ÁHARASHTRA ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL MUMBAI

A. No.

of 20

IN

application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

des, Office Momoranda of Coram, carance, Tribunal's orders or tions and Rogistrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

O.A.107/2024 (DB-2)

B.K. Gangawane Vs.

... Applicant

The State of Mah. & Ors.

... Respondents

- 1. Heard Shri A.A. Gharte, learned Advocate for Applicant and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned CPO for Respondents.
- 2. The learned CPO states that MPSC has now written to State Government on 06.02.2024 seeking opinion about validity of Disability Certificates which have been issued for the category of 'Multiple Disabilities/Mental Illness' under Section 34(1)(e) to candidates who are at Serial Nos.1 to 6 in General Merit List published on 18.01.2024. The Applicant is placed at Serial No.7 of General Merit List for the category of 'Multiple Disabilities/Mental Illness'.
- 3. The learned Advocate for Applicant submits that as MPSC has written to State Government on 06.02.2024 seeking their opinion about the validity of Disability Certificates which have been issued for category of 'Multiple Disabilities'/ 'Mental Illness' under Section 34(1)(e), then in the meanwhile MPSC should not recommend appointments of candidates at Serial Nos. 1 to 6 of General Merit List.
- 4. S.O. to 13th February, 2024.

Sd/-

(Debashish Chakrabarty) Member-A 06.02.2024

(skw)

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

M. A. No.79 of 2024 In O.A.No.143 of 2024

A.L. Pawar & Ors.

....Applicants

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

...Respondents.

- 1. Heard Shri N. N. Pawar, learned Counsel for the Applicants and Ms S. P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents
- 2. This is an application for leave to sue jointly.
- 3. Considering the cause of action pursued by the Applicants is common, concurrent and usual, the case is not required to be decided separately.
- 4. In this view of the matter, the present Misc.

 Application is allowed, subject to Applicants paying requisite Court Fees, if not already paid.
- 5. M. A. No.79 /2024 is allowed. No order as to costs.

Sd/-

Sd/-

(Debashish Chakrabarty) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

O.A.1406/2023 with O.A.1450/2023, O.A.1477/2023 & O.A.1549/2023

Dr. S.H. Darveshi & Ors. Vs.

... Applicants

The State of Mah. & Ors.

... Respondents

- Heard Shri A.A. Desai, learned Advocate for Applicants and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned CPO for Respondents.
- At the outset, the learned Advocate for Applicants pressing 'Interim Relief' for Dr. S.H. Darveshi, the Applicant in OA No.1406/2023. He states that cases of Dr. S.H. Darveshi & Others are covered under order passed by Hon'ble High Court in Writ Petition No.11543/2023 on 5th October, 2023.
- We have gone through the said order and we pass the same order.
- In view of this, 'Interim Relief' is granted as follows :-

"Pending the hearing and final disposal of the OA's, the Applicants who have retired after 31.05.2023 on attaining the age of 58 years or are yet to retire will continue to be in service till they attain the age of 60 years. However, if the Applicants do not succeed, then the Respondents will have the right and authority to pass necessary order to recover and/or adjust the Salary & Allowances paid to the Applicants during the period of the 'Interim Relief' from their Pensionary Benefits."

5. S.O. to 5th March, 2024 for filing Affidavitin-Reply.

> 50/-(Debashish Chakrabarty) (Mridula Bhatkar, J) Member-A 06.02.2024

Chairperson 06.02.2024

(skw)

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O.A. No.80 of 2024

P.S. Shinde

.....Applicant

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

.....Respondents.

- 1. Heard Shri D.H. Pawar, learned Advocate for the Applicant and Shri A.J. Chougule, learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Learned Advocate for Applicant states that Applicant has since completed training at 'Principal Daulatrao Jadhav, Jail Training College, Yarwada, Pune' but is yet to join on the post of 'Jailor-Group 2' in 'Sindhudurg District Jail'.
- 3. Learned PO states the 'Adverse Report' about activities of the Applicant which had been submitted by 'Superintendent Mumbai Central Jail' on 01.11.2023 came to be considered and thereafter 'Transfer Order' dated 11.01.2024 was issued by 'Additional Director General' and 'Inspector General of Police' and 'Correctional Services, Pune'.
- 4. Learned Advocate for the Applicant contends that the Applicant who is 'Jailor-Group 2' was transferred from 'Mumbai Central Jail, Mumbai' to 'Sindhudurg District Jail' in haste by way of letter dated 11.01.2024 written by 'Deputy Superintendent, Mumbai Central Jail, Mumbai to 'Principal Daulatrao Jadhav Training College, Yerwada, Pune'.

