dated the Assistant Director, Health umbai Division, Navi Mumbai to fore the next date. We also direct remain present on the next date.
	Sd/- (Medha Gadgil)	Sd/- (Mridula Bhatkar, J.)
	Member (A)	(Mridula Bhatkar, 5.) Chairperson

Original Application No.	of 20	District Applicant
(Advocate	)	Tippheant
	versus	
The State	e of Maharashtra and othe	rs
		Respondent
(Presenting Officer	)	
Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders	Tribu	unal's orders
	18.12.2023	
	M.A 591/2023	in O.A 731/2023
	K.B. Chandel & Ors Vs. The State of Maharashtra	Applicants & Ors Respondents
1. None present for the applicant K.S Gaikwad, learned P.O for the Respo		
	2. Learned P.O submits that reply is filed original Application and they are adopting the same reply to the present Misc Application.	
	3. S.O to 3.1.2024.	
	Sd/- (Medha Gadgil) Member (A)	Sd/- (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson