ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO 784/2022 (Shri Jitesh P. Wagh Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM:Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora,
Vice Chairman
AND
Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)DATE:16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri Sandeep D. Munde, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities.

2. It is the grievance of the applicant in the present application that the norms of selection are relaxed insofar as the educational qualification is concerned after the entire selection process was completed. The learned counsel for the applicant submitted that in similar set of facts and circumstances this Tribunal, as well as, the principal seat of this Tribunal at Mumbai have granted the interim relief as were prayed in the said matters. The learned counsel in the circumstances in the present matter also prayed for same relief. It is pointed out that the educational qualification which was mentioned in the advertisement and on the basis of which the applications were invited and the entire process was carried out has been changed thereafter, which has resulted in depriving the candidates like the present applicant from getting the subject post. The learned counsel in the circumstances has prayed for interim relief as was granted in O.A. No. 547/2022 and O.A. ST. No. 1109/2022...

3. The learned Chief Presenting Officer has sought time for filing the affidavit in reply. The learned C.P.O. submits that for want of instructions nothing can be submitted on behalf of the respondents.

4. After having gone through the documents filed on record there appears prima-facie case in favour of the applicant. Hence the following order :-

<u>O R D E R</u>

1. Issue notice to respondents, returnable on 20.10.2022.

2. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.

3. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

4. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

5. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicant is directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.

6. In the meanwhile if recommendation is made by the M.P.S.C. of any candidate giving relaxation in the educational qualification as contained in the letter dated 15.9.2021, the recommendation of the said candidate/s shall be subject to final outcome of the present O.A.

- 7. S.O. to 20.10.2022.
- 8. Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO 817/2022 (Shri Vishnu B. Jaybhaye Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u> :	Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
<u>DATE</u> :	16.9.2022
ORAL OR	DER :

Heard Shri S.A. Deshmukh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri N.U. Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities.

2. The learned counsel for the applicant on instructions seeks leave to withdraw the present Original Application to facilitate the applicant to prefer the departmental appeal before the appellate authority. In view of the submission so made the following order is passed :-

<u>O R D E R</u>

The applicant is permitted to withdraw the present Original Application with liberty as prayed for. No order as to costs.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO 821/2022 (Dr. Sonali B. Totod Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u> :	Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A
<u>DATE</u> :	16.9.2022
ORAL OF	EDER :

Heard Shri J.S. Deshmukh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities.

2. The learned counsel for the applicant submits that the condition as has been imposed of having experience of working for one year on the post of Senior Resident in the concerned subject cannot be made applicable insofar as Pathology is concerned. In similar circumstances this Tribunal has already granted interim relief in favour of the similarly placed candidates earlier. We need not to make any elaborate discussion since we are convinced that the applicant has made out the prima-facie case and criteria of having experience of working as Senior Resident cannot be made applicable for the subject of Pathology. Hence the following order :-

<u>O R D E R</u>

1. Respondent MPSC is directed to call the present applicant also for interview and keep the result of the said candidate in sealed cover. In the meanwhile if any appointments are made to the post of Assistant Professor in the subject of Pathology, the same shall be subject to outcome of the present O.A.

2. Issue notice to respondents, returnable on 10.10.2022.

3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.

4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

6. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicant is directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.

7. S.O. to 10.10.2022.

8. The learned PO is directed to communicate this order to the concerned since interviews are scheduled.

9. Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022 VICE CHAIRMAN

::-2-::

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO 822/2022 (Dr. Jyoti A. Dawale Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u> :	Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)	
<u>DATE</u> :	16.9.2022	
ORAL ORDER :		

Heard Shri J.S. Deshmukh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities.

2. It is the grievance of the applicant that for 2 days' short experience than prescribed in the advertisement the applicant has been deprived of contesting for appointment on the post of Assistant Professor. The learned counsel pointed out that the applicant is having the working experience of 363 days, whereas the experience clause provides the experience for one year. The learned counsel in the circumstances has prayed for interim relief as prayed in the application.

3. The learned C.P.O. has sought time to seek instructions and to file affidavit in reply.

4. It is true that for the said post it has been prescribed that the candidate concerned must have the experience of working on the post of Senior Resident for one year in the concerned subject. The applicant has filed on record the experience certificates, which demonstrates that the applicant has worked on the post of Senior Resident at SRTR Government Medical College, Ambajogai during the

period between 1.8.2018 to 30.1.2019 and thereafter from 1.2.2019 to 30.7.2019. If the days are counted, the applicant has worked for 363 days. In two appointments one daybreak was given to the applicant and in the second spell he was relieved one day earlier and thus 2 days fall short for the period of one year. It appears to us that it would be too technical approach to reject the candidature of the applicant on the aforesaid ground. The applicant has also placed on record the certificate of experience for the post held by her as Assistant Professor in the same Government Medical College. As per the said certificate the applicant is working as Assistant Professor from 23.2.2019 till the date of her making application for the subject post. Though the applicant had worked on the post of Assistant Professor on the basis of temporary appointment the said experience has to be taken into account. It appears to us that the applicant has certainly made out a prima-facie case in her favour. We are therefore inclined to pass the following order :-

ORDER

1. Issue notice to respondents, returnable on 10.10.2022.

2. Respondent no. 3 the MPSC is directed to call the present applicant also for interview and keep the result of the sand candidate in sealed cover. In the meanwhile if any appointment is made to the post of Assistant Professor in the subject of Obstetrics and Gynecology, the same shall be subject to outcome of the present O.A.

3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.

4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case

::-2-::

would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

6. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicant is directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.

7. S.O. to 10.10.2022.

8. The learned CPO is directed to communicate this order to the concerned since interviews are scheduled.

9. Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

M.A. NO. 377/2022 IN O.A. NO. 616/2022 (Seema Ajij Shaikh & Anr. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A) <u>DATE</u>: 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Sandeep Munde, learned Counsel for the applicants and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. The present Misc. Application is filed for adding the name of some persons as respondents in the accompanying O.A. It is pointed out that these persons have been benefitted because of the relaxation granted by the respondents after selection process was completed.

3. The learned C.P.O. has submitted for passing appropriate order. In the circumstances, we pass the following order :-

<u>O R D E R</u>

(i) The present application is allowed.

(ii) The necessary amendment be carried out in the accompanying O.A. forthwith.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

O.A. NO. 616/2022

(Seema Ajij Shaikh & Anr. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Sandeep Munde, learned Counsel for the applicants and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. Issue notices to the added respondents, returnable on 31.10.2022.

3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.

4. Applicants is authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

6. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicants is directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.

7. S.O. to 31.10.2022.

8. The interim relief granted earlier to continue till then. The learned CPO shall file the affidavit in the present matter on or before the next date.

9. Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 547/2022 (Shri Ganesh S. Chavan Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

DATE : 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Amol B. Chalak, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. The learned Chief Presenting Officer has sought time for filing the affidavit in reply of the respondents. Time granted.

3. S.O. to 20.10.2022.

4. The interim relief granted earlier to continue till then. The learned CPO shall file the affidavit in the present matter on or before the next date.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO 825/2022 (Smt. Pallavi V. Alaspure & Ors. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- <u>DATE</u> : 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.R. Borulkar, learned Counsel for the applicants and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. The learned Chief Presenting Officer has sought time for filing the affidavit in reply of the respondents. Time granted.

3. S.O. to 20.10.2022.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION ST. NO 1545/2022 (Shri Vikram V. Mhaske & Ors. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A) DATE : 16.9.2022

<u>DATE</u> : 10.9.202

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.R. Borulkar, learned Counsel for the applicants and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. The learned Chief Presenting Officer has sought time for filing the affidavit in reply of the respondents. Time granted.

3. S.O. to 20.10.2022.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO 828/2022 (Shri Shailendra G. Sasane Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM :Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora,
Vice Chairman
AND
Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)DATE :16.9.2022ORAL ORDER :

Shri V.B. Wagh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. It is the grievance of the applicant in the present Original Application that the PSI grade granted to the applicant has been withdrawn vide order passed on 13.9.2022 on the ground that the departmental enquiry is pending against the applicant. The criteria for granting PSI grade is brought to our notice. It is the contention of the learned counsel that all the necessary aspects were considered while awarding PSI grade to the applicant. It is pointed out that the departmental enquiry has not yet been completed. The learned counsel submitted that withdrawing of PSI grade awarded to the applicant would amount to imposing the punishment on the applicant even before conclusion of the said enquiry. It is further contended that PSI Grade is ordinarily given on the length of service and the conduct of the applicant during the relevant period. These aspects were considered in the meeting of the Departmental Promotion Committee. The learned counsel in the circumstances has prayed for staying the operation of the impugned order till disposal of the present O.A.

::-2-:: **O.A. NO 828/2022**

3. The learned Chief Presenting Officer submits that within one week the affidavit in reply will be filed pertaining to interim relief. Time as prayed for is granted.

4. In the circumstances, S.O. to 23.9.2022, till then Status-quo as on today be maintained.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

C.P. NO. 43/2018 WITH M.A. 364/2019 IN O.A. 838/2015 WITH O.A. NO. 122/2018 (S.B.) WITH O.A. NO. 558/2018 (S.B.) WITH O.A. NO. 376/2019 (Shri Ramdas T. Patil Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri R.P. Bhumkar, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities.

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

2. Contempt Petition No. 43/2018 is arising out of order passed by this Tribunal in O.A. No. 838/2015. The operative order reads as under :-

"<u>O R D E R</u>

(i) O.A. is allowed.

(ii) Respondents are directed to consider the case of the applicant for grant of time bound promotion pay sale as prayed for in view of the various G.Rs. referred in the O.A.

(iii) Decision in this regard shall be taken within 3 months from the date of this order and be communicated to the applicant in writing.

(iv) It is needless to mention that the applicant will be entitled to arrears, if any, if he is found eligible for such time bound promotion pay scale.

(v) In the circumstances, there shall be no order as to costs."

::-2-:: <u>C.P. NO. 43/2018 WITH M.A.</u> <u>364/2019 IN O.A. 838/2015</u>

3. In C.P. it is the contention of the applicant that the authorities concerned have not obeyed the order passed by this Tribunal and have wrongly rejected the claim of the applicant vide order dated 1.6.2017. During the course of hearing it is brought to our notice that the said order dated 1.6.2017 has been challenged by the applicant in O.A. No. 122/2018. Having regard to the facts as aforesaid it does not appear to us that the present Contempt Petition shall be prosecuted any further. It has to be stated that the directions given by the Tribunal in O.A. No. 838/2015 were to decide the case of the applicant on the basis of Circulars etc. The respondents according to their own interpretation have decided the case of the applicant. If the same is not decided in favour of the applicant it does not mean that there is willful disobedience of the impugned order and more so when the applicant has filed fresh O.A. challenging the order dated 1.6.2017. Therefore we do not see any valid reason to keep pending the C.P.

4. While deciding the fresh O.A. filed by the applicant bearing O.A. No. 122/2018 if it is noticed that the authorities concerned, who were supposed to decide the representation of the applicant had taken an apparently wrong decision without considering the legal position existing at the relevant time and have deliberately rejected the said representation, the conduct of the concerned respondents would be certainly looked into by the Tribunal and the interpretation drawn by the them was wrong, cognizance of the same will be taken after deciding O.A. No. 122/2018.

::-3-:: <u>C.P. NO. 43/2018 WITH M.A.</u> <u>364/2019 IN O.A. 838/2015</u>

5. In the circumstances, the present C.P. stands disposed of with the observations as aforesaid. When the C.P. itself is disposed of M.A. No. 364/2019 filed by the applicant with a prayer to direct the Registry of this Tribunal to exercise the power U/ss 195 and 340 of Cr.P.C. and register the offence U/ss 181, 188, 199 and 166 and other provisions under IPC against the respondents, automatically stands disposed of.

6. It is the contention of the applicant the allegations in M.A. No. 364/2019 are of the serious nature and having nexus with the original dispute. If this be so, the same grievance can be raised by the applicant in O.A. No. 122/2018 also.

 O.A. No. 122/2018 (S.B.) WITH O.A. No. 558/2018
 (S.B.) WITH O.A. No. 376/2019 be placed for hearing on 14.10.2022.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO 225/2022 (Shri Sanjaykumar N. Deshatwar Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri K..B. Jadhav, learned Counsel for the applicant and Smt. Sanjivani Deshmukh Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. The learned counsel has sought time for filing the rejoinder affidavit of the applicant. Time granted.

3. S.O. to 10.11.2022.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO 264/2022 (Shri Ganesh P. Jagtap Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A) DATE : 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri V.B. Wagh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. The learned Presenting Officer has tendered across the bar the affidavit in reply of respondent no. 1. It is taken on record and copy thereof has been supplied to other side.

3. S.O. to 10.11.2022 for filing rejoinder, if any, by the applicant.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO 387/2022 (Smt. Ashwini S. Jadhav & Ors. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- **<u>DATE</u>** : 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri R.B. More, learned Counsel for the applicants and Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. The learned Presenting Officer has sought time for filing the affidavit in reply of the respondents. Time granted.

3. S.O. to 9.11.2022.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO 533/2022 (Shri Sunil N. Jahagirdar Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A) DATE : 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri V.B. Wagh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. The learned Presenting Officer has tendered across the bar the affidavit in reply of respondent nos. 1 & 2. It is taken on record and copy thereof has been supplied to other side.

3. S.O. to 10.11.2022 for filing rejoinder affidavit, if any, by the applicant.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO 535/2022 (Shri Adikrao S. Mane Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri V.B. Wagh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri D.R. Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. The learned Presenting Officer has tendered across the bar the affidavit in reply of respondent no. 2. It is taken on record and copy thereof has been supplied to other side.

3. S.O. to 10.11.2022 for filing rejoinder affidavit, if any, by the applicant.

3. S.O. to 10.11.2022.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO 568/2022 (Smt. Shivkanta J. Honwajkar Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri B.G. Deshmukh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

- 2. Await Service.
- 3. S.O. to 9.11.2022.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO 569/2022 (Shri Aniruddha N. Jondhale Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri B.G. Deshmukh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

- 2. Await Service.
- 3. S.O. to 9.11.2022.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

M.A. 600/2019 IN O.A. 992/2019 (Shri Dasrao T. Deshpande Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Anant Devkate, learned Counsel for the applicant and Smt. M.S. Patni, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. The learned counsel has sought time for filing the rejoinder affidavit of the applicant. Time granted.

3. S.O. to 3.11.2022.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

M.A. 332/2022 IN O.A. 742/2022 (Shri Ram H. Navtakke Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.9.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.V. Lavte, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri N.U. Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

- 2. Await Service.
- 3. S.O. to 3.11.2022.

MEMBER (A) ARJ ORAL ORDERS 16.9-2022

M.A. No. 58/2022 in O.A. St. No. 221/2022 (Sindu B. Wanve & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri Alkesh Jadhav, learned Advocate holding for Shri J.M. Murkute, learned Advocate for the applicants and Shri N.U. Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicants, S.O. to 21.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 513 OF 2022 (Vikram S. Vairale V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

_____ **OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS** _____

> CORAM : Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) DATE : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri D.S. Kulkarni, learned Advocate holding for Shri Akshay Kulkarni, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 10.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

.

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 688 OF 2022 (Ashok K. Ghuge V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Smt. Amruta Paranjape-Menezes, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 24.09.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 697 OF 2022 (Mohammad Shahejada Mohammad Sultan V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u> : Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri G.N. Kulkarni, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri D.R. Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 19.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 718 OF 2022 (Shankar F. Pawar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM : Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri K.B. Jadhav, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri I.S. Thorat, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. Issue notice to the respondents, returnable on 20.10.2022.

3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.

4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

6. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicant is directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.

- 7. S.O. to 20.10.2022.
- 8. Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 823 OF 2022 (Manoj M. Jadhav V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM : Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.H. Dhupe, learned Advocate for the applicant (**Absent**). Heard Smt. Sanjivani K. Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. As none present for the applicant, S.O. to 13.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 827 OF 2022 (Dr. Pramod Y. Sonawane V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri Vinod Patil, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. The present Original application is filed challenging the impugned transfer order of the applicant dated 02.09.2022 (Annexure A-6) issued by the respondent No. 4 i.e. Chief Executive Officer, Zilla Parishad, Nandurbar, whereby the applicant has been temporarily transferred from his present posting of Medical Officer, Group-B, Primary Health Centre, Kahatul, Tq. Shahada, Dist. Nandurbar to Primary Health Centre, Zapi, Tq. Dhadgaon, Dist. Nandurabar.

3. The applicant was initially appointed on 18.08.2008 as Ad-hoc Medical Officer at Amboli PHC, Dist. Sindhudurga. Thereafter, vide G.R. dated 20.07.2019 (Annexure A-1) the applicant was absorbed in the cadre of Medical Officer, Group-B and was posted at Primary Health Centre, Moramba, Tq. Akkalkuwa, Dist. Nandurbar. He worked there till he was transferred vide transfer order dated 24.09.2021 (Annexure A-2) to PHC Mandane, Tq. Shahada, Dist. Nandurbar, which was stated to be temporary

//2// O.A. No. 827/2022

transfer. This order was issued by the respondent No. 4 i.e. the CEO, Zilla Parishad, Nandurbar. Thereafter, by the order dated 17.05.2022 (Annexure A-4), the applicant was again temporarily transferred to PHC Kahatul, Tq. Shahada, Dist. Nandurbar, which is also issued by the respondent No. 4. While the applicant was working there, by the impugned transfer order dated 02.09.2022 (Annexure A-6) issued by the Chief Executive Officer, Zilla Parishad, Nandurbar, the applicant has been temporarily transferred from Primary Health Centre, Kahatul, Tq. Shahada, Dist. Nandurbar to Primary Health Centre, Zapi, Tq. Dist. Nandurabar and it is under Dhadgaon, challenge. The applicant is seeking stay to the execution and implementation of the said transfer order contending that he has not handed over the charge of his post till today.

4. The learned Advocate for the applicant submitted that the impugned order of transfer is issued by the respondent No. 4 without any lawful authority, as the powers of transfer of Medical Officers vested in CEO, Zilla Parishad are being withdrawn by the State Government vide G.R. dated 28.03.2012 (Annexure A-7). Moreover, by frequently temporary transfer orders, the applicant and his family have been disturbed. He further submitted that the power to transfer the Medical Officer. Group-B vests in the State Government as is reflected in the transfer order of one Dr. K.L. Pargaonkar vide order dated 31.05.2011

//3// O.A. No. 827/2022

(page No. 32 of the paper book) issued by the Public Health Department, Maharashtra State.

5. Learned Chief Presenting Officer appeared on behalf of the respondents and submitted that he has not yet received any instructions as to whether the applicant has been relieved from his present posting or not and he would seek instructions in that regard. Therefore, he seeks issuance of the notices.

6. After having considered the Original Application and annexures thereof, it is evident that the applicant as on the date of transfer by the impugned order dated 02.09.2022 (Annexure A-6) was working in the cadre of Medical Officer, Group-B on regular basis, as he has been regularized / absorbed in that cadre vide G.R. dated 20.07.2019 (Annexure A-1). From the facts on record, it would reveal that the applicant has been frequently transferred on temporary basis.

7. The applicant has raised objection to the authority of respondent No. 4, who issued the impugned transfer order and relied upon the G.R. dated 28.03.2012 (Annexure A-7). Perusal of the said G.R. would show that the powers vested in CEO, Zilla Parishad for transfer of the permanent Medical Officers and appointment of BAMS Medical Officer on temporary basis are withdrawn. The applicant belongs to category of permanent / regular Medical Officer, Group-B. Perusal of the impugned order does not show that any complaints were received against the

//4// O.A. No. 827/2022

applicant as regards his working at PHC, where he was working. In such a case also the permission of the State Government would be necessary. No such permission is reflected in the impugned transfer order of the applicant. There is mention in the impugned order that the applicant was temporarily transferred, but no specific period is mentioned and therefore, it cannot be irresistible inferred that parameters applicable for transfer of Medical Officer will not be applicable.

8. Learned C.P.O. submits that it is not the transfer order, but the applicant has been posted at the present posting till further orders due to administrative exigencies.

9. However, it is to be seen as to whether such administrative power vests in the CEO, Zilla Parishad in terms of G.R. dated 28.03.2012 (Annexure A-7), whereby the powers of CEO, Zilla Parishad are withdrawn. In such circumstances, prima-facie, the impugned order of transfer dated 02.09.2022 (Annexure A-6) comes in the teeth of the G.R. dated 28.03.2012 (Annexure A-7). Therefore, the interim relief of stay to the execution and implementation of the said impugned transfer order of the applicant is required to be granted till filing of the affidavit in reply by the respondents. It is ordered accordingly.

10. Issue notice to the respondents, returnable on 19.10.2022.

//5// O.A. No. 827/2022

11. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.

12. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

13. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

14. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicant is directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.

15. S.O. to 19.10.2022.

16. Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

KBP ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION ST. NO. 357 OF 2020 (Sanjay D. Bodade V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri S.G. Kulkarni, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. M.S. Patni, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 03.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

M.A. St. No. 570/2022 in O.A. St. No. 571/2022 (Ashok G. Jondhale & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri Vinod Patil, learned Advocate holding for Shri H.V. Patil, learned Advocate for the applicants and Smt. Sanjivani K. Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicants, S.O. to 20.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 133 OF 2021 (Balasaheb A. Chivate V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

_____ **OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS** _____

> CORAM : Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) DATE : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Smt. Suchita Dhongde, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Sanjivani K. Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

At the request of learned Advocate for the 2. applicant, S.O. to 21.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 190 OF 2021 (Pratibha M. Bankar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Shri R.M. Jade, learned Advocate for the applicant (**Absent**). Heard Smt. M.S. Patni, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent Nos. 1 & 2 and Shri V.P. Narwade, learned Advocate holding for Smt. Manjushri Narwade, learned Advocate for respondent Nos. 3 to 5.

2. As none present for the applicant for the applicant, S.O. to 19.10.2022 for passing necessary order.

KBP ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 301 OF 2021 (D.P. Jadhav V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri C.R. More, learned Advocate holding for Shri G.J. Pahilwan, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri N.U. Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 20.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 444 OF 2021 (Shivkumar A. Pohal V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

_____ **OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS** _____

> CORAM : Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) DATE : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri M.S. Chaudhari, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 18.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

.

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 461 OF 2021 (Dr. Madhav B. Shinde V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri Shamsunder B. Patil, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Sanjivani K. Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. The Original Application filed present is challenging the impugned transfer order dated 09.08.2021 (Annexure A-3) issued by the respondent No. 1 to the extent of respondent No. 6 i.e. Dr. Dhananjay Kondiram Savant, Medical Officer, who is transferred from Primary Health Centre, Chapoli, Taluka Chakur, Dist. Latur to Mobile Medical Unit, Latur. In Latur there is only one post of Medical Officer at Mobile Medical Unit, which is presently held by the applicant. The applicant was posted in Mobile Medical Unit, Latur vide Government order dated 13.06.2016 (Annexure A-1) on the post which became vacant by transfer of Dr. Kanade. According to the applicant, there is no another post of Medical Officer in Mobile Medical Unit at Latur.

3. Learned Advocate for the applicant submitted that during pendency of the present Original Application, vide order date 18.05.2022 issued by the

//2// O.A. No. 461/2021

District Civil Surgeon, Latur, the applicant has been relieved from his present posting for enabling him to prosecute the higher studies of M.D. PCM in Vilasrao Deshmukh Government Medical College and Hospital, Latur and therefore, the applicant has been relieved thereof. Copy of the said order is taken on record and marked as document 'X' for the purpose of identification.

4. In view of above-said development, the grievance raised by the applicant in the present O.A. is redressed. Hence, the O.A. stands disposed of, as the grievance is being redressed. There shall be no order as to costs.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 648 OF 2021 (Dr. Usha N. Bholane V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.P. Gase, learned Advocate for the applicant (**Leave Note**). Heard Shri N.U. Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent Nos. 1 to 4. Shri N.R. Dayama, learned Advocate for respondent No. 5, **absent**.

2. In view of leave note filed by the learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 13.10.2022 for admission.

MEMBER (J)

T.A. No. 08/2022 (W.P. No. 3060/2022) (Kailas P. Yarmurwad V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri Dhananjay Mane, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Chief Presenting Officer, time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondents, if any.

3. S.O. to 12.10.2022 for admission.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 157 OF 2022 (Ravindra P. Bahadare V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri S.D. Joshi, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri N.U. Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. Pleadings are complete. The present matter is pertaining to regularization of suspension period in view of the acquittal of the applicant in criminal prosecution. Hence, the O.A. is admitted and it be fixed for final hearing on 20.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 484 OF 2022 (Jayendra P. Ahire V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri Vinod Patil, learned Advocate holding for Shri S.U. Chaudhari, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 03.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 580 OF 2022 (Ramhari G. Sontakke V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM :Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE :16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri K.G. Salunke, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. Learned Advocate for the applicant filed rejoinder affidavit. Same is taken on record and copy thereof has been served on the other side.

3. S.O. to 19.10.2022 for admission.

MEMBER (J)

M.A. No. 266/2021 in O.A. St. No. 942/2021 (Mangilal N. Shirsath V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Smt. Suchita A. Dhongde, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. M.S. Patni, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. The present matter has already been treated as part heard.

3. Learned Advocate for the applicant filed additional affidavit in M.A. Same is taken on record and copy thereof has been served on the other side.

4. Learned Presenting Officer filed affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent Nos. 2 & 3 in O.A. Same is taken on record and copy thereof has been served on the other side.

5. S.O. to 07.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 427 OF 2019 (Ranjeet S. Savale (Dhangar) V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri S.D. Dhongde, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. The present matter has already been treated as part heard.

3. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 29.09.2022.

KBP ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

MEMBER (J)

O.A. Nos. 1015, 1016, 1017 & 1019 all of 2019 (Sakharam P. Ranbavle & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri K.B. Jadhav, learned Advocate for the applicants in all these O.As. and Shri D.R. Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents in all these O.As.

2. The present matters have already been treated as part heard.

3. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, S.O. to 30.09.2022.

KBP ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 698 OF 2017 (Jalamsing D. Valvi V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri S.D. Dhongde, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri N.U. Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 30.09.2022 for final hearing.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 479 OF 2021 (Lotan D. Vishi V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri Saket Joshi, learned Advocate holding for Shri Avinash Deshmukh, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent No. 1.

2. Today Shri Yogesh M. Patil, learned Advocate appeared on behalf of respondent No. 2 and submitted that he is going to file **Vakalatnama** on or before the next date of hearing.

3. In these circumstances, one more last chance is granted to the respondents for filing affidavit in reply.

4. S.O. to 12.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

M.A. No. 368/2021 in O.A. No. 655/2021 (Dnyaneshwar K. Khandagale V/s. Shankar S. Kale & Anr.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIE

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM :Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE :16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri A.D. Gadekar, learned Advocate for the applicant in the present M.A., Shri D.R. Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent No. 2 in the present M.A. / respondent No. 1 in O.A. and Shri V.B. Wagh, learned Advocate for respondent No. 1 in the present M.A. / applicant in O.A.

2. Learned Advocate for the applicant filed withdrawal pursis signed by the applicant seeking withdrawal of the present M.A. It is taken on record and marked as document 'X' for the purpose of identification.

3. I have no reason to refuse the permission for withdrawal of the present M.A. Hence, permission is granted. The M.A. No. 368/2021 stands disposed of as withdrawn with no order as to costs.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 665 OF 2021 (Shankar S. Kale V/s. The Sub Divisional Magistrate)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri V.B. Wagh, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri D.R. Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent.

2. At the request of learned P.O., time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent.

3. S.O. to 18.10.2022. Status quo granted earlier to continue till then.

KBP ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 714 OF 2022 with Caveat 28/2022 (Vishwanath B. Nath V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri K.G. Salunke, learned Advocate for the applicant, Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent No. 1 and Shri J.B. Choudhary, learned Advocate for respondent No. 2.

2. Learned Advocate for the applicant filed rejoinder affidavit. Same is taken on record and copy thereof has been served on the other sides.

3. S.O. to 03.10.2022 for admission.

KBP ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 646 OF 2022 (Dr. Deelip R. Tandale V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

_____ **OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS** _____

CORAM : Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) DATE : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri P.R. Tandale, learned Advocate for the applicant, Smt. Sanjivani K. Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent Nos. 1 and 2 and Shri Vishnu Kande, learned Advocate holding for Shri Ajinkya Reddy, learned Advocate for respondent No. 3.

2. At the request made on behalf of respondents, time is granted for filing affidavit in reply.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 647 OF 2022 (Dr. Manik S. Madke V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri P.R. Tandale, learned Advocate for the applicant, Smt. Sanjivani K. Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent Nos. 1 and 2 and Shri Vishnu Kande, learned Advocate holding for Shri Ajinkya Reddy, learned Advocate for respondent No. 3.

2. At the request made on behalf of respondents, time is granted for filing affidavit in reply.

3. S.O. to 21.10.2022.

KBP ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

MEMBER (J)

M.A. No. 202/2022 in O.A. St. No. 781/2022 (Dr. Yogesh M. Borse V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Ms. Preeti Wankhade, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. M.S. Patni, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondents in M.A.

3. S.O. to 20.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

M.A. No. 203/2022 in O.A. St. No. 783/2022 (Dr. Smita A. Bora V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Ms. Preeti Wankhade, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri I.S. Thorat, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondents in M.A.

3. S.O. to 20.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

M.A. No. 204/2022 in O.A. St. No. 792/2022 (Dr. Bharati M. Patil V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER:

Heard Ms. Preeti Wankhade, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Sanjivani K. Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondents in M.A.

3. S.O. to 20.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

M.A. No. 205/2022 in O.A. St. No. 794/2022 (Dr. Deepak K. Shejwal V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Ms. Preeti Wankhade, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri N.U. Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondents in M.A.

3. S.O. to 20.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

_ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _

M.A. No. 206/2022 in O.A. St. No. 796/2022 (Dr. Amol P. Khairnar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Ms. Preeti Wankhade, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondents in M.A.

3. S.O. to 20.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

M.A. No. 207/2022 in O.A. St. No. 798/2022 (Dr. Manjusha P. Tambse V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Ms. Preeti Wankhade, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondents in M.A.

3. S.O. to 20.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 538 OF 2019 (Jawahar R. Bhoi V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Smt. Vidya Taksal, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Sanjivani K. Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, time is granted for filing rejoinder affidavit, if any.

3. S.O. to 07.11.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 165 OF 2020 (Babu D. Ghute V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri V.B. Wagh, learned Advocate for the applicant, Smt. Deepalli S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent No. 1 and Shri A.D. Gadekar, learned Advocate for respondent No. 2.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, time is granted for filing rejoinder affidavit, if any.

3. S.O. to 17.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 340 OF 2021 (Popat B. Ahire V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022. ORAL ORDER:

Heard Shri S.P. Chate, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, issue fresh notice to the respondent No. 3, returnable on 18.10.2022.

3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.

4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

6. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicant is directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.

7. At the request of learned P.O., time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent Nos. 1 & 2.

- 8. S.O. to 18.10.2022.
- 9. Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 341 OF 2021 (Prashant S. Pardhi V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri S.P. Chate, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, time is granted as a last chance for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondents.

3. S.O. to 18.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 364 OF 2021 (Vinayak K. Kalambkar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Shri V.S. Kadam, learned Advocate for the applicant (**Absent**). Heard Smt. Sanjivani K. Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent Nos. 1 & 4. Shri G.N. Patil, learned Advocate for respondent Nos. 2 & 3, **absent**.

2. Record shows that in spite of grant of opportunities, the affidavit in reply is not filed by the respondent Nos. 1 & 4. Hence, the present matter will proceed further without affidavit in reply of the respondent Nos. 1 & 4 in accordance with law.

3. S.O. to 21.10.2022 for admission.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 593 OF 2021 (Gajanan P. Joshi V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022. ORAL ORDER:

Heard Shri S.G. Kulkarni, learned Advocate for the applicant, Shri D.R. Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent Nos. 1 & 5 and Shri D.T. Devane, learned Advocate for respondent Nos. 2 & 3.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, issue fresh notice to the respondent No. 4, returnable on 18.10.2022.

3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.

4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

6. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicant is directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.

7. At the request of learned P.O., time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent Nos. 1 & 5.

- 8. S.O. to 18.10.2022.
- 9. Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 687 OF 2021 (Vipul R. Bhagwat V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRI

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri I.D. Maniyar, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Chief Presenting Officer, time is granted as one more last chance for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondents.

3. S.O. to 21.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 817 OF 2021 (Vilas K. Dhole V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Shri K.N. Shermale, learned Advocate for the applicant (**Absent**). Heard Shri I.S. Thorat, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. Await service of notice on the respondents.

3. As none present for the applicant, S.O. to 17.10.2022 for taking necessary steps.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 160 OF 2022 (Anant A. Kendrekar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri D.S. Kulkarni, learned Advocate holding for Shri Akshay Kulkarni, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 18.10.2022 for filing rejoinder affidavit, if any.

KBP ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 296 OF 2022 (Madhuri U. Choudhari V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM :Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE :16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri Suresh Naik, learned Advocate holding for Shri A.V. Lavte, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri D.R. Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. Learned Presenting Officer filed affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent Nos. 1 to 5. Same is taken on record and copy thereof has been served on the other side.

3. S.O. to 20.10.2022 for filing rejoinder affidavit, if any.

KBP ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 341 OF 2022 (Shaikh Shaflquedin Shaikh Ahmed V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri P.D. Jarare, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondents.

3. S.O. to 14.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 438 OF 2022 (Sunita S. Gaikwad & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri V.G. Pingle, learned Advocate for the applicants and Shri D.R. Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. Learned Presenting Officer filed affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent Nos. 1 to 3. Same is taken on record and copy thereof has been served on the other side.

3. S.O. to 03.10.2022 for filing rejoinder affidavit, if any.

KBP ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 188 OF 2022 (Gorakh M. Shinde V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri G.L. Awale, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent Nos. 1, 3 & 4.

3. S.O. to 19.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 469 OF 2022 (Arun S. Joshi V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM:Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)DATE:16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri Saket Joshi, learned Advocate holding for Shri Avinash Deshmukh, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri. M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Chief Presenting Officer, time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondents.

3. S.O. to 10.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 585 OF 2022 (Chandrasen V. Lahade V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri H.P. Jadhav, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri N.U. Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, time is granted for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondents.

3. S.O. to 11.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 619 OF 2021 (Rahul R. Wakle V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) DATE : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Smt. Suchita Dhongde, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri N.U. Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, time is granted as one more last chance for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent Nos. 3 to 5.

3. S.O. to 14.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD M.A.NO.25 OF 2022 IN O.A.NO.699 OF 2021 (Narayan N. More V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shir K.B. Jadhav, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri D.R. Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. The present Misc. Application is closed for order.

SAS ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD M.A.NO.214/2022 WITH M.A.NO.148/2021 IN O.A.ST.NO.481/2021 (Anita P. Gitey V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Shri S.B. Shirsath, learned Advocate for the applicants, is **absent**. Heard Shri N.U. Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. Affidavit-in-reply filed on behalf of the respondent No.2 in M.A.No.148/2021 is taken on record.

3. S.O. to 21.10.2022.

MEMBER (J)

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.112 OF 2022 (Bharat D. Raut V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022. ORAL ORDER:

Heard Ms. Pradnya Talekar, learned Advocate holding for Shri S.B. Talekar, learned Advocate for the applicant, Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent Nos.1 to 4 and Shri Avinash S. Deshmukh, learned Advocate for the respondent No.5.

2. The present matter has already been treated as part heard.

3. By consent of all the parties, S.O. to 19.09.2022 for final hearing.

MEMBER (J)

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.799 OF 2016 (Bhura R. Pawar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri R.A. Joshi, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. M.S. Patni, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. The present matter has already been treated as part heard.

3. By consent of both the sides, S.O. to 28.09.2022 for final hearing.

MEMBER (J)

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.202 OF 2017 (Ashok B. Wagh V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri A.S. Shelke, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Sanjivani K. Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. The present matter has already been treated as part heard.

3. By consent of both the sides, S.O. to 22.09.2022 for final hearing.

SAS ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.370 OF 2019 (Yasmin Hashmi Vasim Hashmi V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri V.G. Pingle, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri I.S. Thorat, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent Nos.1 to 4. Shri M.S. Taur, learned Advocate for the respondent No.5, is **absent**.

2. The present matter has already been treated as part heard.

3. By consent of both the sides, S.O. to 21.09.2022 for final hearing.

SAS ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.451 OF 2019 (Suryakant R. Biradar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM : Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)

DATE : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri S.B. Patil, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri I.S. Thorat, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. The present matter has already been treated as part heard.

3. By consent of both the sides, S.O. to 23.09.2022 for final hearing.

MEMBER (J)

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, **BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.810 OF 2019** (Shamsunder M. Choudhari V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.) _____

OFFICE ORDER _____

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM : Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) : 16.09.2022. DATE

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri A.S. Deshmukh, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. The present matter has already been treated as part heard.

3. By consent of both the sides, S.O. to 26.09.2022 for final hearing.

MEMBER (J)

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.581 OF 2020 (Ganesh S. Khetre V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri V.G. Pingle, learned Advocate holding for Shri V.P. Kadam, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri I.S. Thorat, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. The present matter has already been treated as part heard.

3. By consent of both the sides, S.O. to 03.10.2022 for final hearing.

MEMBER (J)

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.200 OF 2018 (Dinkar G. Shahane V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri S.D. Joshi, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. M.S. Patni, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of the learned P.O., time is granted for filing affidavit-in-reply on behalf of the respondents to the amended O.A.

3. S.O. to 28.09.2022 for final hearing.

MEMBER (J)

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.711 OF 2018 (Sanjay N. Nade V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM : Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J)

DATE : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri V.G. Pingle learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri I.S. Thorat, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. By consent of both the sides, S.O. to 12.10.2022 for final hearing.

SAS ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.301 OF 2019 (Sakharam B. Rakh V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022. ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri V.G. Pingle, learned Advocate for the applicant, Smt. Sanjivani K. Deshmukh-Ghate learned Presenting Officer for the respondent No.1 and Shri S.B. Mene, learned Advocate for the respondent Nos.2 to 4.

2. By consent of all the parties, S.O. to 12.10.2022 for final hearing.

SAS ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.365 OF 2019 (Nilesh W. Mahajan V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022. ORAL ORDER:

Heard Shri V.B. Wagh, learned Advocate for the applicant, Shri D.R. Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent Nos.1 & 3 and Shri V.G. Pingle, learned Advocate for the respondent No.2.

2. By consent of all the parties, S.O. to 07.10.2022 for final hearing.

MEMBER (J)

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.623 OF 2019 (Umesh B. Shahane V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri A.P. Sonpethkar, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. This Original Application is filed challenging the order of transfer of the applicant dated 31.05.2019 (Exh. 'E') issued by the respondent No.2 i.e. the Commissioner, Maharashtra State Excise Department, Maharashtra State, Mumbai transferring the applicant from the post of Superintendent, State Excise Department, Parbhani to the post of Superintendent, State Excise Department, Wardha. The said order was served upon the applicant on 13.06.2019.

3. During pendency of this Original Application, the applicant made representation to the respondent Nos.2 to 4 seeking request transfer from Wardha to Parbhani. The said request application is accepted by passing order dated 23.08.2022 by the respondent No.2.

4. Learned Advocate for the applicant produced the copy of said order dated 23.08.2022 issued by the respondent No.2. It is taken on record and marked as document 'X' for the purpose of identification.

//2// O.A.623/2021

5. In view of the said order, the grievance raised by the applicant said to have been redressed. Hence, the Original Application stands disposed of. No order as to costs.

MEMBER (J)

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.333 OF 2020 (Arjun M. Pawar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022. ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri K.B. Jadhav, learned Advocate for the applicant, Shri D.R. Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent Nos.1 & 3 and Shri S.B. Patil, learned Advocate for the respondent No.2.

2. By consent of all the parties, S.O. to 10.10.2022 for final hearing.

MEMBER (J)

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.407 OF 2020 (Dr. Yashwant S. Chavan V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022. ORAL ORDER:

Heard Shri Shamsundar B. Patil, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Sanjivani K.Deshmukh-Gahte, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. This Original Application is filed challenging the impugned transfer order dated 01.10.2020 (Annex. 'A-3') issued by the respondent No.1 to the extent of the applicant transferring him from Basmant, Dist. Hingoli to Mandavi, Dist. Nanded.

3. This Tribunal by order dated 12.10.2020 granted interim stay to the said order of transfer to the extent of the applicant, which was continued from time to time. Now, the applicant has retired on superannuation w.e.f. 31.05.2022.

4. Learned Advocate for the applicant submitted that in paragraph No.VI (F), it is mentioned that the applicant was to retire on superannuation on 31.05.2020 but due to subsequent G.Rs. the applicant is retained in Government service till 31.05.2022. Accordingly, the applicant stood retired on superannuation on 31.05.2022.

5. In view of the same, the Original Application now has become infructuous. Hence, the Original Application stands disposed of. No order as to costs.

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.07 OF 2021 (Arun W. Thakur V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

(Arun W. Thakur V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri V.B. Wagh, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri I.S. Thorat, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. By consent of both the sides, S.O. to 12.10.2022 for final hearing.

MEMBER (J)

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.166 OF 2021 (Suryakant V. Tatode V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri P.B. Rakhunde, learned Advocate holding for Shri Sanjay A. Wakure, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Sanjivani K. Desmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. By consent of both the sides, S.O. to 12.10.2022 for final hearing.

SAS ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.540 OF 2021 (Bhujang V. Godbole V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u> : Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) <u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri V.B. Wagh, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. M.S. Patni, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. The present matter be treated as part heard.

3. By consent of both the sides, S.O. to 23.09.2022 for final hearing.

MEMBER (J)

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.512 OF 2021 (Usha A. Gaikwad V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Shri V.D. Dongre, Member (J) DATE : 16.09.2022.

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri A.D. Gadekar, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri D.R. Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. By consent of both the sides, S.O. to 12.10.2022 for final hearing.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.223/2020 (Divya Nandi & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri S.S.Jadhavar, learned Counsel for the applicants and Shri M.S.Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. Arguments are concluded. Matter stands

reserved for order.

3. By Tuesday i.e. till 20-09-2022, if parties desire to place on record some citations, it would be open for them.

MEMBER (A) YUK (!) ORAL ORDERS 16-09-2022 **VICE CHAIRMAN**

M.A.ST.NO.664/2022 IN O.A.ST.NO.665/2022 (Reshma Kamble & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri S.S.Jadhavar, learned Counsel for the applicants and Shri M.S.Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. Arguments are concluded. Matter stands

reserved for order.

3. By Tuesday i.e. till 20-09-2022, if parties desire to place on record some citations, it would be open for them.

MEMBER (A) VICE CHAIRMAN YUK (!) ORAL ORDERS 16-09-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.392/2021 (Pravin Hivrale & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Ajay Deshpande, learned Counsel for the applicants and Shri M.S.Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. At the request of learned Chief Presenting Officer,

S.O. 20-09-2022. First On Board.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.222/2022 (Annasaheb Shinde & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Sandeep D. Munde, learned Counsel holding for Shri Jiwan J. Patil, learned Counsel for the applicants, Shri M.S.Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer and Shri P.R.Katneshwar, learned Special Counsel for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. S.O. to 23-09-2022.

MEMBER (A)VICE CHAIRMANYUK (!) ORAL ORDERS 16-09-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.457/2022, 460/2022 & 462/2022 (Vanita Panchal & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

_____ **OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS** _____

- CORAM : Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Sandeep D. Munde, Shri J.M.Murkute, learned Counsel for the applicants, Shri V.R.Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities and Shri G.J.Karne, learned Counsel for respondent no.4 (in O.A.462/22), are present.

2. S.O. to 22-09-2022.

> MEMBER (A) YUK (!) ORAL ORDERS 16-09-2022

VICE CHAIRMAN

C.P.NO.46/2018 IN O.A.NO.207/2015 (Balika Tawshikar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Shaikh Mazhar A. Jahagirdar, learned Counsel for the applicant, Shri N.U.Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities and Sandeep D. Munde, learned Counsel holding for Shri Jiwan J. Patil, learned Counsel for respondent nos.1 & 2, are present.

2. S.O. to 03-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)VICE CHAIRMANYUK (!) ORAL ORDERS 16-09-2022

C.P.NO.41/2019 IN O.A.NO.25/2018 (Sachin Salave V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u> : Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND

Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri S.D.Joshi, learned Counsel for the applicant

and Shri D.R.Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the

respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 03-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.586/2012 (Bharat Bhosale V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Sudhir Patil, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri M.S.Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 04-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.132/2016 (Mandabai Thakur V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri S.B.Mene, learned Counsel for the applicant

and Smt. M.S.Patni, learned Presenting Officer for the

respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 09-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.749/2016 (Sachi Palkhe V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Ms. Anagha Pandit, learned Counsel holding for

Mr. S.B.Talekar, learned Counsel for the applicant and

Shri V.R.Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the

respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 06-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.274/2017 (Anil Beedkar & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Yogesh P. Deshmukh, learned Counsel for

the applicant and Shri N.U.Yadav, learned Presenting

Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 07-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.963/2017 (Vasant Karke & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.S.Deshmukh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri D.R.Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 04-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.859/2019 (Kalpesh Patil V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND

Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Panditrao S. Anerao, learned Counsel for the

applicant has filed **leave note** on record.

Shri N.U.Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the

respondents is present.

2. S.O. to 10-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.1069/2019 (Prabhakar Kathar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri V.G.Pingle, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri N.U.Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 07-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.140/2020 (Shrikant Bhale V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri H.A.Joshi, learned Counsel for the applicant

and Smt. Deepali Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 21-10-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.77/2021 (Vishvanath Mahindrakar & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri V.B.Wagh, learned Counsel for the applicant

and Shri M.S.Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 09-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.395/2021 (Bhau Chaudhari V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Ajit M. Gholap, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri D.R.Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 10-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

M.A.NO.51/2021 IN O.A.ST.NO.184/2021 (Sangameshwar Kadam V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Ku. Preeti Wankhade, learned Counsel for the applicant and Smt. Deepali Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 06-10-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

M.A.NO.306/2021 IN O.A.ST.NO.1305/2021 (Kiransingh A. Pal V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

_____ **OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS** _____

- CORAM : Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Smt. Suchita Dhongde, learned Counsel for the applicant, Smt. Sanjivani Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities and Shri S.B.Mene, learned Counsel for respondent nos.3 & 4, are present.

2. S.O. to 09-11-2022.

> MEMBER (A) YUK (!) ORAL ORDERS 16-09-2022

VICE CHAIRMAN

M.A.NO.340/2022 IN O.A. NO.588/2022 M.A.NO.341/2022 IN O.A. NO.589/2022 M.A.NO.342/2022 IN O.A. NO.590/2022 M.A.NO.343/2022 IN O.A. NO.591/2022 M.A.NO.344/2022 IN O.A. NO.592/2022 (Ramesh Chavan & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.V.Lavte, learned Counsel for the applicants and Shri M.S.Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. In these matters respondents were expected to file reply today, however, it has not been filed. As has been contended by the learned Counsel, there appears some urgency in the matter since challenge is to the departmental proceedings and departmental proceedings seem to have commenced. In the circumstances, we grant last chance to the respondents to file their affidavit in reply on or before next date by supplying copy of the same to learned Counsel in advance.

3. S.O. to 07-10-2022.

MEMBER (A) YUK (!) ORAL ORDERS 16-09-2022 **VICE CHAIRMAN**

M.A.NO.393/2022 IN O.A.NO.1044/2019 (Tukaram Katare V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.S.Deshmukh, learned Counsel holding for

Shri D.A.Bide, learned Counsel for the applicant and

Shri M.S.Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for

the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 03-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

T.A.NO.07/2016 IN W.P.NO.1533/2015 (Chandrakala Kacharu Navgire V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Nasim R. Shaikh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri M.S.Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 03-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.178/2016 (Deorao Jondhale V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri V.S.Panpatte, learned Counsel for the applicant and Smt. M.S.Patni, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 03-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.326/2016 (Changdeo Sawant V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri V.B.Wagh, learned Counsel for the applicant

and Smt. M.S.Patni, learned Presenting Officer for the

respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 04-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.629/2016 (Shankar Waghmare V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.D.Sugdare, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri I.S.Thorat, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 06-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.807/2016 (Madhukar Jadhav V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

_____ **OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS** _____

- CORAM : Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri V.B.Wagh, learned Counsel for the applicant Smt. Sanjivani Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities and Shri Shamsundar B. Patil, learned Counsel for respondent no.2, are present.

2. S.O. to 10-11-2022.

> MEMBER (A) YUK (!) ORAL ORDERS 16-09-2022

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.496/2017 (Varsharani Chavhan V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Sandip S. Chakurkar, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri I.S.Thorat, learned Presenting

Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 11-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.503/2017 (Panchamlal Salve V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

_____ **OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS**

- CORAM : Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

learned Counsel Shri V.B.Wagh, for the Deepali applicant, Smt. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities and Shri M.B.Bharaswadkar, learned Counsel for respondent no.3, are present.

2. S.O. to 11-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.736/2017 (Sanjay Kale V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

_____ **OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS**

- _____ CORAM : Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.V.Thombre, learned Counsel holding for Shri S.S.Thombre, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri D.R.Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 20-10-2022. Interim relief granted earlier to continue till then.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.743/2017 (Subhash Dhokane V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.S.Deshmukh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri V.R.Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 04-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.39/2018 (Ravi Wankhade V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Sandesh R. Patil, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri N.U.Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 14-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.68/2018 (Kishan Kadam V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri P.B.Rakhunde, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri D.R.Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 14-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.273/2018 (Ganesh Chavhan V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

_____ **OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS** _____

- CORAM : Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Sandeep B. Sontakke, learned Counsel for the applicant, Smt. Sanjivani Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities and Shri Pramod A. Salvi, learned Counsel for respondent no.4, are present.

2. S.O. to 14-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.291/2018 (Sahebrao Tawade V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Y.P.Deshmukh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri I.S.Thorat, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 14-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.476/2018 (Aasha Khairnar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Sandesh R. Patil, learned Counsel for the applicant and Smt. Sanjivani Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 14-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.729/2018 (Satish Shrimangle V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri J.B.Choudhary, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri V.R.Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 10-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.833/2018 (Prashant Falke V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Naseem R. Shaikh, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri N.U.Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 11-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.935/2018 (Chandrabhan Veer V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - DATE : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Kakasaheb B. Jadhav, learned Counsel for

the applicant and Shri I.S.Thorat, learned Presenting

Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 11-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.537/2019 (Narendra Thakur V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Ku. Anagha Pandit, learned Counsel holding for

Shri S.B.Talekar, learned Counsel for the applicant and Smt. M.S.Patni, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 12-10-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

YUK (!) ORAL ORDERS 16-09-2022

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.1030/2019 (Dr. Jaya Dighe V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

 OFFICE ORDER
 TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

 CORAM :
 Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

 DATE :
 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER:

Ku. Anagha Pandit, learned Counsel holding for Shri S.B.Talekar, learned Counsel for the applicant, Shri M.S.Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, Shri Ashish B. Rajkar, learned Counsel for respondent nos.5 to 12 & 14, Shri A.S.Shelke, learned Counsel for respondent no.15 and Shri N.S.Choudhary, learned Counsel for respondent no.13, are present.

2. S.O. to 12-10-2022.

MEMBER (A) YUK (!) ORAL ORDERS 16-09-2022

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.60/2020 (Sangita Patil @ Alka Chaudhari V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri J.B.Choudhary, learned Counsel for the applicant and Shri D.R.Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 11-11-2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

YUK (!) ORAL ORDERS 16-09-2022

M.A.NO.185/2021 IN O.A.NO.257/2021 (Nansaheb Gaikwad V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Kakasaheb B. Jadhav, learned Counsel for the applicant and Smt. Sanjivani Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 07-10-2022. High On Board.

3. Interim relief granted earlier to continue till then.

MEMBER (A)VICE CHAIRMANYUK (!) ORAL ORDERS 16-09-2022

M.A.NO.192/2021 IN O.A.NO.258/2021 (Laxman Sormare V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
 - **DATE** : 16-09-2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Kakasaheb B. Jadhav, learned Counsel for the applicant and Smt. M.S.Patni, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, are present.

2. S.O. to 07-10-2022. High On Board.

3. Interim relief granted earlier to continue till then.

MEMBER (A)VICE CHAIRMANYUK (!) ORAL ORDERS 16-09-2022

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET THE MAHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI, BENCH AT AURANGABAD ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 818 OF 2021 (Dr. Ashwini Ashokrao Patil V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022 ORAL ORDER:

Shri S.D. Joshi, learned counsel for the applicant, Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, Shri G.M. Ghongde, learned counsel holding for Shri S.G. Chapalgaonkar, leanred counsel for respondent Nos. 6, Shri S.G. Kulkarni, learned counsel for respondent No. 8, Shri Amol T. Jagtap, learned counsel for respondent No. 9 and Shri Akshay H. Joshi, learned counsel for respondent No. 7, are present.

2. Learned counsel for the applicant submits that according to the information received to the applicant names of the junior persons have been recommended for their promotion and DPC is likely to be held in the next week. Learned counsel in the circumstances, prayed for early hearing of this matter. He has further submitted that he has not yet received copy of affidavit in reply by the private respondents. Learned counsel appearing for the private respondents shall supply copies of their affidavits in reply to the learned counsel for the applicant.

3. Learned Presenting Officer submits that he will take necessary instructions and will make submissions on Monday.

4. S.O. to 19.9.2022.

MEMBER (A) ORAL ORDERS 16.09.2022-HDD **VICE CHAIRMAN**

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 310 OF 2022 (Shivaji M. Deshmukh V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri M.N. Kolhe, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. Learned Chief Presenting Officer has sought time for filing affidavit in reply. Time granted.

3. S.O. to 7.10.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 149 OF 2022 (Smt. Sulochana P. Patare V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER	TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS
<u>CORAM</u> :	Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
<u>DATE</u> :	16.09.2022
ORAL ORI	DER :

Shri V.B. Wagh, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. Learned Presenting Officer has sought time by way of last chance. Already due opportunities are availed by the respondents. It is brought to our notice that the applicant is retiring on 30.9.2022. Matter stands adjourned to 23.9.2022. Affidavit in reply be filed and copy of the same be given in advance to the learned counsel for the applicant.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 526 OF 2022 (Sachin D. Dahihande V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri S.D. Munde, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. Learned counsel appearing for the applicant submits that the applicant does not wish to file rejoinder affidavit.

3. List the matter for hearing on 3.11.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 352 OF 2022 (Rajaram C. Sevalikar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri K.B. Jadhav, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri D.R. Patil, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. Learned Presenting Officer has tendered across the bar affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent Nos. 1 to 4 and the same is taken on record and copy thereof has been served on the learned counsel for the applicant.

3. List the present case for hearing on 21.10.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 1029 OF 2019 (Suraj S. Bavat V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri M.S. Chaudhari, learned counsel for the applicant, Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities and Shri V.B. Wagh, learned counsel for respondent No. 4, are present.

2. At the request of learned counsel for the applicant, S.O. to 3.11.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

M.A.NO. 315/22 IN REV.ST.1163/22 IN O.A.707/19 (Rama M. Shinde (Died) Through its legal heirs Vimal R. Shinde V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u> :	Vice Chairman
	AND
	Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

DATE : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Heard Shri S.K. Mathpati, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities.

2. At the request of learned counsel for the applicant, reissue notice to the respondents, returnable on 28.9.2022.

3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.

4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.

5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal

:: - 2 - :: M.A.NO. 315/22 IN REV.ST.1163/22 IN O.A.707/19

(Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

6. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicant is directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.

7. S.O. to 28.9.2022.

8. Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

C.P.NO. 16/2022 IN O.A.NO. 550/2019 (Kashinath G. Ghumre V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022 <u>ORAL ORDER</u>:

Heard Shri Kakasaheb B. Jadhav, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities.

2. Learned Chief Presenting Officer submits that the order passed by this Tribunal has been fully complied with. In the affidavit in reply filed on behalf of the respondents it has been so contended. No rejoinder affidavit is filed to the said affidavit in reply by the applicant. In the circumstances, it appears that the impugned order must have been complied with. The contempt petition, therefore, stands disposed of. No order as to costs.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

O.A.NOS. 626, 641 & 642 ALL OF 2019 (Sheshrao R. Giri & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM:Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora,
Vice Chairman
AND
Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)DATE:16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri S.K. Mathpati, learned counsel for the applicants and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities in all these cases, are present.

2. At the request of learned counsel for the applicants, S.O. to 10.11.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 759 OF 2021 (Ashwini A. Wavhal & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

DATE : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.V. Thombre, learned counsel for the applicants and Smt. Sanjivani Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. At the request of learned counsel for the applicants, S.O. to 21.9.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 21 OF 2022 (Ravita B. Rathod V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.V. Thombre, learned counsel holding for Shri S.S. Thombre, learned counsel for the applicant and Smt. Sanjivani Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. At the request of learned counsel for the applicants, S.O. to 21.9.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 693 OF 2022 (Prashant S. Morale & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.V. Thombre, learned counsel for the applicants and Smt. Sanjivani Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. At the request of learned counsel for the applicants, S.O. to 21.9.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 518 OF 2021 (Asmita M. Kekan & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

DATE : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri A.V. Thombre, learned counsel for the applicants and Smt. Sanjivani Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. At the request of learned counsel for the applicants, S.O. to 21.9.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

C.P.NO. 10/2022 IN O.A.NO. 191/2021 (Sandip W Khadse V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri R.J. Nirmal, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. Learned counsel for the applicant has sought time for filing rejoinder affidavit. Time granted.

3. S.O. to 7.10.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 409 OF 2019 (Hanumantrao B. Bhongale V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Sandeep B. Gorde, learned counsel for the applicants and Smt. Sanjivani Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. Learned counsel for the applicant has sought time for filing rejoinder affidavit. Time granted.

3. S.O. to 4.11.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 116 OF 2020 (Shaikh Akhtar Hussain Mohd. Hanif V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri P.B. Rakhunde, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. Learned counsel for the applicant has sought time for filing rejoinder affidavit. Time granted.

3. S.O. to 4.11.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

O.A.NOS. 70, 71, 72, 73, 74, 75 & 76 ALL OF 2021 (Vitthal R. Thombre & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri V.G. Pingle, learned counsel for the applicants, Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities in all these cases, Shri M.P. Gude, learned counsel for respondent Nos. 3 & 4 in O.A. Nos. 70, 71 both of 2021, Shri S.D. Dhongde, learned counsel for respondent No. 3 in O.A. Nos. 73, 74 & 75 all of 2021 and Shri Shamsunder B. Patil, learned counsel for respondent No. 4 in O.A. No. 76/2021, are present.

2. S.O. to 10.11.2022 for filing affidavit in reply on behalf of the respondents.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 119 OF 2021 (Sudhakar B. Aandhale V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Ajit M. Gholap, learned counsel for the applicants and Shri N.U. Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. At the request of learned counsel for the applicant, S.O. to 9.11.2022 for filing rejoinder affidavit.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 318 OF 2021 (Prakash M. Deshmukh V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

- <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)
- **<u>DATE</u>** : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Amol A. Kokad, learned counsel for the applicants and Smt. Sanjivani Deshmukh-Ghate, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. Learned Presenting Officer has sought time for filing affidavit in reply. Time granted.

3. S.O. to 20.9.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 770 OF 2021 (Gangaram S. Bele V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A)

<u>DATE</u> : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri S.S. Londhe, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri N.U. Yadav, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. Learned Presenting Officer has sought time for filing affidavit in reply. Time granted.

3. S.O. to 9.11.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 797 OF 2021 (Ranjana D Jaybhaye V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

<u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A) DATE : 16.09.2022

ORAL ORDER :

Shri Sandeep D. Munde, learned counsel for the applicant and Mrs. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities, are present.

2. Learned counsel for the applicant has sought time for filing rejoinder affidavit. Time granted.

3. S.O. to 10.11.2022.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 531 OF 2022 (Sachin Gangadharrao Lasure V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS <u>CORAM</u>: Hon'ble Justice Shri P.R. Bora, Vice Chairman AND Hon'ble Shri Bijay Kumar, Member (A) <u>DATE</u>: 16.09.2022 <u>ORAL ORDER</u>:

Heard Shri Tushar Shinde, learned counsel holding for Shri C.K. Shinde, learned counsel for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondent authorities.

2. The applicant has applied for the post of Librarian on the establishment of Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal. An advertisement has been published by the Maharashtra Public Service short (for Commission "the Commission") for recruitment of the said post on 11.5.2022 and in pursuance of the said advertisement the applicant submitted online application. The qualification and experience necessary for the said post is prescribed in the advertisement in clause 8 thereof. We deem it appropriate to reproduce the said clause 8.

"८. शैक्षणिक अर्हता आणि अनुभव:-

८.९. शैक्षणिक अर्हताः- ग्रंथालय शास्त्रातील पदविका धारण करीत असतील, **आणि**.

८.२. अनुभवः- ज्यांना ग्रंथपाल किंवा सहायक ग्रंथपाल म्हणून दोन वर्षे काम करण्याचा अनुभव असेल.

८.३. प्राधान्यशील अर्हता :- ग्रंथालय शास्त्राची पदवी धारण केलेल्या उमेदवारास प्राधान्य देण्यात येईल.

८.४. शैक्षणिक अर्हता व अनुभवाचा कालावधी गणना करण्याचा दिनांक:-

८.४.९. प्रस्तुत जाहिरातीस अनुसरुन अर्ज सादर करण्यासाठी विहित केलेल्या अंतिम दिनांकास संबंधित शैक्षणिक अर्हता धारण करणे आवश्यक आहे.

८.४.२. अनुभवाच्या कालावधीची गणना प्रस्तुत जाहिरातीस अनुसरुन अर्ज सादर करण्याकरीता विहित केलेल्या अंतिम दिनांकास करण्यात येईल.

८.५. अनुभवाच्या दाव्यांबाबत:-

आयोगाच्या ऑनलाईन अर्ज प्रणालीव्दारे विविध स्वरुपाचे दावे करताना अथवा दावे अद्ययावत करताना प्रस्तुत जाहिरातीस अनुसरुन अनुभवाच्या दाव्यांनुसार पात्र होण्यासाठी उमेदवाराने Nature of Job – Librarian OR Assistant Librarian असे नमूद करणे अनिवार्य आहे. त्याशिवाय, ऑनलाईन अर्ज प्रणालीव्दारे अर्ज स्वीकृती होऊ शकणार नाही. "

3. It is the contention of the applicant that he is holding the qualification of diploma, degree, postgraduation and Ph.D in Librarian Science. According to the applicant, he thus fulfills eligibility criteria so far as educational qualification is concerned. As has been submitted by the learned counsel, though the applicant attempted to submit online application with the aforesaid information, his application has not been accepted.

4. According to the learned counsel the rejection relates to only educational qualification. Learned counsel has pointed out the document at page No. 26 in the compilation, wherein the order of rejection is recorded. It reads thus,

> "Did not match criteria: Graduate or Post Graduate Qualification with any Subject Condition Failed"

:: - 3 - :: O.A. NO. 531/2022

According to the applicant, the reason which has been mentioned, relate only to the educational qualification. In the circumstances, learned counsel has prayed for an interim relief thereby directing the Commission to accept online application of the applicant, subject to outcome of the present Original Application and permit the applicant to participate in the further process of selection.

4. Learned Chief Presenting Officer has opposed for granting any such interim relief. Learned C.P.O. submits that for want of instructions, it may not be possible to make detail submissions on the contentions raised in the application, however, the applicant apparently is not fulfilling eligibility criteria.

5. Learned counsel appearing for the applicant has invited our attention to clause 8 of the advertisement on which the learned counsel has also placed reliance and brought to our notice that the person who has to apply for the subject post is required to have experience of two years working on the post of Librarian or Assistant Librarian.

6. Learned C.P.O. submitted that the applicant is admittedly not having any experience as prescribed in the advertisement. The applicant is working as Senior Clerk and never worked as Librarian. Learned C.P.O. has brought to our notice the information submitted by the applicant in the online application, which is at page-28 of the compilation showing that in the experience clause nothing has been mentioned. According to the learned C.P.O. the applicant is not holding eligibility for applying for the subject post for want of experience as prescribed in the advertisement. Learned C.P.O. in the circumstances, has prayed for disposing of the present Original Application at the admission stage itself since no case is made out by the applicant for further consideration.

7. Learned counsel appearing for the applicant submitted that the argument as has been advanced by the learned C.P.O. is contrary to the clause in the advertisement. Learned counsel pointed out that had it been the case that the candidate, who has to apply for the said post must have worked on the post of either Librarian or Assistant Librarian, in the relevant clauses it would have not been mentioned as to state, "designation on the post on which working". Learned counsel submitted that the clause No. 8 and other clauses read conjointly it leads to inference that, that is one of the criteria, however, the preference has been given to the higher qualification in the Library Science, which the applicant is possessing.

8. After having considered the submissions advanced by the learned counsel appearing for the applicant and the learned C.P.O., it appears to us that the present matter can be disposed of finally at this stage itself, having considered the points raised in the matter. We have carefully perused the clauses for

:: - 5 - :: O.A. NO. 531/2022

"educational qualification" and "experience". The experience is made mandatory and it is not optional. Insofar as other contentions raised by the applicant that had it been the pre-requirement, in the application only two options must have been given i.e. working on the post of Librarian or Assistant Librarian. However, the said contention also cannot be accepted for the reason that the possibility of the candidates presently working on different post but having past experience of two years working on the post of Librarian or Assistant Librarian, cannot be denied.

9. Clause 8 in the advertisement even if plainly interpreted no other inference can be drawn that the candidates concerned have higher may anv qualification in the Library Science, the condition of having experience of 2 years working on the post either of Librarian or Assistant Librarian is not waived. In other words it is mandatory for the candidate applying for the post of Librarian to have the said experience. The applicant is admittedly not having such experience and that was the reason that his application could not be accepted.

10. After having considered the matter from all angles it does not appear to us that there is any propriety in keeping the matter pending since no other issue is to be decided in the present matter. The applicant has failed to make out any case for grant of

:: - 6 - :: 0.A. NO. 531/2022

any relief as has been prayed by him. In the circumstances the following order is passed :-

<u>O R D E R</u>

The present Original Application stands dismissed, however, without any order as to costs.

MEMBER (A)

VICE CHAIRMAN