Tribunal's orders

- 5. Learned PO seeks 'Four Weeks' time to file 'Affidavit in Reply' on behalf of 'Additional Director General' and 'Inspector General of Police' and 'Correctional Services, Pune'.
- transferred in haste while still undergoing training at the 'Principal Daulatrao Jadhav Training College, Yerwada, Pune'. The Applicant has also stated that it was communicated orally to him; and the copy of 'Transfer Order' was only recently made available to him. Hence; circumstances make it necessary to ascertain if there were any undue influences behind the 'Transfer Order' of Applicant to 'Sindhudurg District Jail' as it came to be issued when he was not on duty in 'Mumbai Central Jail'. Hence 'Four Week' as sought by PO on behalf of 'Superintendent Mumbai Central Jail' cannot be granted and instead 'One Week' time is granted to learned PO.
- 7. S.O. to 13.02.2024.

Sd/-(Debashish Charrabarty) Member (A)

AGR

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET No.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders	Tribunal's orders	
	Date: 06.02.2024	
	O.A. No.144 of 2024 to O.A. No. O.A. No.156 of 2024 with O.A.	
	V.V. Khule,	
·	P.S. Gokule	
	S.J. Pinjan	
	D.R. Salunke	
	S.S. Gawade	
	V.G. Dhas	
	R.N. Ghadge	
	S.B. Deshmukh	
	P.V. Jadhav	
·	S.N. Tambe	
	H.S. Patil	
	A.S. Bhosale	
	V.J. Waghmare	
	A.M. Kshirsagar	Applicant
	Versus	_
	The State of Maharashtra & Ors.	Responder

- 1. Heard Smt. Punam Mahajan, learned Advocate for Applicants in O.A. Nos.144/24 to O.A. Nos.155/24, Shri A.V. Bandiwadekar, learned Advocate for e Applicant in O.A. No.156/24 and Shri M.D. Lonkar, learned Advocate for the Applicant in O.A. No.161/24. Shri A.J. Chougule, learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents in O.A. No.144/24 to O.A. No.147/24 & O.A. No.150/24 to O.A. No.153/24, Smt. K.S. Gaikwad, learned Presenting Officer in O.A. No.148/24 & O.A. No.156/24 and Smt. Archana B.K., learned Presenting officer in O.A. No.154/24 & O.A. No.155/24.
- 2. Learned P.Os. together submitted that there are several O.As. which have been filed together under 'Section 19' of the 'Administrative Tribunal Act, 1985' challenging 'Transfer Orders' of 'Police Inspectors' which relate to implementation of directions in 'Election

Tribunal's orders

Commission of India' letter dated 21.12.2023 and clarifications issued by 'Election Commissioner of India' letters dated 19.01.2024 and 24.01.2024. The 'Transfer Order' challenged are those issued by (i) 'D.G.P., Maharashtra State, dated 30.01.2024', (ii) 'Commissioner of Police, Pune dated 30.01.2024' (iii) 'Commissioner of Police, Pimpri-Chinchwad, dated 30.01.2024', (iv) 'Commissioner of Police, Thane, dated 31.01.2024', (v) 'Commissioner of Police, Nashik, dated 30.01.2024', (vi) 'Superintendent of Police, Satara dated 22.01.2024', (vii) 'Superintendent of Police, Solapur dated 04.01.2024'.

- Learned P.O's further submitted that as they 3. have to obtain detailed information about Applicants and subsequently have to file 'Affidavits-in-Reply'; thus it would be convenient for them to represent the respective Respondents in 'O.A. No.144 of 2024 to O.A. No.155 of 2024 with O.A. No.156 of 2024 with O.A. No.161 of 2024' if these were to be categorized into separate groups based on 'Police Establishment'. Accordingly it was suggested that (i) 'Commissioner of Police, Pimpri-Chinchwad' will be represented by learned P.O. Shri A.J. Chougule (ii) 'Commissioner of Police, Pune & Thane' will be represented by learned P.O. Smt K.S. Gaikwad and (iii) 'Commissioner of Police, Nashik and 'Superintendent of Police, Satara & 'Superintendent of Police, Solapur' will be represented by learned P.O. Smt. Archana B.K.
- 4. Learned Advocates for Applicants during the course of hearing today reiterated the arguments made by them on 01.01.2024 at the time of hearing of 'O.A. No.114 of 2024, O.A. No.115 of 2024 with O.A. No.122 of 2024'.
- 5. Learned Advocate for Applicant emphasized that the issues raised in present batch of 'O.A. No.144 of 2024 to O.A. No.155 of 2024 with O.A. No.156 of 2024 with O.A. No.161 of 2024' are similar in nature to those in 'O.A. No.114 of 2024, O.A. No.115 of 2024 with O.A. No.122 of 2024' as they all relate to implementation of directions in 'Election Commissioner of India' letter dated 21.12.2023 which has resulted in 'Transfer Order' of 'Police Inspectors' issued by (i) 'D.G.P., Maharashtra State, dated 30.01.2024', (ii) 'Commissioner of Police, Pune dated 30.01.2024' (iii) 'Commissioner of Police,

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET No.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

Pimpri-Chinchwad, dated 30.01.2024', (iv) 'Commissioner of Police, Thane, dated 31.01.2024', (v)'Commissioner of Police, Nashik, dated 30.01.2024', (vi) 'Superintendent of Police, Satara dated 22.01.2024', (vii) 'Superintendent of Police, Solapur dated 04.01.2024'.

- 6. Learned Advocates for **Applicants** also highlighted that inspite of instructions from 'D.G.P., Maharashtra State' dated 03.01.2024; 'Commissioners of Police' (ii) Special I.G.Ps' and (iii)'Superintendents of Police' have not adhered to the timelines mentioned therein which required them to complete the exercise by 12.01.2024. The 'D.G.P., Maharashtra State' therefore had to again issue letter dated 25.01.2024 to seek compliance reports from all (i) 'Commissioners of Police' and (ii) 'Special I.G.P's' and (iii) 'Superintendent of Police'.
- 7. The 'O.A. No.144 of 2024 to O.A. No.155 of 2024 with O.A. No.156 of 2024 with O.A. No.161 of 2024' challenge all the above mentioned 'Transfer Order' but principally the 'Transfer Order' dated 30.01.2024 of 'Police Inspectors' issued by 'D.G.P., Maharashtra State'.
- 8. The 'Home Department' had in the meanwhile had sought clarifications on 16.01.2024 with regard to directions in 'Election Commission of India letter dated 21.12.2023' from 'Chief Electoral Officer, Maharashtra State'. Subsequently appropriate clarifications came to be issued by 'Election Commission of India' letter dated 19.01.2024 to 'Chief Electoral Officer, Maharashtra State' in the context of the earlier letter of 'Deputy Secretary' & 'Joint Chief Electoral Officer, Maharashtra State, Mumbai' dated 09.01.2024 in which separate 'Annexure' was attached to indicate the directions in 'Election Commission of India letter dated 21.12.2023'

Tribunal's orders

and presumption made by office of 'D.G.P. Maharashtra State, Mumbai'. In this 'Annexure' at 'Serial No.5' the presumption made by office of 'D.G.P. Maharashtra State' was as to whether directions with regard to period of posting of 'Three Years' out of last 'Four Years' were also applicable to 'Police Officers' posted in 'Specialized Agencies' such as 'State Intelligence Department, Crime Intelligence Department, Anti-Terrorist Squad, Protection of Civil Rights, Police Training Centres, Highway Safety Patrols etc.' presumption of the office of 'D.G.P. Maharashtra State' therefore was about the extent of interpretation to be made about the phrase 'Functional Departments' used in the context of 'Computerization, Special Branch Training' etc. in 'Para 5.3' of 'Election Commission of India letter dated 21.12.2023'.

- 9. The 'Election Commission of India letter dated 19.01.2024' addressed to 'Chief Electoral Officer, Maharashtra State' clarifies about these presumptions made by office of 'D.G.P., Maharashtra State, Mumbai' by directing that entire tenure in 'Revenue District' should be counted irrespective of establishments of 'Police Commissoners' or 'Superintendents of Police' or even 'Branch of Posting'. Hence, from the nature of clarifications subsequently issued by Commission of India' on 19.01.2024 and again on 24.01.2024 regarding the presumption made by office of 'D.G.P., Maharashtra State' it becomes necessary to seek the presence of 'Deputy Secretary' & 'Joint Chief Electoral Officer, Maharashtra State, Mumbai' to understand as to how these revised directions are to be understood and implemented by 'D.G.P., Maharashtra State' as well as 'Heads of Specialized Agencies' and by all field establishments of (i) 'Commissioners of Police' (ii) 'Special IGP's' and (iii) 'Superintendents of Police'.
- 10. The 'Election Commission of India' letter dated 21.12.2023 contains set of standard instructions regarding all transfers (i) District Officers (ii) Police Officers (iii) Prohibition and Excise Officers' who will be directly connected with the conduct of 'General Election of Lok Sabha 2024'. The transfers of all incoming officers has to be invariably done after consultation with the 'Chief Electoral Officer' as per directions in 'Para 8' of the 'Election Commission of India', letter dated 21.03.2024. However, the 'Transfer

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET No.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

Order' of 'Police Inspectors' issued by (i) 'D.G.P., State, dated Maharashtra 30.01.2024', 'Commissioner of Police, Pune dated 30.01.2024' (iii) 'Commissioner of Police, Pimpri-Chinchwad, dated 30.01.2024', (iv) 'Commissioner of Police, Thane, dated 31.01.2024', (v)'Commissioner of Police, Nashik, dated 30.01.2024', (vi) 'Superintendent of Police, Satara dated 22.01.2024', (vii) 'Superintendent of Police, Solapur dated 04.01.2024' do not seen to have been issued in full compliance of the directions in 'Para 8' of 'Election Commission of India' letter dated 21.12.2023. averment in this regard were specifically made by learned P.Os as they could not ascertain about it before hearing today becasue as was directed in Order dated 01.01.2024 in 'O.A. No.114 of 2024, O.A. No.115 of 2024 with O.A. No.122 of 2024', 'Joint Chief Electoral Officer' and 'Deputy Secretary' did not remain present on behalf 'Chief Electoral Officer, Maharashtra State, Mumbai'.

- 11. The arguments of learned Advocate do raise concern about the implementation of directions in 'Election Commission of India' letter dated 21.12.2023 read with clarifications issued by 'Election Commission of India' letters dated 19.01.2024 and 24.01.2024 notwithstanding the fact that such action invariably results in challenge to the 'Transfer Orders' from perspective of law under 'Section 22(N) of 'Maharashtra Police Act, 1951' which are then required to be heard under provisions of 'Section 19' of 'Administrative Tribunals Act, 1985'.
- 12. The provisions of 'Section 22N of 'Maharashtra Police Act, 1951' do not become redundant, during the limited period of implementation of various directions of the 'Election Commission of India'. However, as the directions of 'Election Commission of India' have been issued in exercise of its inherent powers under 'Article 324' of the 'Constitution of India', the 'Transfer Orders' of 'Police Inspector' issued by (i) 'D.G.P., Maharashtra

Tribunal's orders

State, dated 30.01.2024', (ii) 'Commissioner of Police, Pune dated 30.01.2024' (iii) 'Commissioner of Police, 30.01.2024', Pimpri-Chinchwad, dated 'Commissioner of Police, Thane, dated 31.01.2024', (v)'Commissioner of Police, Nashik, dated 30.01.2024', (vi) 'Superintendent of Police, Satara dated 22.01.2024', 'Superintendent of Palice. Solapur dated 04.01.2024' in the interim period held in abeyance 'Qua the Applicants'. The interim period shall mean such time till firmed up opinion about implementation of all directions of 'Election Commission of India' is received from 'Chief Electoral Officer, Maharashtra State.' meanwhile the Applicants will not be directed to forthwith join at the places of their new postings. Further in respect of Applicant who have been formally relieved by handing-over charge or those who stand relieved without handing-over charge but are yet been replaced by incoming 'Police Inspectors'; such Applicants are to be permitted to join back and serve on their earlier posts. However, in cases where incoming 'Police Inspector' have joined in place of the relieved Applicants such Applicants will not be permitted to join back but shall not to be directed to forthwith join at the places of their new postings.

13. S.O. to 09.02.2024.

Sd/-

(Debashish Chak abarty) Member (A)

NMN

Tribunal's orders

O.A. No.92 of 2024

A.G. Vankade

..Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

..Respondents

Heard Shri M.U. Rajput, learned Advocate for the Applicant and Smt. Archana B.K., learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.

- 2. The office objections, if any, are to be removed and court fees to be paid, if not already paid.
- 3. Issue notice before admission returnable on 12.3.2024. The respondents are directed to file reply.
- 4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondents intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of O.A. Private service is allowed. Respondents are put to notice that the case may be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.
- 5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.
- 6. By Hand delivery, speed post, courier notice to be served and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within one week. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.
- 7. In case notice is not collected within **seven days** or service report on affidavit is not filed **three days** before returnable date, the OA shall be placed on board before the concerned Bench under the caption "For Dismissal" and thereafter on the subsequent date the OA shall stand dismissed.

Sd/-(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) 6.2.2024

(sgj)

/R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

ΙŃ

inal Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

O.A.88/2022 (DB-2)

P.D. Kokare Vs. The State of Mah. & Ors. ... Applicant

... Respondents

- 1. Heard Shri R.N. Mandal, learned Advocate i/b Shri P.D. Sharma, learned Advocate for Applicant and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned CPO for Respondents.
- 2. The learned Advocate for Applicant seeks time and accordingly matter is kept on 13.02.2024 along with OA Nos.96/2024 & O.A.107/2024.
- 3. S.O. to 13th February, 2024.

Sd/-

(Debashish Chakrabarty) Member-A 06.02.2024

(skw)

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

ΙN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O.A. No.367 of 2023

N.B. PatilApplicant

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.Respondents.

- 1. Applicant and his Advocate both are absent. Smt. K.S. Gaikwad, learned Presenting Officer present on behalf of the Respondents.
- 2. Learned PO seeks 'One Week' time to file 'Affidavit-in-Reply' on behalf of Respondents. Time of 'One Week' as prayed for is granted to learned PO.
- 4. Learned PO to note that if 'Affidavit-in-Reply' is not filed within 'One Week', then this O.A. No. 367/2023 will be heard further without 'Affidavit-in-Reply' of Respondents.
- 5. S.O. to 13.02.2024.

Sd/-(Debashish Charabarty) Member (A)

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

ΙN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunai's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O.A. No.1464 of 2023 with O.A. No. 1485 of 2023

S.A. Kotkar & Ors.,

D.G. Hiwale

.....Applicant

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

.....Respondents.

- 1. Heard Shri A.V. Bandiwadekar, learned Advocate for the Applicant, Smt. K.S. Gaikwad and Shri A.J. Chougule, learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Learned PO states that all other groups of OAs which relate to 'Inter District Transfer' of 'Police Constable' from the establishment of 'Commissioner of Police, Greater Mumbai' to establishments of other (i)'Commissioners of Police' and (ii)'Superintendent of Police' have kept for further hearing on 13.02.2024.
- 3. Learned Advocate for Applicant thereupon states that 'Interim Relief' be continued which was regarding directions given on 29.11.2023 to 'Commissioner of Police, Chhatrapati Sambhajinagar'.
- 4. 'Interim Relief' to continue till 'Next Date'.
- 5. S.O. to 13.02.2024.

Sd/(Debashish Chakkabarty)
Member (A)

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

ΙN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram. Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O.A. No.90 of 2024

D.T. Bachhav

.....Applicant

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

.....Respondents.

- Heard Shri V.V. Bhosale, learned Advocate for the Applicant holding for Shri M.L. Dhone, learned Advocate for the Applicant and Shri A.J. Chougule, learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- Learned PO seeks 'One Week' time to obtain information from 'Registrar (Administration)' of 'State Commissioner Dispute Redressal **C**ommission, Mumbai' with regard to directions in 'Para 6' of Order dated 21.01.2024.
- S.O. to 16.02.2024.

Sd/-

(Debashish Chakrabarty) Member (A)

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O.A. No.877 of 2023 with O.A. No. 1617 of 2023

P.S. Patil

.....Applicant

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

.....Respondents.

- 1. Heard Shri S.S. Dere & Assoc., learned Advocate for the Applicant and Smt. K.S. Gaikwad, learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents and Shri P.P. Deokar, learned Advocate for the Respondent No. 2.
- 2. Learned Advocate on behalf of 'CEO, Zilla Parishad, Nashik' in O.A. No. 1617/2023 states that he has filed 'Affidavit-in-Reply' on 01.02.2024. It is taken on record.
- 3. Learned PO seeks 'Two Weeks' time to file 'Affidavit-in-Reply' on behalf of Respondent No. 1 in both the O.A. No. 877/2023 and O.A. No. 1617/2023.
- 4. S.O. to 21.02.2024.

Sd/(Debashish Chalkrabarty)

Member (A)

Date: 06.02.2024 Tribunal's orders

O. A. No.102 of 2024

P. B. Nagargoje

....Applicant

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

...Respondents.

- 1. Heard Shri K. R. Jagdale, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Smt. Kranti Gaikwad, learned P.O. for the Respondents.
- 2. The office objection, if any, are to be removed and court fees to be paid, if not already paid.
- 3. Issue notice before admission returnable on 09.02.2024.
- 4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondent intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of M.A. Private service is allowed. Respondents are put to notice that the case may be taken up for fine disposal at the stage of admission hearing.
- 5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 1 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedu ϵ Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.
- 6. By Hand delivery, speed post, courier notice to be served and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within one week. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.
- 7. In case notice is not collected within <u>seven</u> days or service report on affidavit is not filed <u>three</u> days before returnable date, the <u>Original</u> / Miscellaneous Application shall be placed on board before the concerned Benches under the caption "<u>for Dismissal</u>" and thereafter on the subsequent date the <u>Original</u> / Miscellaneous Application shall stand dismissed.
- 8. S.O. to 09.02.2024.

Sd/(Debashish Chakrabarty)
Member (A)

Sd/-(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

vsm

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribum Ps orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O. A. No.48 of 2024

Y. B. Gavade

....Applicant

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

...Respondents.

- 1. Heard Shri S. S. Dere, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Smt. Archana B. K., learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Pursuant to order dated 05.02.2024, today Shri Narayan Karad, Deputy Secretary, Energy Department and Smt. Rohini Bhalekar, Joint Secretary, PWD are present before the Court.
- 3. Smt. Rohini Bhalekar, Joint Secretary, PWD informs that the Applicant was initially working in PWD and the incident happened on 13.04.2011. The Anti-Corruption Bureau (ACB) submitted the proposal for sanction to PWD on 19.06.2012. Thereafter, PWD gave sanction to ACB's proposal. In 2014, PWD informed that they will not withdraw sanction. Smt. Bhalekar, Joint Secretary further informs that the establishment of PWD was split and transferred to Energy Department on 26.02.2015.
- 4. Shri Narayan Karad, Deputy Secretary, Energy Department also informs that the file of Shri Y. B. Gawade was received to Energy Department on 30.07.2015 and on 31.08.2019, the Committee was constituted to review the suspension of Applicant. In Review Committee meeting, a question was asked about Departmental Enquiry and thereafter the decision was taken to initiate D.E. and it was initiated on 19.03.2021. The Deputy Secretary, Energy Department states that Enquiry Officer in DE was appointed on 26.07.2023.
- 5. S.O. to 08.02.2024.

Sd/-(Debashish Chakrabarty) Member (A)

Sd/-(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O. A. No.132 of 2024

S. U. More & Ors.

....Applicants

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors. ...Res

...Respondents.

- 1. Shri L. S. Deshmukh along with Shri M. B. Kadam, learned Counsels for the Applicants and Ms S. P Manchekar, learned C.P.O. for the Respondents.
- 2. The office objection, if any, are to be removed and court fees to be paid, if not already paid.
- 3. Issue notice before admission returnable on 20.02.2024.
- 4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondent intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of M.A. Private service is allowed. Respondents are put to notice that the case may be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.
- 5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.
- 6. By Hand delivery, speed post, courier notice to be served and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within one week. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.
- 7. In case notice is not collected within <u>seven</u> days or service report on affidavit is not filed <u>three</u> days before returnable date, the <u>Original</u> / Miscellaneous Application shall be placed on board before the concerned Benches under the caption "<u>for Dismissal</u>" and thereafter on the subsequent date the <u>Original</u> / Miscellaneous Application shall stand dismissed.
- 8. S.O. to 20.02.2024.
- 9. Learned C.P.O. is directed to take instructions and apprise the court whether selection of Applicants is within the figure of 533 notified posts.

Sd/-(Debashish Chakrabarty) Member (A) Sd/-(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

LN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribumal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

M.A.No.74 of 2024 in O. A. No.132 of 2024

S. U. More & Ors.

....Applicants

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors. ... Respondents.

- 1. Shri L. S. Deshmukh along with Shri M. B. Kadam, learned Counsels for the Applicants and Ms S. P. Manchekar, learned C.P.O. for the Respondents.
- 2. This is an application for leave to sue jointly.
- 3. Considering the cause of action pursued by the Applicants is common, concurrent and usual, the case is not required to be decided separately.
- 4. In this view of the matter, the present Misc. Application is allowed, subject to Applicants paying requisite Court Fees, if not already paid.
- 5. M. A. No.74 /2024 is allowed. No order as to costs.

Sd/-(Debashish Chakrabarty) Member (A)

Sd/-(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

vsm

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O. A. No.157 of 2024

B. S. Jadhav & Ors.

....Applicant

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

...Respondents.

- 1. Heard Shri K. R. Jagdale, learned Counsel for the Applicants and Ms S. P. Manchekar, learned Chic Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. The office objection, if any, are to be removed and court fees to be paid, if not already paid.
- 3. Issue notice before admission returnable on 12.02.2024.
- 4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on Respondent intimation/notice of date of hearing duly, authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of M.A. Private service is allowed. Respondents are put to notice that the case may be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.
- 5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.
- 6. By Hand delivery, speed post, courier notice to be served and acknowledgement be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry within one week. Applicant is directed to file Affidavit of compliance and notice.
- 7. In case notice is not collected within <u>seven</u> days or service report on affidavit is not filed <u>three</u> days before returnable date, the <u>Original</u> / Miscellaneous Application shall be placed on board before the concerned Benches under the caption "<u>for Dismissal</u>" and thereafter on the subsequent date the <u>Original</u> / Miscellaneous Application shall stand dismissed.
- 8. S.O. to 12.02.2024 under the caption of 'Urgent Admission'.

Sd/-(Debashish Chakrabarty) Member (A)

Sd/-(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance. Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O. A. No.57 of 2024

B. G. Kadam

....Applicant

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

...Respondents.

- 1. Heard Smt. Punam Mahajan, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Ms S. P. Manchekar, learned C.P.O. for the Respondents.
- 2. Pursuant to order dated 19.01.2024, learned C.P.O. informed that final report is submitted to Upalokayukta or 04.01.2024 and order thereto is awaited. In view of this, learned CPO seeks time.
- 3. S.O. to 27.02.2024 for 'Interim Relief'.

Sd/-

(Debashish Chakrabarty) Member (A) Sd/-

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

vsm

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

IN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memeranda of Coram, Appearance. Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribusal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O. A. No.105 of 2024

Dr. V. V. Ingle

....Applicant

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

...Respondents.

- 1. Heard Smt. Punam Mahajan, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Ms S. P. Manchekar, learned C P.O. for the Respondents.
- 2. Learned Counsel for the Applicant is directed to remove the objections.
- 3. Learned C.P.O. seeks time to take instructions.
- 4. S.O. to 27.02.2024.

Sd/-

Sd/-

(Debashish Chakrabarty)

Member (A)

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

vsm

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O.A.No.1548/2023

M.A. Ambadekar

....Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.Respondents.

- 1. Heard Mr. Bhushan A. Bandiwadekar, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Pursuant to order dated 19.12.2023 wherein at paragraph 3, Secretary, Social Justice Department was directed to consider the representation submitted by the Applicant on 18.12.2023 in accordance with provisions of Rule Rule 5(4) of the Departmental Examination for being continued the Appointments in the Cadre Posts and/or for Promotion to the Higher Posts in the Department of Social Welfare Rules, 1975.
- 3. Today learned C.P.O. produces the decision dated 23.01.2024 by which prayer of the Applicant that her probation period is to be completed and she be exempted from appearing for the examination and her service is to be regularized, this representation of the Applicant is rejected by the Respondent.
- 4. Copy of letter dated 23.01.2024 is to be taken on record and marked as 'Exhibit-X' for identification. Learned C.P.O. to file affidavit-in-reply to that effect.
- 5. Adjourned to 27.02.2024. Till then the interim protection granted by order dated 19.12.2023 is to be continued.

Sd/

Sd/

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram,		
Appearance, Tribunal's orders or		
directions	and Registrar's orders	

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O.A.No.1179/2023

A.P. Devkate

....Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.Respondents.

- 1. Heard Mr. Bhushan A. Bandiwadekar, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. At the request of learned C.P.O. adjourned to 27.02.2024 for filing reply.

Sd/-

Sd/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

C.A.No.70/2023 in O.A.No.823/2022 with C.A.No.75/2023 in O.A.No.116/2021

A.T. Patil (C.A.70/23 in O.A.823/22) S.S. Bhusare (C.A.75/23 in O.A.116/21)

....Applicants

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.Respondents.

- 1. Heard Mr. Bhushan A. Bandiwadekar, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Ms. K.S. Gaikwad, learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Learned P.O. has submitted that order passed by the Tribunal in O.As is challenged before the Hon'ble High Court and the same is pending.
- 3. Adjourned to 20.02.2024.

Sd/-

Sd/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

C.A.No.80/2023 in O.A.No.729/2019

Dr. S.V. PatilApplicant Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.Respondents.

- 1. Heard Ms. Archana B.K., learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Learned Counsel Mr. V.P. Potbhare for the Applicant was not present when the matter was called out.
- 3. Learned P.O. has submitted that all the Departmental Enquiries against the Applicant are decided by the Respondent.
- 4. We direct the Government to implement the order of the Tribunal dated 15.02.2023.
- 5. Learned P.O. has submitted that the Respondent will require two months to give retiral and other benefits to the Applicant.
- 6. Time granted to learned P.O. by way of last chance to comply with the orders.
- 7. Adjourned to 05.04.2024.

Sd/-(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) Sd/-(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

M.A.No.67/2024 in O.A.No.567/2019

S.P. Aher & Ors.

....Applicants

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.Respondents.

- Heard Mr. M.D. Lonkar, learned Counsel for the Applicants and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Learned Counsel Mr. Lonkar has submitted that the case of the Applicant is squarely covered by the decision of M.A.T. Bench Nagpur in O.A.No.325/2015 with Civil Application No.110/2016
- 3. Learned C.P.O. is directed to consider the same.
- 4. Adjourned to 20.02.2024.

SD/

SD/

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram,		
Appearance, Tribunal's orders or		
directions	and Registrar's orders	

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O.A.No.907/2023

K.N. Sukalwad

....Applicant

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.Respondents.

- 1. Heard Ms. K.S. Gaikwad, learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Mr. R.K. Mandadkar/ Mr. C.K. Bangoji, learned Counsel for the Applicants is absent.
- 3. Adjourned to 05.03.2024.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O.A.No.598/2023

Dr. C.S. LoneApplicant Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.Respondents.

- 1. Heard Mr. C.T. Chandratre, learned Counsel for the Applicants and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 3. Adjourned to 20.02.2024.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O.A.No.1444/2023 with O.A.No.572/2022

T.A. Deshpande (O.A.1444/2023)

A.S. More (O.A.572/2022)ApplicantS

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.Respondents.

- 1. Heard Mr. Bhushan A. Bandiwadekar, learned Counsel for the Applicant in O.A.No.1444/2023, Mr. C.T. Chandratre, learned Counsel for the Applicant in O.A.No.572/2022 and Ms. Archana B.K., learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Registry to take note that these two O.As are to be de-tagged.
- 3. In O.A.No.572/2022 Reply is filed. Admit. Place for Final Hearing on 19.03.2024.

In O.A.No.1444/2023 at the request of learned P.O. adjourned to 13.02.2024 for filing reply.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O.A.No.1317/2023

R.R. KambleApplicant Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.Respondents.

- 1. Heard Ms. Archana B.K., learned Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. Mr. R.M. Kolge, learned Counsel for the Applicant is absent.
- 3. At the request of learned P.O. adjourned to 05.03.2024 for filing reply.

SD/-

SD/-

(Medha Gadgil) Member (A) (Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson

ргk

M.A./R.A./C.A. No.

of 20

ΙN

Original Application No.

of 20

FARAD CONTINUATION SHEET NO.

Office Notes, Office Memoranda of Coram, Appearance, Tribunal's orders or directions and Registrar's orders

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O. A. No.160 of 2024

Dr. S. D. Wagh

....Applicant

Versus

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.

...Respondents.

- 1. Heard Smt. Punam Mahajan, learned Counsel for the Applicant and Ms S. P. Manchekar, learned C.P.O. for the Respondents.
- 2. The Applicant is aggrieved for non-consideration of experience as 'Tutorship' for the post of Assistant Professor Biochemistry, Government Medical College, Satara.
- Applicant holds the degree of 'MD (Biochemistry)' and has experience of working as 'Assistant Professor (Biochemistry). She further submits that Applicant worked as a 'Tutor (Bonded)' from 14.10.2021 to 13.10.2022 and 'Tutor (Contract basis) from 15.10.2022 to 30.11.2022, nearly for 13 months. The MPSC has published the list of eligible candidates for the post of 'Assistant Professor-Biochemistry' on 05.02.2024 in which interview date is mentioned as 07.02.2024.
- 4. Learned Counsel submits that per Advertisement No.254/2023 of MPSC at Sr. No.3 the post and subject for 'Assistant Professor in Biochemistry-' is incorporated. For the said post required educational qualification is M.D. (Biochemistry/MBBS with M.Sc. (Medical Biochemistry)/M.Sc (Medical Biochemistry with Ph.D Medical (Medical Biochemistry)/M.Sc. Medical Biochemistry/ with D.Sc. (Medical Biochemistry)/DNB in mentioned. Learned Counsel submits that for educational qualification there is no dispute. However so far as experience is concerned, it is not accepted by MPSC. 'Experience' required by MPSC for the said post is 'One Year as Senior Resident in the concerned subject in a recognized/permitted medical college after acquiring MD/MS Degree'.

Tribunal's orders

- Learned Counsel for Applicant referred to G.R. 5. dated 06.01.2023 published by Medical Education & Drugs Department which states that MD/MS candidate with 'One Year' experience in that particular subject need not be terms as 'Tutor/Demonstrator/Registrar and can be synonymously terms as 'Senior Resident' consequently 247 were such created from posts 'Tutor/Demonstrator/Registrar' into 'Senior Resident'. Para 2 of G.R. dated 06.01.2023 states that doctors who are working as 'Tutor' in order to obtain one year experience as 'Resident Doctor' they are to be referred as 'Senior Resident' Thus, she submits that nomenclature of 'Tutor' is changed as 'Senior Resident'. She further points out that there are total 247 posts were created from 'Tutor' into 'Senior Residents'.
- 7. However, learned C.P.O. submits that the said G.R. made applicable from January 2023, therefore, it is not to be counted.
- 8. We have gone through the submission of both sides and also the Advertisement and G.R. Prima-facie, we are of the view of that as the State Government has changed the nomenclature from 'Tutor' into 'Senior Resident' the issue whether this G.R. is made applicable to those candidates who had experience 1 year service and 1 year prior to G.R. dated 06.01.2023 and whether they are also covered under this G.R. as there is a mention of 247 posts of 'Tutor'. Further, it also appears that the post of 'Tutor' which were earlier 247 have been abolished and thus prima-facie we are of the view that Applicant's post was amongst those 247 posts
- 9. As the interview for the post of Assistant Professor Biochemistry, Government Medical College, Satara is fixed on 07.02.2024, we allow the Applicant to appear for interview. However, her result shall not to be declared by MPSC and it should be kept in 'Sealed Cover'.

10. S.O. to 20.02.2024.	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Sd/-	Sd/-
(Debashish Chakrabarty)	/ (Mridula Bhatkar, J.)

Tribunal's orders

Date: 06.02.2024

O.A.No.325/2018 with O.A.No.13/2020

A.M. Jadhao (O.A.325/2018) R.S. Pawar (O.A.13/2020)

....Applicants

Vs.

The State of Maharashtra & Ors.Respondents.

- 1. Heard Mr. M.D. Lonkar, learned Counsel for the Applicant in O.A.No.325/2018, Mr. S.S. Dere, learned Counsel for the Applicant in O.A.No.13/2020, Mr. C.T. Chandratre and Mr. D.B. Khaire, learned Counsel for Respondent no.3 and Ms. S.P. Manchekar, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the Respondents.
- 2. While hearing O A.No.13/2020 we came across objection which we had already noted earlier while hearing O.A.No.325/2018 that while Applicant Mr. Jadhao (O.A.325/2018) and Respondent No.3 were facing charges under Prevention of Corruption Act 1988, whether such public servants are eligible to participate in the Selection Process where the appointment is by nomination from the public servants.
- 3. Learned P.O. has submitted that M.P.S.C. needs time as the M.P.S.C. is very busy in time bound matters pending before Hon'ble High Court and seeks adjournment till 20.02.2024 for compliance.
- 4. Time granted to learned P.O. However, O.As are adjourned to 07.02.2021 at 10.15 a.m.

Sd/-

Sd/-

(Medha Gadgil)
Member (A)

(Mridula Bhatkar, J.) Chairperson